Designs for Dissensus:

Political Posters, Africa and the Tricontinental Movement

Evie Hill

Doctor of Philosophy

School of Geography, Politics and Sociology

September 2022

Abstract

This research examines a previously neglected collection of political posters that were published by the *Organización de Solidaridad de los Pueblos de Asia, África y América Latina* (OSPAAAL) between 1967 and 1987 in order to address the question, 'what does the African series of OSPAAAL posters convey about the role of Africa in the Tricontinental Movement and the capacity of these posters to disrupt the sensible of the Cold War?' The Tricontinental Movement was a transnational solidarity movement that recognised imperialism and racial oppression as interlinked. During the Cold War, it played a pivotal role in fostering political radicalism. However, despite its significance and the centrality of Africa and the African diaspora to its political discourse and ideology, no academic research specifically addresses this aspect of the movement.

OSPAAAL was the mouthpiece of the Tricontinental Movement. Based in Havana, the organisation was born out of the decision to include Latin America in the existing Afro-Asian Peoples' Solidarity Organisation. Of all its cultural outputs, its posters are the most iconic and well known. Moreover, they offer a valuable insight into how the Tricontinental community was imagined in the context of the Cold War. They have, however, largely been neglected within academia. This is partly due to their ephemerality, but also because aesthetic approaches remain at the margins of international politics as a discipline. Thus, through an iconographic analysis of the African series of OSPAAAL posters, this research examines the role of Africa in the Tricontinental Movement and explores the political and aesthetic capacity of these posters to disrupt the sensible of the Cold War.

Acknowledgments

I wish to thank my supervisors, Dr Matt Davies, Dr Jorge Catalá-Carrasco and Dr Matt Benwell, for their feedback and counsel throughout the research, and my family and friends for their enduring support. I am also grateful to Lincoln Cushing who kindly sent me the digital images of the OSPAAAL posters.

Contents

Abbreviations

AAPSO - Afro-Asian Peoples' Solidarity Organisation

FNLA - *Frente Nacional de Libertação de Angola*

MPLA - *Movimento Popular de Libertação de Angola*

NAM - Non-Aligned Movement

OSPAAAL - *Organización de Solidaridad de los Pueblos de Asia, África y América Latina*

PAIGC - *Partido Africano da Independência da Guiné e Cabo Verde*

SWAPO - South West Africa People's Organisation

UNITA - *União Nacional para a Independência Total de Angola*

ZANU - Zimbabwe African National Union

ZAPU - Zimbabwe African People's Union

Chapter One: Introduction

In 1967 the *Organización de Solidaridad de los Pueblos de Asia, África y América Latina* (OSPAAAL) began to publish what would become an iconic collection of political posters that spanned the 1960s, 1970s and 1980s. Visually striking, combining bold, bright colours, pop art aesthetics and emotive designs with radical socialist and anti-imperialist solidarity, these posters are as aesthetically fascinating as they are politically thought-provoking. Circulated around the world and distributed to over eighty countries at their peak, they were viewed by a global audience (Cushing, 2003, p. 10); and were part of a visual art campaign 'to promote a particular interpretation of the Cold War as ongoing colonialism, to generate transnational support for national liberation struggles in the Middle East and Africa, as well as to promote the Cuban Revolution itself' (Mor, 2019, p. 43). Published by an outwardly transnational organisation, but one that was based in Havana, Cuba, the posters occupy a space between the national and international. While OSPAAAL and the Tricontinental Movement that it gave rise to were arguably transnational in origin, thought and outlook, the posters were created and designed in Cuba by Cuban artists working within the culture of the Cuban Revolution. Furthermore, they were strongly influenced by the geopolitical and ideological dimensions of the Cold War.

Although the OSPAAAL posters offer a valuable insight into the political discourse and ideology of the Tricontinental Movement, they have largely been neglected within academia. This is partly owing to their ephemerality, but also a preference for the written and spoken word in politics and international relations (IR). As Bleiker (2018, p. 1) writes:

> We still know far too little about the precise role visuality plays in the realm of politics and international relations. And we know even less about the concrete practical implications. […] Although we live in a visual age, knowledge conventions - both in academia and in the wider realm - are still very much focused on texts and textual analysis.

Indeed, this neglect points to an enduring resistance to visual and aesthetic approaches in IR. In marginalising these approaches, the discipline cannot access or address the full register of human experience that informs world politics. It also prescribes how world politics are conceptualised by prioritising a particular 'way of seeing'. As Berger (1972, p. 8) explains, 'the

way we see things is affected by what we know or what we believe'. This research therefore examines this previously neglected collection of political posters in order to explore the political discourse and ideology of the Tricontinental Movement from a new perspective, and the ways in which visual and aesthetic approaches can augment the study of world politics. This chapter begins by asking how the OSPAAAL posters, the Tricontinental Movement, Africa and Jacques Rancière's concept of dissensus link together. It then discusses the two components of the research problem: the critical gap in our understanding of the role of Africa in the Tricontinental Movement and the failure of IR to 'see' the OSPAAAL posters as a political subject. Subsequently, it outlines the research project, findings and organisation of the thesis.

From the OSPAAAL Posters to Dissensus

Formed in 1966, OSPAAAL was born out of the decision to include Latin America in the existing Afro-Asian Peoples' Solidarity Organisation. The purpose of this alliance was to 'outline a programme of joint struggle against imperialism, as well as to fortify, increase and co-ordinate the militant solidarity which should exist between the peoples of the three continents' (International Preparatory Committee of the First Solidarity Conference of the Peoples of Africa, Asia and Latin America and the Cuban National Committee, 1965 cited in Garland Mahler, 2018, p. 72). As Mor (2019, p. 43) notes, '[it] quickly became a conduit of revolutionary ideas'; circulating updates on national liberation struggles, and calls to action and solidarity through its monthly newsletter and bi-monthly magazine. Distributed to eighty-seven countries at the peak of production, the latter published articles on subjects such as foreign policy, international politics and revolutionary literature (Cushing, 2003, p. 10). For example, 'subscribers would find articles on North Vietnamese resistance to US imperialism, vignettes on class struggle in India, and support for Palestinian and Syrian confrontations against Israel' (Gronbeck-Tedesco, 2015, pp. 211-212). Folded inside, in many issues, was a poster. Designed with minimal text and printed in Spanish, English, French and Arabic, they would have been intelligible to a large proportion of their audience irrespective of language or literacy. In all, OSPAAAL published hundreds of posters that referenced a wide range of

political subjects: such as the South African occupation of Namibia, fig. 1[1]; the war in Vietnam, fig. 2; the anniversary of Hiroshima, fig. 3; and the imprisonment of Nelson Mandela, fig. 4.

These posters were created amid a nationwide cultural movement that emerged in the years immediately following the Cuban Revolution and generated a plethora of graphic art and design (Luis, 2001, pp. 161-162). The decade in Cuban art from approximately 1964 to 1974 has been described as 'the golden age of the poster' (Craven, 1992, pp. 79-80; 2002, pp. 94-95). Certainly, as Craven (2002, p. 95) notes, 'such a designation is appropriate in light of the international acclaim garnered by Cuban posters'. They were also embraced by the new revolutionary government as a means to publicise a wide range of subjects from films, culture and education to national pride, sports and the tobacco and sugar harvests (Cushing, 2003). However, while this epithet captures the sheer scale and renown of the Cuban poster tradition, it does not convey the extent to which it was part of a transnational network of artistic and political influences. From the Black Panther Party and Chicano Movement in the United States to the war in Vietnam, the independence movement in Puerto Rico, the Sandinistas in Nicaragua, Juan Velasco Alvarado's government in Peru and the Popular Unity government in Chile, the political radicalism, social unrest and proxy wars of the 1960-1980s were promoted and contested alike through poster art (Bénaud, 2002; Cant, 2012; Corrigan, 2014; Davidson, 2006; Eckmann, 2006; Romo, 2006; Wells *et al.*, 1996). Despite the embargo imposed on the island, Cuba's isolation proved to be more complete in an economic than cultural sphere (Kunzle, 1975, p. 89). Indeed, cultural organisations in Cuba regularly pursued international exchanges and visits with poster artists from overseas (Cushing, 2003, pp. 17-18; Randall, 2017, pp. 27-28). Even when the artists themselves could not travel, their art appeared in exhibitions around the world (Kunzle, 1975, p. 92; Randall, 2017, p. 31; Romo, 2006, pp. 53-54). Hence, the Cuban poster tradition and OSPAAAL posters were embedded in a network of transnational artistic and political movements. Central among these, was the Tricontinental Movement.

The Tricontinental Movement emerged in the 1960s following the Tricontinental Conference in Havana, Cuba in January 1966. This conference marked a new moment in the orientation

[1] See *Image Appendix*. As this thesis makes reference to 114 images, they have been included in a separate folder to facilitate viewing alongside this document.

of the international politics of the Cold War and the point at which Latin America was formally recognised as part of the previously named Afro-Asian Peoples' Solidarity Organisation - thereafter the Organisation in Solidarity with the Peoples of Asia, Africa and Latin America (Young, 2018, p. 217). OSPAAAL was thus the mouthpiece of the Tricontinental Movement and responsible for its official cultural production. However, as detailed in chapter four, the conference and movement represented more than simply the addition of Latin America to the Afro-Asian Peoples' Solidarity Organisation. They were the product of various currents in oppositional political thought that came together in the context of the Cold War. These included decolonisation and liberation struggles, pan-Africanism, and the Cuban Revolution, among many others. As Young (2005, p. 19) writes:

> The Tricontinental brought together the anticolonial struggles of Africa and Asia with the radical movements of Latin America, and marked the initiation of a global alliance of the three continents of Africa, Asia and Latin America against imperialism. This conjunction was mediated at that time by the worldwide fight against imperialism represented by the American intervention in Vietnam, where an anti-colonial liberation struggle against the French had itself been superseded by and merged into an anti-imperial war against the US. […] The Tricontinental positioned itself firmly against those forces in the world that sought to impose forms of domination and exploitation on the poorer peoples of the earth.

Focusing specifically on anti-black racism and the African diaspora, the Tricontinental Movement recognised imperialism and racial oppression as interlinked and sought to oppose them as part of a worldwide revolution. Although its inception was rooted in the struggles of the people of Africa, Asia and Latin America, it quickly became a global solidarity movement whose activities and influence extended beyond the three continents (Garland Mahler, 2018).

Africa, its people and the African diaspora played a key role in the Tricontinental Movement - not only in terms of geopolitics, but also with regard to political discourse and ideology. In the first instance, Africa was one of the three continents that was foundational to OSPAAAL and the Tricontinental Movement. It was also central to the concept of the Third World as a political project, which in turn informed the movement's political discourse and ideology. More specific to Africa, however, was its experiences of colonialism and postcolonialism. As Gleijeses (2002, p. 5) writes:

> In 1945 virtually all Africa was divided among the Europeans […]. Fifteen years later, however, colonial rule was in ruins. The transformation had come without widespread violence, with the major exception of Algeria, and it had come suddenly. In 1957 the first sub-Saharan country, Ghana, gained its independence and became the voice of African nationalism. The following year Charles de Gaulle, who had returned to power in a France fractured by the Algerian war, offered independence to the French possessions in sub-Saharan Africa. They grabbed it. In 1960, the Year of Africa, sixteen European colonies - French, British, and Belgian - became independent.

The Portuguese Empire was to follow. Inspired by the national liberation movements sweeping across Africa, armed resistance to colonial rule began in Angola in 1961, Guinea-Bissau in 1963 and Mozambique in 1964 (Gott, 2004, p. 220). These experiences informed the strong current of postcolonial thought within the Tricontinental Movement.

Race was also a key component of how the Tricontinental Movement conceptualised its fight against imperialism. Crucially, it saw racial oppression and imperialism as interlinked. Although the movement encompassed many different nationalities and ethnicities, the African diaspora, anti-black racism, opposition to apartheid South Africa, the history and past injustice of the transatlantic slave trade, the subsequent inequality and oppression faced by black peoples in the Americas, and the Jim Crow laws of the United States were at the heart of its politics.

Furthermore, Africa was, of course, an active region of conflict during the Cold War and an important site of resistance to imperialism for the Tricontinental Movement. Christiansen and Scarlett (2013a, pp. 3-5), for example, note the significance of the Algerian and the Ghanaian struggles for independence and the Rhodesian and the South African struggles against white minority rule for the Third World in the 1960s. Against the geopolitical and ideological backdrop of the Cold War, the wave of decolonisation movements in Africa also presented a key opportunity for the Tricontinental Movement to forge a third way between Western capitalism and Soviet communism.

Although Africa and its people were not directly involved in the production of the OSPAAAL posters, which were created by Cuban artists in Havana, there was still an exchange of ideas between Africa and Cuba that undoubtedly contributed to the political discourse of the

posters. For example, Cuba's military interventions in Africa relied on tens of thousands of volunteers posted for months or occasionally years at a time alongside their African counterparts in national liberation movements before returning home (Gleijeses, 2002; 2013). However, as Argyriadis *et al*. (2020, p. 3) note, the Cuban-African encounter is not only a history of military interventions, but 'also the story of tens of thousands of individuals who crossed the Atlantic, from one side to the other, as doctors, scientists, soldiers, students, religious leaders or artists […], the story of their trajectories, and of those they came into contact with, whether the Cubans who departed for Africa or the Africans who travelled to Cuba - in short, the history of the circulation of people, ideas and representations'. Indeed, Cuba's world-famous medical internationalism has seen thousands of African students study medicine in Cuba (Huish and Kirk, 2007). Thus, through transnational interactions, the people of Africa played an indirect part in the OSPAAAL posters.

The African series of OSPAAAL posters sits at this intersection of art and politics. Despite the aesthetic turn in international political theory, scholars are only beginning to unpack the value of aesthetic approaches in the study of world politics (Bleiker, 2001). In this regard, Jacques Rancière's work on politics and aesthetics as dissensus is especially useful as it offers a means to think through the capacity of art and politics to effect changes to our perceived reality. For Rancière (2010, p. 139), 'dissensus is a conflict between a sensory presentation and a way of making sense of it'; it is, in a way, an alteration to the rules governing normal experience (Corcoran, 2010, p. 1). Art and politics are both capable of dissensus, albeit through different mechanisms, which are discussed further in the theoretical framework and explored in chapters six and seven. This research therefore uses the concept of dissensus to examine the politics and aesthetics of the African series of OSPAAAL posters.

Africa and the Tricontinental Movement

Firstly, this research addresses a critical gap in our understanding of the role of Africa in the Tricontinental Movement thereby illuminating an important part of Cold War history. As Curley (2018, p. 8) notes, 'the Cold War is the central story of the second half of the twentieth century - essential for explaining what happened around the world and why'. Its legacy also continues to influence contemporary politics, most recently in connection with Russia's invasion of Ukraine (Mälksoo, 2022). One of the most popular metaphors used to describe the

Cold War is Winston Churchill's 'Iron Curtain', cited in a speech by Churchill in 1946 (White, 2012). Curley (2018, p. 7) writes:

> Churchill's Iron Curtain provided a vivid image of a fiercely divided Europe after World War II. To the east, in countries like Hungary, Poland, Czechoslovakia, and what was soon to become East Germany, the Soviets imposed communist rule. And in the Western half of Europe, the nations of France, Great Britain, Italy, and the future West Germany aligned themselves with the United States and at least the basics of its capitalist economic system. For more than 40 years, Churchill's provocative image defined the Cold War's binary logic, even encompassing the world beyond Europe.

Although the reality was far more complex, this 'binary logic' had far-reaching ramifications. From international politics to the everyday, the sensory presentation and perception of 'normal experience' was organised via this bi-polar conflict between 'East' and 'West', communism and capitalism.

However, many scholars have cautioned against reading this period of history as 'the Cold War', noting that it was not 'cold' for the millions who died in proxy wars around the world. The dominant narrative also obscures that the conflict extended beyond the United States, Europe and the Soviet Union to Africa, Asia and Latin America, and creates a centre-periphery hierarchy. Stepping away from this narrative makes space for the 'periphery'. For example, writing regarding the global activism, political radicalism and social unrest associated with the 1960s, Christiansen and Scarlett (2013a) argue that the Third World was very much part of the First World and vice versa - an argument echoed by Halliday (1999, pp. 198-199) and Marchesi (2017, p. 5), among others. Dirlik (2013, p. viii) remarks that 'it is probably futile, and unnecessary politically, to ask whether it was the urban revolt in the First World that inspired the Third, or the anti-colonial struggles of the Third that inspired the First, as a ready, and empirically verifiable, dialectical interplay of the various movements is quite apparent throughout the 1960s (if not earlier) and into the early 1970s'. However, despite calls for further research, there is still a notable lack of scholarship on the Global South and South-South relations during the Cold War.

Akin to Christiansen and Scarlett (2013a, p. 3), I use the term Third World knowing the controversy surrounding its implied global hierarchy and that it has become outdated since

the end of the Cold War. This is because dispensing with it would render invisible an important part of the political history of the Tricontinental Movement and the Cold War. Young (2006, p. 2) states, 'first coined by the French demographer Alfred Sauvy in 1952, Sauvy derived *Third World* from *Third Estate*, the French revolutionary-era term used to describe those at the bottom of the social hierarchy'. However, as Christiansen and Scarlett (2013a, p. 3) explain:

> Despite its Western origins […] the idea of the Third World was realized in political practice with the formation of loosely based political, cultural, and social groupings articulated at the 1955 Bandung Conference. It was at Bandung that leaders from countries throughout the Third World recognized the importance of non-alignment and pledged to remain neutral in the Cold War.

Similarly, for Prashad (2008, p. xv), the Third World was not a place but a political project; a set of institutions and an ideology articulated at the Bandung Conference in 1955 and the Tricontinental Conference in 1966. Indeed, the concept of the Third World was central to the Tricontinental Movement (Field *et al.*, 2020, p. 6; Prashad, 2008; Sajed, 2020).

From the outset, the Tricontinental Movement played a key role in shaping the political landscape of the Cold War. Following the Tricontinental Conference in 1966, there was a flurry of guerrilla activity from liberation movements around the world but particularly in Africa and Latin America. As Barcia (2009, p. 213) summarises:

> In Africa, first Guinea Bissau, then Angola, Mozambique, and Zimbabwe all gained their independence by resorting to the use of guerrilla warfare tactics. In Latin America guerrillas expanded as never before. […] In Colombia, Peru, Uruguay, Venezuela, and El Salvador rural and urban guerrilla warfare became national dilemmas.

The Tricontinental Movement also played a pivotal role in generating international solidarity with the Anti-Apartheid Movement in South Africa and the Civil Rights Movement in the United States (Barcia, 2009, p. 212; Garland Mahler, 2018, p. 3). Furthermore, its influence can be traced in contemporary radical texts, such as Third Cinema, Cuban revolutionary film, the Nuyorican movement, and writings by Black Power and Puerto Rican Young Lords activists (Garland Mahler, 2018, p. 3).

Beyond the Cold War, the Tricontinental Movement had a lasting impact on the future trajectories of many Third World countries and present-day social and political movements.

Angola, Namibia, Mozambique, Guinea Bissau and Zimbabwe, for example, attained their independence as a direct result of the international cooperation among the Tricontinental (Barcia, 2009, p. 214); while the Anti-Apartheid Movement and Civil Rights Movement had far reaching effects with regard to shaping the social movements and international politics of today. Garland Mahler (2018, pp. 2-3) observes that we are seeing a new era of solidarity politics in the Americas that at least partially revives the discourse of the Tricontinental Movement, touching on Black Lives Matter and the World Social Forum. Also of note are Black Palestinian Solidarity, Rhodes Must Fall, Occupy, and the Arab Spring (Eslava *et al*., 2017, pp. 31-32). It has also been linked to the formation of postcolonial thought, which developed during the Cold War (Young, 2005). However, despite its historical and contemporary significance, the Tricontinental Movement has mostly been forgotten.

While the Tricontinental Movement has largely been neglected within academia, Anne Garland Mahler's work is a notable exception. Garland Mahler (2018) traces the political discourse and ideology of the movement through a number of Tricontinentalist texts - described as 'any cultural product that engages explicitly with the aesthetics and especially the discourse of Tricontinentalism' - focusing on the part of African Americans (Garland Mahler, 2018, p. 3). She argues that the Tricontinental Movement framed its fight against imperialism through a focus on the racial politics of the Jim Crow South in the United States[2]. In her words, 'Tricontinentalism portrayed the U.S. South as a microcosm of a deterritorialized empire and presented its global vision of power and resistance through the Jim Crow binary of white and color' (Garland Mahler, 2018, p. 4). Furthermore, this binary was not intended to be racially deterministic - in the sense that white people in solidarity with the movement could be described as 'coloured' and coloured people against the movement could be described as 'white'. Hence, 'Stokely Carmichael's quip that Fidel Castro was "one of the blackest men in America" and Robert F. Williams's remark that Castro was a "colored ruler"' (Gronbeck-Tedesco, 2015, p. 231).

However, notwithstanding the value of Garland Mahler's work, she apportions relatively little attention to the official cultural production of the Tricontinental Movement and her focus on

[2] The 'Jim Crow South' refers to a set of laws imposing racial segregation in the Southern United States and the accompanying regime of black racism and white supremacy.

the Jim Crow South in the United States means that she does not address the role of Africa in the movement. This feels like an oversight given the strong links between Africa, the African diaspora and the specific focus on anti-black racism that underpinned the movement's political discourse and ideology - in particular, its conceptualisation of imperialism and racial oppression as interlinked on a global scale. Garland Mahler (2018, p. 16) also writes that there was a shift in the late 1970s, 'from a focus on the U.S. South […] toward a focus on apartheid South Africa'. Thus, the Jim Crow South in the United States is only part of the picture. Despite the key role of African liberation struggles, the African diaspora and anti-black racism in the movement's discourse, activities and legacy, the role of Africa in the Tricontinental Movement has yet to be the subject of any academic research. There is therefore a critical gap in the literature on this important area of Tricontinental and Cold War history, which this research seeks to address.

Seeing the OSPAAAL Posters as a Political Subject

As noted, the OSPAAAL posters have largely been neglected within academia and certainly overlooked in the study of the international politics of the Cold War. This reflects the failure of IR to 'see' the OSPAAAL posters as a political subject. To elucidate, the problem is fundamentally about what we do not - or cannot - see through traditional practices in the discipline. Ontologically, IR constructs its objects in ways that do not allow it to recognise the OSPAAAL posters as politics. Indeed, as a discipline, IR prioritises certain approaches and ways of seeing that work to define what politics is, what is considered an object of politics, and how world politics is conceptualised. For example, though R.B.J. Walker published *Inside/outside* in 1993, the discipline continues to reproduce this binary. As Callahan (2020, p. 215) writes:

> Inside/outside is the guiding distinction for IR: it marks the division between domestic politics and international politics that is not only territorial but also social. "Inside" denotes safety, law, and sovereignty, while "outside" marks danger, violence, and anarchy.

In particular, the national/international binary of IR obscures the politics of the OSPAAAL posters as the posters, OSPAAAL and the Tricontinental Movement were not national or international but rather a mix of national, international and transnational. IR is also typically state-centric and assumes a nested hierarchy of individual-state-system. The relevant actors

are therefore states or cognates of the state. However, this obscures the transnational dimensions of the Tricontinental Movement, its emphasis on people-to-people solidarity and its wider fight against imperialism. Lastly, the OSPAAAL posters demonstrate politics by means of soft power and aesthetics in contrast to IR's focus on hard power and anarchy as the organising principals of the international system. This, perhaps, explains why the Tricontinental Movement has been neglected within the discipline despite its clear resonance with present-day social and political movements. Indeed, Acharya (2016) points to the failure of IR to address the significance and legacies of the Bandung Conference, a key precursor to the Tricontinental Movement. The OSPAAAL posters therefore demonstrate ways of doing politics that IR might otherwise foreclose.

Of course, in the past few decades the ontological biases in the discipline have shifted to recognise the relevance of visual and aesthetic approaches in the study of world politics. For example, there is now a significant body of research doing visual analysis in IR - see Bleiker's (2018) edited volume on *Visual Global Politics*, Grayson and Mawdsley's (2019) work on drones and scopic regimes, Campbell's (2007) work on documentary photography and photojournalism in the Darfur conflict, and Ingram's (2016; 2019) work on British artists' responses to the Iraq war. This paralells the rise of popular culture studies in IR, reflecting a willingness to incorporate non-conventional objects of study - such as the OSPAAAL posters. However, as Harman (2019, p. 10) notes, there is a difference between recognition and acceptance; a difference that is marked by whether the research has to address the question, 'is this IR?' Along with many others, I argue that visual and aesthetic approaches to the study of world politics are key to unlocking new ways of seeing in IR that would render the Tricontinental Movement and its cultural outputs 'visible'. Interdisciplinary research is central to this endeavour. As IR does not 'see' the OSPAAAL posters, drawing on other disciplines - namely popular geopolitics, cultural studies, visual studies, history and art history - enables this research to make politics that were previously invisible, visible. The following paragraphs therefore explain how debates on art and politics, the visual turn, the aesthetic turn, and research on political posters form an interdsiciplinary response to the failure of IR to see the OSPAAAL posters.

Art and Politics

Art and politics are at the same time diametrically opposed and inextricably entangled. Armando Hart Dávalos, the Cuban Minister of Culture, once stated:

> To confuse art and politics is a political mistake. To separate art and politics is another mistake. (cited in Craven, 1992, p. 91)

Indeed, art is central to politics. Sartwell (2010, p. 1) notes that 'regimes of all sorts - democratic, monarchical, communist, and all the rest - use and repress the arts in various ways for propagandistic purposes, to control or deflect public opinion; and much of what we take as fine art has explicitly political themes'. Curley (2013, p. 21), for example, describes an incident during the Cold War in which an abstract painting - *La Combe III* by the American artist Ellsworth Kelly, fig. 5 - was interpreted as a threat to the national security of the United States; while Cushing (2003, p. 8) relates a story from his own family in which the name of an artwork alone carried political significance.

> In 1955 an abstract painting with the innocuous title *Piece #2* by Luis Martínez-Pedro won top honors at a national art exhibition in Havana. After a wealthy New York collector purchased it, it was reproduced as silk-screen multiples as a fund-raiser for Fidel Castro's revolutionary forces. Its newly revealed underground title? *Two Rifles*.

Furthermore, art, revolution and resistance have a complex history. As Sontag (1999, p. 208) writes:

> It is natural for the artist - who is, so often, a critic of his society - to think when caught up in a revolutionary movement in his own country, that what he considers revolutionary in art is akin to the political revolution going on, and to believe that he can put his art at the service of the revolution. But so far there exists, at best, an uneasy union between revolutionary ideas in art and revolutionary ideas in politics.

Nevertheless, there are numerous examples of art as oppositional politics - see, for example, Davidson *et al.* (2006), Young (2006) and Young (2016).

Jacques Rancière's and Roland Bleiker's approaches to art and politics are discussed in chapter two. However, it is worth noting here that for Bleiker art matters to politics because it acknowledges and works with the gap between reality and representation.

> Art plays such a powerful role precisely because it neither tries to visually represent the world as it is nor rely on familiar visual patterns. The very power of art lies in stimulating our imagination by creating a distance between itself and the world. The political significance of art is located in its self-conscious engagement with representation - an issue that is ignored by most approaches to politics. (Bleiker, 2018, p. 23)

For Rancière (2009a, p. 3), art and politics are two parts of the sensible.

> The relationship between art and politics is a relationship between two communities of sense. This means that art and politics are not two permanent realities about which we would have to discuss whether they must be interconnected or not. Art and politics, in fact, are contingent configurations of the common.

Thus, at any given time, art and politics are linked together as part of the sensory presentation of normal experience. For example, the OSPAAAL posters - an iconic example of poster art - formed part of the political landscape of the Cold War.

The Visual Turn

Writing in 1997 on the growing role of the media in global communications and international politics, Taylor (p. 4) noted that 'the Cold War, for example, looks very different when viewed through the films emanating from Hollywood and Peking […] than it does from the diplomatic papers of the State Department and the Kremlin'. Taylor was among a number of scholars beginning to call for an increased attention to images in the study of world politics. In the two plus decades since, there has been a significant rise in the interest in images and the visual dimensions of IR - such that Callahan noted 'the visual turn in IR' in 2015. This interest is linked to the increased prominence of the visual in social science research, which has been described variously as the visual or pictorial turn (see Jay, 2002; and Mitchell, 1994).

The visual turn has seen the inclusion of a much greater range of visual materials in the study of world politics. Although texts and textual analysis still dominate (Bleiker, 2018, p. 1; Mannay, 2016, p. 1), visual materials - such as flags (Benwell *et al.*, 2021), protest stickers (Awcock, 2021) and of course political posters - are now conceptualised as important sites of politics. The visual turn has not only brought visual materials into the field of IR, but also challenged the way we think about images. For example, in 2001 Burke published

Eyewitnessing, which argued for the use of images as historical evidence as opposed to simply illustrations (pp. 9-10). In 2018, Bleiker's *Visual Global Politics* probed what happens when we treat images not just as representations but 'as political forces themselves' (p. 1). This highlights how much conceptual approaches to images and visual research have changed in the past few decades - from images as illustrations to images as political subjects.

However, a lot of the visual research in IR still focuses on the inside/outside binary as a site of identity, security and exclusion (Callahan, 2020, p. 2); thus, the politics of the OSPAAAL posters remain 'unseen'. Furthermore, while a large number of scholars have called for an increased engagement with images following the visual turn in IR, many cite the rising prominence of the visual in our present post-literate age as the logic. Bleiker (2018, p. 5), for example, argues that though images are not new, the present speed of circulation and democratisation of access and power to distribute images has fundamentally changed world politics. Similarly, Callahan (2020, p. 1) argues that part of the reason the visual is so important in international politics is because our perception of the world is increasingly mediated through visual media - noting the impact of the photograph of Alan Kurdi, the dead toddler who was found lying on a beach in Turkey during Europe's migration crisis in 2015. However, while I acknowledge that we live in an increasingly visual world, I contend that images have long been of importance and significance in international politics. Hence, it is not only in contemporary areas of research that IR needs new visual ways of seeing, but also in research on the past, such as the Cold War.

The Aesthetic Turn

'Aesthetics' has a number of meanings but it is broadly associated with the nature and appreciation of beauty. Sartwell (2010, p. 4), however, explicates that:

> First of all, aesthetics is a subdiscipline of philosophy that is concerned […] with four main questions (as well as many ancillary ones): the nature of art; aesthetic values, especially beauty and sublimity; standards of taste and aesthetic assessment; and mimesis or representation. All of [which] are importantly related to political matters.

The aesthetic turn is similarly concerned with these four questions, but of particular note with regard to this research are questions of the sublime, representation and the emotive nature

of the visual. These are discussed further in chapter two, along with Jacques Rancière's work on the politics of aesthetics. Although, akin to the visual turn, the aesthetic turn extended across the social sciences, IR as a discipline was slow to embrace it and somewhat resistant. Despite an increasing engagement with aesthetics, it is still marginalised within the discipline, conceptualised as separate from politics. However, aesthetics is central to the study of world politics. For example, writing regarding the sublime, Bleiker (2009, p. 67) notes:

> Few political spheres generate more fear and awe than the international. This is not only the case with key events, such as wars or terrorists attacks, but also applies to the very nature of global politics. Consider how conventional realist approaches to foreign policy, which revolve around nation-states seeking to maximise security, are in many ways political attempts to master and manipulate the awe-inspiring fear of the international and the conflicts it engenders.

In addition, it is important to note that the visual and aesthetic turns cannot be separated into discrete debates or areas of research in IR; rather, they overlap and inform one another. Callahan (2020, p. 1), for example, argues that 'visuals can viscerally move us in unexpected ways, […] that they need to be appreciated not just in terms of their ideological-value, but also in terms of their affect-work: not just what they mean, but also how they make us feel'. Similarly, Bleiker (2018, p. 9) notes that 'part of what makes images unique is that they often evoke, appeal to and generate emotions'.

Political Poster Research

Research on political posters brings together the aforementioned debates and conceptual turns in IR. Indeed, political posters are central to politics. As Tschabrun (2003, p. 303) notes, 'as byproducts of the major social and political movements of the twentieth century, political posters testify to the attitudes and thought patterns of several generations of political actors - from reformers and militant activists to government propagandists'. They also blur traditional distinctions between art and politics, are visual by their very nature, and designed to be emotive. Sontag (1999, p. 196), for example, writes that unlike a public notice, 'a poster aims to seduce, to exhort, to sell, to educate, to convince, to appeal […], a poster reaches out to grab those who might otherwise pass it by […], a poster claims attention - at a distance, it is visually aggressive'. Similarly, Tschabrun (2003, p. 303) describes them as 'brash and

aggressive, raw and yet often poignant, political posters urge, instruct, encourage, and exhort'.

However, despite the clear overlap between politics and political posters, IR as a discipline has been slow to contribute to this body of research. This reflects the way in which IR ontologically constructs 'politics' and the marginalisation of art, and visual and aesthetic approaches within the discipline - it does not 'see' political posters as subjects of politics. Instead, the majority of the research on political posters is located in cultural studies, communication studies and art history. The OSPAAAL posters exemplify this lacuna and call attention to what IR does not 'see'. Namely, transnational, artistic and aesthetic relations of solidarity between peoples as part of a global fight against imperialism. Thus, this previosuly neglected collection of political posters sheds light on an important area of Cold War history and new ways of thinking about politics and the political in IR.

Here, it is necessary to delineate political posters and propaganda - particularly as the former is often described as the latter. Political posters are seldom explicitly defined. Indeed, the designation appears straightforward and self-explanatory. Broadly speaking, it refers to any posters that are associated with politics - though this, of course, specifies a particular 'way of seeing'. Definitions of propaganda vary considerably. For example, for Taylor (2003, p. 6), propaganda is 'the *deliberate* attempt to persuade people to think and behave *in a desired way*'; while Belmonte (2013, p. 7) adopts Laurie's (1996) definition, 'any organized attempt by an individual, group, or government verbally, visually, or symbolically to persuade a population to adopt its views and repudiate the views of an opposing group'. Similarly, for Jowett and O'Donnell (2018, p. 6), *'propaganda is the deliberate, systematic attempt to shape perceptions, manipulate cognitions, and direct behavior to achieve a response that furthers the desired intent of the propagandist'*. However, for Moore (2010, p. 7), approaching propaganda from a design, paint and printmaking background, it is 'art in the service of social and political change'; and for Dittmer and Bos (2019, p. xviii), concerned with popular culture and geopolitics:

> Propaganda refers to the intentional use of the media to generate public sentiments that benefit the propagandist. However, it is most often used to designate *other* people's attempts to do this, as a way of invalidating the message of the mediated culture.

Evidently, while there are some common threads, definitions of propaganda vary with respect to context - as does the propaganda itself. Some are broad and non-specific, encompassing examples of propaganda from Ancient Greece to contemporary advertising, while others speak to niche areas of interest and research.

Moreover, propaganda is a value-laden and therefore potentially problematic description. As Crispin Miller (2005), Jowett and O'Donnell (2018), Moore (2010, pp. 7-8) and Taylor (2003) explain, the word has long since lost its original neutrality. Instead, it is pejorative and associated with bias and dishonesty. Jowett and O'Donnell (2018, p. 2), for example, note that 'words frequently used as synonyms for *propaganda* are *lies*, *distortion*, *deceit*, *manipulation*, *mind control*, *psychological warfare*, *brainwashing*, *palaver* and *fake news*'; while Taylor (2003, p. 1) writes:

> The word "propaganda" continues to imply something evil. […] Propaganda, it is felt, forces us to think and do things in ways we might not otherwise have done had we been left to our own devices. […] It is a "dirty trick" utilized by "hidden persuaders", "mind manipulators" and "brainwashers" - Orwellian "Big Brothers" who somehow subliminally control our thoughts in order to control our behaviour to serve *their* interests rather than our own.

Consequently, describing political posters as propaganda attaches a set of preconceived and largely negative connotations. Furthermore, it has the potential to limit our understanding of them as political and aesthetic subjects. For example, regarding Latin American posters, Craven (2006, p. 16) argues:

> Aesthetically compelling and critically engaging, these posters are simultaneously individual in their appeal yet publicly orientated in their messages. Largely devoid of privatized instrumental thinking, they appeal to us to think in a more self-critical mode about the social consequences of our actions. It is for this reason that these posters, however partisan they might be in their appeal, are not examples of political propaganda. The one-dimensional aim of propaganda is not to stimulate thinking but simply to generate a reflexive behaviour on behalf of some immediate gain. In contrast, these posters are multidimensional in their aims, which endows them with a visual complexity normally associated with "high art".

Indeed, conceptualising political posters solely as propaganda risks limiting our interpretation of their meaning, affect and effects.

The OSPAAAL posters are similarly much more than simply propaganda - as demonstrated throughout this thesis, but in particular in chapter seven. They are thought-provoking, complex, open to multiple interpretations and remarkably non-prescriptive. However, at the same time, the posters *are* propaganda. They represent a deliberate attempt to shape perceptions in a way that aligned with the political discourse and ideology of the Tricontinental Movement. While several scholars have sought to reclaim the neutrality of the word 'propaganda' (see Maasri, 2009; Stanley, 2015, pp. 40-41; and Taylor, 2003, p. 8), I opt to use the more neutral and inclusive term 'political poster' with regard to the OSPAAAL posters.

The Research Project

The critical gap in the literature regarding the role of Africa in the Tricontinental Movement is in part a product of the failure of IR to 'see' OSPAAAL and its cultural outputs as political subjects. This research therefore examines the African series of OSPAAAL posters in order to attend to how Africa was imagined as part of the Tricontinental community, political discourse and ideology; and, by using poster art, and a visual and aesthetic approach, begin to probe what IR does not 'see' in the OSPAAAL posters. In doing so, it considers the political and aesthetic capacity of the posters to disrupt the sensible of the Cold War and reflects on how the analysis illuminates alternative ways of 'seeing' world politics in IR. The research questions are as follows:

What does the African series of OSPAAAL posters convey about the role of Africa in the Tricontinental Movement and the capacity of these posters to disrupt the sensible of the Cold War?

- How does the analysis of the African series of OSPAAAL posters elucidate the role of Africa in the Tricontinental imaginary?
- Did the African series of OSPAAAL posters generate political and/or aesthetic dissensus? And if so, how?

- What are the (inter)disciplinary implications of this analysis for the study of world politics?

The first of the secondary research questions focuses on the images themselves; that is, their content, composition, visual effects and possible meanings. By 'the Tricontinental imaginary', I refer to the way in which the Tricontinental community and its politics were represented and imagined as part of the international - a discussion of this term is included in chapter two. The second question considers what the posters could 'do', as opposed to what they could 'mean', and how this acted on the sensible of the Cold War in terms of politics and aesthetics. The third question reflects on why we need alternative ways of 'seeing' world politics, such as through the inclusion of art, and visual and aesthetic approaches in IR.

With regard to the theoretical framework, discussed further in chapter two - the African series of OSPAAAL posters is as much aesthetic as political. The emotive nature of the posters, for example, cannot be separated from their politics, nor their designation as art from the political climate in which they were produced. Thus, it is necessary that aesthetics and politics are at the centre of this research approach. This project therefore engages with the work of Jacques Rancière, Roland Bleiker and Michael J. Shapiro, three of the foremost contemporary theorists addressing politics and aesthetics.

For Rancière, politics and aesthetics are part of any given distribution of the sensible - by 'the sensible' he refers to the known world and the systems that govern what is visible and possible (Rancière, 2004). Of particular note are Rancière's writings on the aesthetics of politics and the politics of aesthetics. Through the former, he explores the means by which politics can effect a break in the sensible; and through the latter, the political capacities of the arts. Importantly, both are expressions of dissensus, the process of disrupting and effecting a redistribution of the sensible (Rancière, 2010). This is significant because it enables us to think about the African series of OSPAAAL posters in terms of what their political and aesthetic capacities can 'do'.

Rancière's notion of dissensus shares similarities with Bleiker's and Shapiro's notions of the sublime. Typified by ambivalent and conflicting emotions, the sublime is associated with excitement and astonishment, but also awe and respect, and even pain and terror (Bleiker, 2009, p. 70). Shapiro (2018, p. 1) describes it as an experience where 'one's mind is in disarray',

as the previously invisible and/or impossible becomes both visible and possible. This disruption to our perception of the world is the sublime element in politics, as it interrupts our ways of sensing and making sense of the world (Dikeç, 2015, p. 107). However, unlike dissensus, the sublime is articulated through reference to emotions, opening a space to address the emotive nature of the African series of posters. This offers an alternative way of thinking about dissensus and a further perspective on how the politics and aesthetics of the posters intervened in the sensible of the Cold War.

Regarding the method, discussed further in chapter three, this research centres on the eighty-eight OSPAAAL posters that reference Africa. Published between 1967 and 1987, these eighty-eight posters are part of a wider collection of approximately three hundred and twenty OSPAAAL posters published between 1966 and 1996 (Docs Populi, 2022). The African series of OSPAAAL posters references eleven countries and touches on subjects such as apartheid in South Africa, the Soweto uprising, the imprisonment of Nelson Mandela, the illegal occupation of Namibia by South Africa, the Angolan Civil War, the Cape Verdean and Guinea-Bissauan campaign for independence, the Western Sahara conflict between the Polisario Front and Morocco, and the assassinations of Ben Barka, Patrice Lumumba, Amílcar Cabral and Olof Palme, to name a few. This research focuses on this series of posters because it is specifically concerned with the role of Africa in the Tricontinental Movement and OSPAAAL was the official mouthpiece of that movement.

The African series of OSPAAAL posters is analysed by means of iconography. The specifics of this are detailed in chapter three; however, in précis, 'iconography is both a method and an approach to studying the content and meanings of visuals' (Müller, 2011, p. 283). It works to deconstruct the layers of denotation, connotation and contextual meaning in images in order to explore their subject matter. This enables the researcher to analyse the images themselves, their content, composition, visual effects and possible meanings, and thus what the posters convey about the role of Africa in the Tricontinental imaginary.

Thus, the visual methodology speaks to the first part of the research question, exploring the role of Africa in the Tricontinental Movement; while the theoretical framework speaks to the second, addressing the political and aesthetic capacity of the African series of OSPAAAL posters to disrupt the sensible of the Cold War. These two aspects are not as distinct as the

research question might imply. Indeed, they intersect and cut across one another. However, it reflects an approach to visual research that seeks to combine what images 'mean' with what images 'do'; recognising, of course, that images do not mean something concrete and specific, and that they can do many, even contradictory, things. This research therefore considers how art, aesthetics and the visual intersect in ways that disrupt the distribution of the sensible. It probes the particularity of this process in the context of the Cold War, focusing specifically on the African series of OSPAAAL posters in order to unpack the role of Africa in the Tricontinental Movement. Instead of conceptualising art, aesthetics and the visual as the Other to politics, it demonstrates that they *are* politics. While this research is located in IR, it draws on popular geopolitics, and cultural and visual studies in its analysis, history, due to its historical context, and art history, as a result of the approach and method adopted. This interdisciplinarity addresses what IR does not 'see'; namely, the visual and aesthetic dimensions of Cold War politics.

Research Findings

With regard to the first of the secondary research questions, the analysis of the African series of OSPAAAL posters shows that the role of Africa in the Tricontinental imaginary was complex and at times contradictory. However, overall, Africa was conceptualised as composed of nations but constituted by its people. The posters almost always referenced specific countries but primarily depicted the people of Africa as opposed to the leaders of its governments. They were also rendered as specifically African as opposed to homogenous with the larger Tricontinental community. This was effected through the depiction of African struggles and liberation movements, martyrs and intellectual leaders, stereotypes, and tribal imagery. Lastly, through the designs of the posters, the accompanying text and the OSPAAAL logo, the people of Africa were depicted as part of the people of Africa, Asia and Latin America, united by the organisation's vision of armed global resistance to imperialism via the three continents. Thus, the analysis of the African series of OSPAAAL posters indicates that in the Tricontinental imaginary Africa was conceptualised via its people, as distinctly African, but a key part of the movement.

Regarding the second research question, the African series of OSPAAAL posters did generate both political and aesthetic dissensus. Apropos the former, the posters worked to make the

invisible visible. During the Cold War, Africa was marginalised as an international actor and its people rendered invisible. However, through the identification of a *dēmos*, the subjectivation of the political subject and the demonstration of an alternative voice, the posters depicted an alternative way of imagining the international community and its actors. By making the people of Africa visible, they thereby generated political dissensus. In contrast, they generated aesthetic dissensus by not conforming to the norms and expectations of the genre - that is, propaganda. During the Cold War, propaganda posters were met with the expectation that they impart clear, unambiguous and easily interpreted messages. Communist propaganda also typically employed socialist realism, while propaganda produced in capitalist countries adopted modernist traditions. Through the rejection of the styles of art associated with capitalism and communism, non-prescriptive designs, the presupposition of equality and the use of abstraction, the African series of OSPAAAL posters used modernist styles to create socialist propaganda that was remarkably non-prescriptive and open to interpretation resulting in aesthetic dissensus.

Regarding the third research question, this analysis demonstrates that art, aesthetics and the visual are important sites of politics. However, more importantly, rather than formulating them as the Other to politics, it demonstrates that they *are* politics. That is, they are not simply subdisciplines that add to existing debates within IR. Thus, in addition to adding to the body of research identifying new sites of politics, this analysis shows that art, aesthetics and the visual are fundamental to the study of world politics. Lastly, it also demonstrates that interdisciplinary approaches to research are a promising way of integrating art, aesthetics and the visual in IR. By embracing theory, methods and literature from beyond IR, it moves away from fixations on the state system, hard power, anarchy and the national/international binary, making the African series of OSPAAAL posters and its politics of trans-affective solidarity 'sensible'. Moreover, by questioning what IR does not 'see', this research joins others in challenging the sensible of IR and arguing that interdisciplinary approaches enable IR to 'see' other politics and therefore pose new questions.

Thus, the African series of OSPAAAL posters illuminates the role of Africa in the Tricontinental Movement by depicting how it was conceptualised as part of the Tricontinental imaginary. In sum, Africa is pictured as contributing its history and its people to the movement's global fight against imperialism. The posters also demonstrate the capacity to disrupt and entrench the

distribution of the sensible, actively shaping the international politics of the Cold War. Although the OSPAAAL posters are perhaps the most well-known and certainly the most iconic of OSPAAAL's cultural outputs, they have largely been neglected within academia. This research therefore builds on the archival work of Lincoln Cushing to call attention to the African series of OSPAAAL posters as a site of politics and address a critical gap in the literature on the Cold War. By analysing this previously neglected collection of political posters, this research makes a significant original contribution to our knowledge of the political and aesthetic history of the Tricontinental Movement.

Organisation of the Thesis

The following chapters begin by outlining the theoretical framework and methodology, before moving on to the four central discussion chapters and finally the conclusion. Chapter two details the theoretical framework and begins by discussing several key concepts in Jacques Rancière's work; namely, the sensible, the distribution of the sensible and the police, and how they relate to this research via the sensible of the Cold War and the sensible of IR. It then considers Rancière's work on dissensus, the aesthetics of politics, the politics of aesthetics, and equality, before reflecting on how Roland Bleiker's (2009) and Michael J. Shapiro's (2018) notions of the sublime augment our understanding of dissensus - particularly regarding emotions, politicised art and scale. The chapter then explains how we can conceptualise Anne Garland Mahler's (2018) premise that colour acted as a metonymic political signifier in Tricontinentalist texts as dissensus and an encounter with the sublime. Lastly, it delineates what I refer to as 'the Tricontinental imaginary', drawing on the work of Cornelius Castoriadis (1987), Benedict Anderson (2006) and Emma Hutchison (2018).

Chapter three, the methodology, discusses approaches to the study of images and visual research in the social sciences and also IR more specifically. In particular, it engages Callahan's (2020) visibility / visuality dyad to explain the distinction between 'what images mean' and 'what images do'. It also employs Rose's (2016) critical visual framework to methodically address the four 'sites' of the posters: the site of production, the site of the image itself, the site of circulation and the site of audiencing. It then reviews methods of analysis in political poster research, iconography as a method and an approach, its use in the literature, and this

research project. This is followed by the practical details of the fieldwork and identifying and accessing archives, before reflecting on the question of subjectivity and ethics.

Chapter four, the first of the discussion chapters, addresses Garland Mahler's premise that colour acted as a metonymic political signifier in Tricontinentalist texts but applies it to a close reading of the African series of OSPAAAL posters. In order to contextualise the analysis, the chapter first considers the political history of the Tricontinental Movement touching on the Bandung Conference, the Afro-Asian Peoples' Solidarity Organisation, the Non-Aligned Movement, the Third World in the United States and Europe, the roles of Latin America, Cuba and Africa, the ideological and geopolitical influence of the Cold War, and the Tricontinental Conference itself. Ultimately, the analysis finds that colour does not act as a metonymic political signifier in the African series of OSPAAAL posters. However, an examination of the use of the colours white and black, abstraction using bright colours, tribal imagery and the absence of race in poster designs suggests that poster artists were aware of and sensitive to racial and colour politics. Furthermore, they mirrored silences around race in Cuba's domestic policy - the basis of chapter five. Although the posters did not disrupt the sensible by using colour as a metonymic political signifier, the analysis indicates that they challenged the sensible in other ways. Namely, through the depiction of African peoples and by challenging the sensible aesthetics of the Cold War - the focus of chapters six and seven.

The second discussion chapter considers the role of Cuba's post-revolutionary racial politics apropos the African series of OSPAAAL posters. It begins with a brief introduction to the Cuban Revolution and race, before continuing to domestic and foreign policy, key points of conflict, and Cuba's relationship with Africa. It finds that this national perspective illuminates certain aspects of the posters - such as the prevalence of armed revolutionaries and guerrilla soldiers, inconsistencies in the representation of race and by extension the use of colour, and the use of tribal imagery. Although OSPAAAL was ostensibly an international and transnational organisation, the posters were influenced by Cuban politics. Hence, they occupy a space between the international, transnational and national; highlighting why the national/international binary of IR is problematic with regard to the Tricontinental Movement.

Chapter six explores the ways in which the African series of OSPAAAL posters disrupted the distribution of the sensible of the Cold War by means of politics. Through a discourse of

solidarity, the people of Africa, Asia and Latin America were made visible and ascribed a part in the international community. This was effected through the identification of a *dēmos*, the subjectivation of the political subject and the visual demonstration of an alternative voice. The chapter concludes that by demonstrating an alternative way of imagining the international and its actors that conflicted with that of the police, the posters offered the possibility of a new sensible of the Cold War.

Chapter seven discusses the ways in which the African series of OSPAAAL posters did not conform to the norms and expectations of its genre - that is, propaganda - and thereby disrupted the aesthetic sensible of the Cold War. By rejecting the styles of art associated with capitalism and communism, non-prescriptive designs, the presupposition of equality and the use of abstraction, the posters reimagined the genre of propaganda in the aesthetic and geopolitical context of the Cold War. Finally, the concluding chapter reflects on how Africa and African peoples were depicted in the posters and how this related to the Tricontinental imaginary. It also addresses the ways in which the politics and aesthetics of the posters intersected and informed one another, their capacity for dissensus, and the broader disciplinary implications of this research with regard to IR.

Chapter Two: Theoretical Framework

Writing in the early twentieth century, Max Horkheimer opens an essay on traditional and critical theory by asking, what is theory? In short, it depends on who is asking, or rather, who is answering. While Horkheimer (1982) contrasts traditional positivist understandings of theory to a critical Marxist perspective, it flags an important epistemological question - is theory a means of explaining a problem or part of the process of examining a problem? This research adopts an interpretivist approach, conceptualising theory as a 'lens' that is applied to make sense of our socially contingent world. Hence, the following theoretical framework is the scaffolding on which this research is built. The discussion begins by considering Jacques Rancière's work on the distribution of the sensible, dissensus and equality, before moving on to Roland Bleiker's and Michael J. Shapiro's notions of the sublime, Anne Garland Mahler's thoughts on colour as a metonymic political signifier in the Tricontinentalist texts, and lastly introduces the concept of the Tricontinental imaginary.

The Distribution of the Sensible

This research is concerned with politics and aesthetics. The African series of OSPAAAL posters, a visually striking collection of political art, is as much aesthetic as political. Thus, the theoretical framework builds on the work of Jacques Rancière to explore how the posters intervened politically and aesthetically in the international politics of the Cold War. As Ramos (2013, p. 219) has observed, 'over the last decade the reconfiguration of the relation between the political and aesthetics proposed by Rancière has increasingly attracted the practitioners of the visual […] [and] reinvigorated the question of the political capacities of the arts'. Rancière's writings are therefore an apt place to begin to explore what images can 'do'.

Jacques Rancière is a French philosopher born in 1940 in Algiers, French Algeria. He first gained international recognition with the publication and subsequent translation of *Lire le Capital* in 1965 and 1970. The book offered a philosophical reading of Karl Marx's *Capital: A Critique of Political Economy* and was authored by his mentor Louis Althusser, Étienne Balibar, Roger Establet, Pierre Macherey and Rancière. However, the protests in Paris in May 1968 saw Rancière break with Althusser and orthodox Marxism, embracing instead radical egalitarianism. For Rancière, Althusser did not leave enough space for spontaneous popular

revolt, insisting that the masses needed to be led by the political party. Rancière, in contrast, embraced the principal of radical equality, arguing that the masses did not need to be 'led', 'taught' or 'educated' by means of hierarchical structures. Much of his work is concerned with criticising the established school of philosophy and exploring the notion of equality, discussed below (Deranty, 2010a; Rockhill, 2004b; Tanke, 2011). However, as Rancière's work has evolved he has increasingly focused on aesthetics and politics and it is this later work that has become particularly popular among scholars of art history and visual studies as a means to explore the relationship between politics and aesthetics.

The concept of 'the sensible' is central to Rancière's philosophical work. As Rockhill (2004a, p. 85) notes, 'the "sensible", of course, does not refer to what shows good sense or judgement but to what is […] capable of being apprehended by the senses'. Indeed, by 'the sensible', Rancière refers to the known world and the systems that govern what is visible and what is audible, and what is thinkable and what is possible (Tanke, 2011, pp. 1-2). It encompasses all aspects of our perceived reality, including art, aesthetics and politics.

As Tanke (2011, p. 2) explains, 'the distribution of the sensible thus ultimately defines […] the field of possibility and impossibility'. Or, to quote Rockhill (2004b, p. 1), it is 'the system of divisions and boundaries that define, among other things, what is visible and audible within a particular aesthetico-political regime'. Rancière (2010, p. 36) describes it as, 'a generally implicit law that defines the forms of partaking by first defining the modes of perception in which they are inscribed'. Thus, as Tanke (2011, p. 2) summarises:

> [The distribution of the sensible] describes how partitions or divisions of the sensible structure what is seen and unseen, audible and inaudible, how certain objects and phenomena can be related or not, and also who, at the level of subjectivity, can appear in certain times and places. The distribution of the sensible is thus a general distribution of bodies and voices, as well as an implicit estimation of what they are capable of.

A discussion of the sensible as a concept would be incomplete without reference to 'the police'. For Rancière (1999, p. 28; 2010, p. 36), 'the police is not a social function but a symbolic constitution of the social', 'the set of procedures whereby the aggregation and consent of collectivities is achieved, the organization of powers, the distribution of places and roles, and the systems for legitimizing this distribution'. Thus, 'the police' is the existing distribution of

the sensible akin to a prevailing logic or status quo. It is not a conscious attempt by any group to promote a particular worldview but rather the structures, systems and processes that work to maintain the sensible. At the same time, it is not passive and actively 'polices' the sensible by denying equality.

> The police is thus first an order of bodies that defines the allocation of ways of doing, ways of being, and ways of saying, and sees that those bodies are assigned by name to a particular place and task; it is an order of the visible and the sayable that sees that a particular activity is visible and another is not, that this speech is understood as discourse and another as noise. (Rancière, 1999, p. 29)

As Rockhill (2004a, p. 89) notes, 'the essence of the police, therefore, is not repression but rather a certain distribution of the sensible'. For example, for Rancière, Althusser's assertion that the masses needed to be led by an intellectual elite was part of a police order as it worked to deny equality and maintain the existing power hierarchies (Rancière, 2011). In Cuba, the Revolution was radical in its thinking and implementation but remained hierarchical in its structure - similarly maintaining aspects of a police order.

If we understand 'the police' to refer to an existing distribution of the sensible, what were the systems and processes that underpinned the Cold War? What prevailing logics structured the sensible of the Cold War? As noted, the sensible encompasses all aspects of our known world and perceived reality, including art, aesthetics and politics. While the sensible of the Cold War was, of course, complex, it is important to outline several key components regarding this research; namely, international politics, race and art. Although they have been separated here to assist explication, they are not distinct partitions of the sensible. They overlap, influence one another, and differ depending on their geo-political context and locus of enunciation.

The distribution of the sensible determines what is visible and what is audible and by extension who can be seen, who can be heard and who can speak. It determines the order of a community and the allocation of parts and roles within it, defining who can participate, what capacities they can possess, which roles they can occupy and the interactions that are possible (Rancière, 2010, p. 36). Thus, regarding the international politics of the Cold War, the distribution of the sensible determined who was considered an international actor and their relative importance in the international community. First and foremost, the Cold War was

conceptualised as a conflict between the two superpowers and their respective allies that was framed by the threat of nuclear weapons. The other principal organising logics were based on hard power and the nation-state. Accordingly, the dominant and mainstream discourses in international politics centred on the United States and the Soviet Union; while proxy wars in Africa, Asia and Latin America were largely only seen as important insofar as their bearing on the balance of power between the superpowers. Cuba, for example, was only regarded as important in view of its links to the Soviet Union, proximity to the United States or in relation to the spread of socialist revolution around the world. This was especially apparent during the Cuban Missile Crisis in October 1962 in which Fidel Castro was excluded from negotiations despite asserting he was not afraid of nuclear war[3]. It is also, in part, why the paradigm of Cuba as a Soviet satellite emerged and persisted for as long as it did (Erisman, 2008). In addition, non-state actors had no widely recognised part in the international community as actors were defined as nation-states. Thus, the people of Africa, Asia and Latin America and transnational groups, such as the Tricontinental Movement, were rendered invisible in the international politics of the police order of the Cold War.

Race was a further organising logic of the sensible of the Cold War and is discussed in detail in chapter four. However, broadly speaking, being 'white' was associated with power; and conversely, 'non-white' with a lack of power. Indeed, race was defined in relation to a naturalised 'whiteness' so that any other ethnic group was Other. This hierarchical binary was

[3] On the 22nd October 1962, the world officially woke up to the Cuban Missile Crisis when President John F. Kennedy announced the discovery of 'offensive missile sites … [the purpose of which] can be none other than to provide a nuclear strike capability against the Western Hemisphere' (Kennedy, 1962). The missiles had been placed in Cuba by the Soviet Union and with the agreement of the Cuban government - partly in response to the United States' deployment of missiles in Turkey and the ongoing threat to Cuba of an invasion by the United States. Kennedy's announcement and subsequent naval quarantine of Cuba set in motion a tense period of negotiation between the United States and the Soviet Union that is widely regarded as the closest the superpowers came to nuclear war. In the end, Kennedy and Soviet First Secretary Nikita Khrushchev agreed that the missiles would be removed from Cuba on the understanding that the United States would not attack or invade the island (Gott, 2004, pp. 195-209). However, despite being at the centre of this flashpoint during the Cold War, Castro was excluded from the negotiations - an experience that left Cuba feeling both humiliated and indignant (Blight and Brenner, 2002, p. 25).

projected onto the international politics of the Cold War such that white nation-states were conceptualised as powerful and those in Africa, Asia and Latin America, for example, as powerless (Wade, 2010). It was also aligned to further binary oppositions that worked to structure the sensible. These included, but were not limited to, white vs. Other, colonial powers vs. colonies, imperialism vs. resistance, West vs. East and capitalism vs. communism (Borstelmann, 2001; Plummer, 2013). In particular, the recognition that imperialism and racial oppression were interlinked formed the backbone of the Tricontinental Movement's political discourse and ideology (Garland Mahler, 2018).

The distribution of the sensible also determines the nature of art, what counts as art, who can produce it, what capacities it possesses and how it relates to the other parts of the sensible (Tanke, 2011, p. 75). During the Cold War, art was drawn into the dominant ideological narrative. Despite a far more complex reality, modernism was identified with capitalism and figurative realism with communism. As Curley (2013, p. 11) explains with reference to Jackson Pollock's *Autumn Rhythm*, fig. 6, and Tatyana Yablonskaya's *Bread*, fig. 7:

> The Pollock canvas, according to accounts in the East, was meaningless scribble emblematic of decadent capitalist values; for the West, it represented the inevitable culmination of the avant-garde tradition and formed a humanist bulwark against totalitarian tendencies. Attitudes towards Socialist Realist paintings like *Bread* were also polarized along Cold War lines - something regressive and totalitarian or an art painted for and by the working classes.

These thoughts on who could produce art, for whom, for what purpose and using which artistic styles structured the part of art in the sensible of the Cold War. They therefore determined if propaganda could be considered art. Although the Cold War was certainly a period in which ideas on what art could and could not be were tested, art was still tethered to expectations about its form and function. For example, OSPAAAL posters were often designed by people who were artists by trade (Cushing, 2003). However, the posters were not widely considered art at the time, as propaganda and art did not easily occupy the same space in the police distribution of the sensible. OSPAAAL posters were not, for instance, exhibited in galleries or housed in museums akin to more traditional forms of art - though this has changed in the present day.

Additionally, we can think of the discipline of IR as a distribution of the sensible; or, of debates in IR as particular distributions of the sensible. In any given distribution, the shared ontological positions and epistemological commitments of the discipline determine what is visible/invisible, audible/inaudible, possible/impossible, and therefore how IR can proceed. For example, the visual and aesthetic turns disrupted the sensible of IR by challenging what constituted a possible topic of politics. Similarly, the OSPAAAL posters disrupt the sensible of the discipline because they are not recognised as a political subject. By addressing this previously neglected collection of posters, this research therefore hopes to make the OSPAAAL posters and their politics 'sensible'. Furthermore, by conceptualising the discipline as a distribution of the sensible, we can better reflect on what IR does and does not 'see'.

Dissensus and Equality

As the example of the OSPAAAL posters suggests, the distribution of the sensible is not fixed in time or space. Instead, it is subject to change. Dissensus, for Rancière, is the process of disrupting and effecting a redistribution of the sensible. It is, in a sense, a suspension of the rules governing normal experience (Corcoran, 2010, p. 1). In the glossary appended to his translation of Rancière's *The Politics of Aesthetics*, Rockhill (2004a, p. 85) further clarifies:

> A dissensus is not a quarrel over personal interests or opinions. It is a political process that resists juridical litigation and creates a fissure in the sensible order by confronting the established framework of perception, thought, and action with the 'inadmissible'.

It is a disagreement between understanding and imagination (Dikeç, 2015, p. 113). Of course, any new distribution of the sensible has the potential to ossify into a police order. For example, *Gitana Tropical*, fig. 8, was painted in 1929 by Victor Manuel García. It is widely considered one of the defining pieces of the early twentieth century Cuban avant-garde, which often sought to draw attention to marginalised communities - hence the title. However, with time and recognition it has become part of the main canon of Cuban art, informing and inspiring subsequent artists and their work. Consequently, though *Gitana Tropical* signified radicalism and experimentalism in art in the 1920s, the same style of art would not be considered avant-garde in the present day.

Rancière posits that while art and politics are both capable of dissensus, they do so through different means; namely, the politics of aesthetics and the aesthetics of politics. Through the latter, he explores the means by which politics can effect a break in the sensible; and through the former, the political capacities of the arts. As Rancière (2004, p. 62) explains, 'politics has its aesthetics, and aesthetics has its politics. But there is no formula for an appropriate correlation'. While they are contingent on one another, politics cannot be reduced to aesthetics and aesthetics cannot be reduced to politics. This research is concerned with the potential redistribution of the sensible effected through the political and aesthetic capacities of the African series of OSPAAAL posters as regards the Cold War.

By 'politics', Rancière does not refer to the typical and more familiar usages of the term - the activities and policies associated with government, especially those concerning the organisation and administration of the state and the regulation of relationships between states, or the academic study of government and the state (OED Online, 2021). Nor does he use 'politics' as a synonym for 'power relations'.

> Politics, when identified with the exercise of power and the struggle for its possession, is dispensed with from the outset. More, when conceived as a theory - or investigation into grounds of legitimacy - of power, its type of thinking is also dispensed with. (Rancière, 2010, p. 27)

Instead, for Rancière, politics indicates dissensus; 'it exists […] as a polemical redistribution of objects and subjects, places and identities, spaces and times, visibilities and meanings' (Rancière, 2009a, p. 32). It is the process of disrupting what is known and what is accepted by placing new, alternative ways of imagining the sensible in conflict with the ossified police order. The political therefore lies in the renegotiation of the partitions of the sensible. Thus, as Hinderliter *et al.* (2009, p. 8) note, 'politics is aesthetic in principal because it reconfigures the common field of what is seeable and sayable'. For Rancière (2004, p. 13), 'politics revolves around what is seen and what can be said about it, around who has the ability to see and the talent to speak'. Aesthetics is therefore linked to politics as a means of perceiving and relating to the world (Dikeç, 2015, p. 35). The aesthetics of politics as regard the African series of OSPAAAL posters are discussed in depth in chapter six.

Akin to politics, art has the capacity to disrupt the sensible. However, only 'aesthetic art' has this capacity. To elucidate, Rancière (2004) identifies three 'regimes of the arts': the ethical regime, the representative regime and the aesthetic regime. These are explained by Rockhill (2004a, p. 91) as '[modes] of articulation between three things: ways of doing and making, their corresponding forms of visibility, and ways of conceptualizing both the former and the latter'. Deranty (2010b, p. 117) describes them as 'the specific ways in which a given epoch conceives of the nature and logic of artistic representation'. However, while they have been likened to Foucault's *épistémès*, they are not mutually exclusive historical thresholds. Instead, they intermingle and are subject to exceptions (Tanke, 2011, pp. 76-77). Despite their inherent progression, Rancière does not ascribe normative values to the regimes of the arts. This notwithstanding, only 'aesthetic art' - art produced in the aesthetic regime - has the capacity to cause dissensus.

The aesthetic regime differs from the ethical and representative in that art produced in this aesthetic-political epoch is not subject to the same limits on what it can or should be or do. As Corcoran (2010, p. 15) summarises:

> In the first, the ethical regime, works of art have no autonomy. They are viewed as images to be questioned for their truth and for their effect on the ethos of individuals and the community. […] In the second, the representational regime, works of art belong to the sphere of imitation, and so are no longer subject to the laws of truth or the common rules of utility. They are not so much copies of reality as ways of imposing a form on matter. As such, they are subject to a set of intrinsic norms: a hierarchy of genres, adequation between expression and subject matter, correspondences between the arts, etc.

However, in the aesthetic regime, art is released from the expectations, norms and hierarchies associated with the ethical and representative regimes. Indeed, 'it began with decisions to reinterpret what makes art or what art makes' (Rancière, 2004, p. 25). Encompassing artistic currents such as romanticism, realism, cubism, dadaism, surrealism and abstraction, the aesthetic regime shares a history with the avant-garde tradition. Moreover, it signals the uncoupling of art from specific modes of presentation, form and subject matter, and it is this 'uncoupling' that gives aesthetic art its capacity to disrupt and effect a redistribution of the sensible (Tanke, 2011, pp. 81-82). For Rancière, aesthetic art is political because it has the

potential to redraw the partitions between what is visible and invisible, possible and impossible - destabilising a given regime of the sensible. As he notes in an interview with Arnall *et al*. (2012, p. 295), 'true aesthetic capacities […] can be enacted as political capacities'.

The politics of aesthetics are therefore the means by which art creates dissensus, while the regimes of the arts refer to the sensible relationship between art and its public, viewers or artists. For example, Burke's (2001, p. 14) approach to images as historical evidence or 'acts of eyewitnessing' is a product of the representative regime. However, we are able to critique this approach from the perspective of the aesthetic regime. The African series of OSPAAAL posters is a product of the representative and aesthetic regimes, showing signs of both regimes of the arts. Thus, Rancière's politics of aesthetics offers a means to explore the political capacities of the posters as aesthetic subjects - discussed in chapter seven.

Much of Rancière's work on the politics of aesthetics and the aesthetics of politics developed as part of his ongoing investigations into equality. As Tanke (2011, p. 1) and van Munster (2009, p. 268) note, the question of equality is arguably the defining element of his thought and at the heart of his conceptual framework. It began with Rancière's research into Joseph Jacotot, a French lecturer who was forced to flee Dijon for Brussels with the return of the Bourbons in the early nineteenth century. Jacotot did not speak Flemish, nor did his students speak French. As an experiment, Jacotot asked his students to teach themselves French using a bilingual edition of the *Télémaque*. Not only did they learn French, but they excelled at the task; leading Jacotot to surmise that contrary to conventional thought, all people were of equal intelligence and could educate themselves given the necessary tools and impetus. Furthermore, a person could teach that which they did not know. This, of course, clashed with the prevailing logic of educational institutions, which were based on the supposition that a knowledgeable expert was needed to educate the uneducated. Perhaps unsurprisingly, Jacotot's ideas on equality were not widely embraced (Rancière, 1991; Ross, 1991).

Rancière, however, took up Jacotot's work, detailed in *The Ignorant Schoolmaster*. For Rancière, 'equality is not a goal to be reached, but a presupposition that gives rise to alternative forms of community, communication, and pedagogy' (Tanke, 2011, p. 36). He argues that the general supposition of inequality in education, philosophy, politics and art creates a gap between student and teacher that serves to justify the authority of the latter,

but that can be challenged through the presupposition of equality. Hence, it is not about finding or proving equality; rather, it is about starting from equality as a point of departure. It is therefore a performance, something that must be demonstrated. As Rancière (1991, p. 137) writes, 'equality is not given, nor is it claimed; it is practiced, it is *verified*'. Any given distribution of the sensible is based on either equality or inequality. A distribution based on inequality is a police order, whereas:

> Equality is the primary means of contesting hierarchical and exclusionary distributions of the sensible. It allows us to imagine other forms of arrangement. (Tanke, 2011, p. 4)

Equality is therefore emancipatory, in contrast to the stultification of inequality. It also disrupts the sensible through both politics and aesthetics. Politics demonstrates equality through the part of those who have no part in the distribution of the sensible, while aesthetics demonstrates equality through the rejection of the hierarchy between artist and audience (Rancière, 1991; 2009b). These will be discussed further in chapters six and seven.

The Sublime

Jacques Rancière's notion of dissensus shares similarities with Roland Bleiker's and Michael J. Shapiro's notions of the sublime. Indeed, all three scholars have noted or alluded to the influence of Immanuel Kant's and Edmund Burke's writings on the sublime and thus share a philosophical genealogy. In the vernacular, the sublime is associated with excellence or beauty. However, for the aforementioned scholars, it is its distinction from beauty that is key. As Bleiker (2009, p. 70) explains:

> Definitions of the sublime usually begin with attempts to distinguish it from the beautiful. Kant, for instance, differentiated between aesthetic judgements about taste, which deal with the beautiful, and judgements about the sublime. Beauty is seen as something that brings pleasure and comfort. It is associated with a calm sense of harmony. The sublime, by contrast, is linked to excitement and astonishment. But it also involves awe and respect, even pain and terror.

It is sometimes described as a 'negative pleasure', an 'amalgam of positive and negative emotion, pleasure and anxiety' (Shinkle, 2012, p. 95). Typified by ambivalent and conflicting emotions, it is precipitated by an initial inability to comprehend the subject. In effect, it forces

us to face the limits of our cognition and understanding of the world. Shapiro (2018, p. 1), for example, describes it as akin to confusion:

> Influenced by Edmund Burke's account of the terror of the sublime, an object or event so vast and/or sudden that one's imagination is immobilized and attempts to make sense and verbalize the feeling are stymied, Kant recognized that in the experience of the sublime one's mind is in disarray.

This 'disarray' is not unlike the jarring moment of dissensus when 'the established framework of perception, thought, and action' is confronted with the 'inadmissible'. Shinkle (2012, p. 97) notes that 'sublime affect was understood to begin with a disruption or discontinuity in sensory experience'. Or, put another way, when the previously invisible and/or impossible becomes both visible and possible. Thus, as Dikeç (2015, p. 107) argues, 'the disruption of our forms of perceiving the world and modes of relating to it is the sublime element in politics in so far as it unsettles our habitual and normalised ways of sensing and making sense of the world'.

Rancière (2010, p. 45) describes 'the manifestation of dissensus as the presence of two worlds in one', whereby the police order is challenged by an alternative distribution of the sensible. This analogy of 'two worlds in one' finds common ground with the sublime. For Shapiro (2018, p. 4), the sublime regards 'disruptive events that provoke the formation of oppositional communities of sense, which register the existence of multiple experiential and thought worlds'. While Bleiker (2009, p. 74) articulates the sublime in the gap between these worlds:

> The events of 9/11 capture perfectly this aspect of the sublime. A common, immediate response to the events was one of overwhelming shock: a feeling that something like this cannot possibly be happening, that it is too unreal to be true. […] The result is incomprehension, pain and fear, expressing the gap between what is experienced and what can actually be apprehended by existing conceptual and descriptive means.

This 'gap' is especially significant with regard to art, as art expressly works with the gap between reality and representation. Thus, akin to dissensus, the sublime marks a conflict between two 'thought-worlds'. Callahan (2020, p. 233) describes this as 'a relational mode of creative/destruction', which aptly captures the dynamic relationship between politics and the police.

Kant and Burke expressed the sublime through reference to nature and natural events, usually disasters such as earthquakes and hurricanes. However, contemporary scholars have applied the concept of the sublime to further contexts. Shinkle (2012), for example, considers the technological sublime as succeeding that of nature, exploring the digital sublime with regard to video games. Bleiker (2009, p. 67) notes that as a discipline premised on studying the fear and awe-inspiring dimensions of the international and the conflicts it engenders, IR has a natural affinity with the sublime. However, other than a special issue of *Millennium*[4], there has been relatively little engagement with the sublime within the discipline. One notable exception, in addition to Bleiker and Shapiro, is Callahan (2020) who considers the sublime with regard to walls, specifically the sublime antagonism between the boundary/boundlessness of the Great Wall of China.

Emotional Politics

Although Bleiker's and Shapiro's notions of the sublime share similarities with Rancière's notion of dissensus, there are also key differences in how they are applied to politics and aesthetics. Namely, in their approach to emotions, politicised art and scale. Clearly, the sublime is articulated through reference to emotions, such as fear, awe and excitement. Hales (1991), for example, probed the atomic sublime of a mushroom cloud, finding that its aesthetic effected horror and fascination. In the past, emotions were rarely addressed in the study of world politics owing to the imagined dualism between emotion and reason, the latter of which was regarded as the proper domain of academic enquiry (Hutchison, 2016, p. 13). However, in recent decades research on emotions has attained such influence that it is common to speak of an 'emotional turn' and difficult to maintain the position that emotions do not play a part in world politics (Hutchison and Bleiker, 2014). This emotional turn is strongly linked to both the aesthetic and affective turns in international politics and interdisciplinary research. As Callahan (2020, p. 39) notes, 'affect' is a broad and contested concept:

> It generally seeks to shift critical focus from facts to feelings, from stable individual identity to multiple flows of encounter, from texts to nonlinear, nonlinguistic, and nonrepresentational genres, from abstract rational knowledge to embodied forms of

[4] *Millennium: Journal of International Studies,* 2006, 34(3).

> experience, and thus from ideology to affect. […] Affect theory generally differentiates between emotion and affect, seeing emotion as the internal subjective content of the individual, while affect emerges as a social experience as bodies connect in an "affective economy."

Whereas Hutchison (2018) defines emotions as both individual and shared, but states that it is through shared emotions that 'affective communities' are constituted. Despite these 'turns' and the recent research theorising the importance of emotions in world politics, IR as a discipline is not well-equipped to study and analyse how emotions matter in concrete political settings (Hutchison, 2016, p. 16). The concept of the sublime, however, introduces a space to consider the emotional in the political.

As noted in chapter one, emotions cannot easily be separated from politics. The emotive nature of the African series of OPSAAAL posters cannot, for example, be separated from its politics or capacity to intervene in the sensible. Indeed, all of the posters are emotive in the sense that they stir passion or sympathy in aid of generating solidarity. However, they also provoke other wide-ranging emotions, such as pride, awe, outrage, sadness and disgust. OSPAAAL posters are not alone in this regard. On comparing commercial and political posters, Sontag (1999, p. 203) observed:

> A political poster proceeds more directly and appeals to emotions with more ethical prestige. […] To create a feeling of psychic or moral obligation, political posters use a variety of emotional appeals. In posters featuring a single model figure, the image can be heart-rending, like the napalmed child in posters protesting the Vietnam War; it can be admonitory, like Lord Kitchener in Leete's poster; it can be inspirational, like the face of Che in many of the posters made since his death.

Thus, emotions are central to the affect-work of political posters; and, moreover, the concept of the sublime offers a way in which to consider the emotive nature of the African series of OSPAAAL posters. Rancière, in contrast, does not directly address emotions, though others have applied his work to questions of affect (Bargetz, 2015; DiPiero, 2020). Thus, the sublime augments our conceptualisation of dissensus in such a way as to allow a consideration of the emotive nature of the posters and the part this might have played in challenging the sensible of the Cold War.

Political Art

Rancière steers clear of overtly political art - anything that might be described as activist art, committed art or propaganda. Not because he believes that these objects are fundamentally incapable of dissensus, but rather that their identification as 'political art' has no bearing regarding challenges to the distribution of the sensible. In response to a question concerning his avoidance of political art, Rancière (2004, p. 60) replied:

> It is an in-between notion that is vacuous as an aesthetic notion and also as a political notion. It can be said that an artist is committed as a person, and possibly that he is committed by his writings, his paintings, his films, which contribute to a certain type of political struggle. An artist can be committed, but what does it mean to say that his art is committed? Commitment is not a category of art. This does not mean that art is apolitical, it means that aesthetics has its own politics, or its own meta-politics.

Describing art as 'political' in the aforementioned sense expresses a certain distribution of the sensible. Indeed, to describe an object as 'political art' is to denote a police order as it designates what is politics and what is not. Or, in other words, whether the OSPAAAL posters are propaganda or art is determined not by their content but rather by the viewer. As Segal (2016, p. 129) similarly argues:

> The traditional distinction between artistic purity and propaganda is illusory to a large degree. What is more, the idea that there is a strict distinction between purity and propaganda is politically motivated.

Hence, in his work, Rancière expresses a preference for aesthetics that have not been termed 'political', as this allows him to explore the mechanisms of dissensus free from the supposition of inequality that accompanies 'political art'. However, it has the effect of leaving such objects out of conversations regarding dissensus.

Bleiker (2009) and Shapiro (2018), in contrast, readily engage instances of the sublime that have overtly political connotations, such as the terrorist attacks of 9/11 and activist poetry in Cold War Germany. For Bleiker and Shapiro, the aesthetic register of the sublime enables new alternative ways of addressing key issues in world politics; thus, overtly political objects and subjects take centre stage. While I agree with Rancière in the sense that identifying art as 'political' has no bearing on its capacity for dissensus, I do not plan to avoid such objects as a

result. The OSPAAAL posters were widely considered propaganda and identified as 'political art', as was the majority of art that was produced in Cuba during the 1960-1980s. Akin to Bleiker and Shapiro, I argue that as these objects were as capable of dissensus and the sublime as other aesthetic art, they should not be neglected out of hand. Furthermore, given that propaganda often plays a key role in how the sensible of world politics is ordered, it is especially important that the OSPAAAL posters are addressed. That said, Rancière's comments do highlight that it is also important to differentiate between the posters' capacity for aesthetic and political dissensus and their 'politics' as described by the police.

From the Sublime to the Subliminal

Kant's mathematical sublime deals with the feelings that result when the imagination runs up against the incomprehensibly large in nature. This sense of overwhelming magnitude and scale links to the 'initial inability to comprehend the subject' discussed above - when particular objects or subjects exceed the limits of our understanding (Kant, 2007; Shinkle, 2012, p. 96). Dikeç (2015, p. 116), for example, writes that 'what the sublime encounter disrupts is the ordinary workings of [the] police by introducing an element that overwhelms it'. With regard to scale, Shapiro (2018) considers immediate and longer-term catastrophes - the 1989 San Francisco and 1995 Kobe earthquakes, the 9/11 terrorist attacks, and the violence of the colour line, nuclear poisoning and damage to land- and people-scapes through industrialisation in the United States - which by their very nature are large in scale. Indeed, he sees it as a key feature of the sublime, stating that 'the sublime tends to flash up as soon as one contemplates the extent to which there is a challenge to one's imagination because of an experience's immense and difficult to comprehend scope' (Shapiro, 2018, p. 2). Bleiker (2009, p. 73) also begins from this standpoint, noting that 'the first key feature of the sublime has to do with the sheer magnitude of an encounter between our minds and a terrible event, be it an erupting volcano or a terrorist attack: it confronts us with the limits of our capacity for understanding'. However, from here he moves from the sublime to the subliminal, engaging everyday and subconscious practices of politics. Arguing that the subliminal is able to generate the same types of political insights as the sublime, he explores this premise through a series of poetic case studies. Rancière's work on dissensus also moves between large-scale events and the everyday and subconscious. For example, in *The Intolerable Image*, Rancière (2009b) considers the Chilean artist Alfredo Jaar's work on the Rwandan genocide in 1994. His

treatment of these works reflects on the gaze of the spectator apropos the representation of the horror of the massacre.

This research adopts a similar small-scale or subliminal perspective, conceptualising the many encounters between the artist-poster-viewer as possible moments of dissensus and the sublime. It shares similarities with Dikeç's (2015, p. 107) conceptualisation of the sublime element in politics:

> The sublime element in politics interrupts repetitive and normalised practices of everyday life within which we risk getting caught up and producing predictable reactions within the routine of our everyday lives. I use the sublime to evoke an image of the disruption, even perhaps subversion, of the ordinary, habitual and unreflexive practices associated with consolidated spatial and temporal orders. I propose to think of disruption as something that looks surprising and unsettling - if not entirely astonishing or outright terrifying - within the given and normalised ways of perceiving the world and making sense of it.

Thus, while one can talk about challenges to the sensible at a structural level, dissensus is made up of many smaller sublime moments between the artist-poster-viewer. The sublime therefore offers an alternative way of thinking about dissensus and a further perspective on how objects and subjects can intervene in the distribution of the sensible. It also opens a space in which this theoretical framework can better address the emotive nature of the African series of OSPAAAL posters, while throwing light on considerations of scale and how to read the posters sensitive to their overtly 'political' assertions.

Metonymic Colour Politics

Applying Rancière's notion of dissensus and Bleiker's and Shapiro's notions of the sublime, we can conceptualise Garland Mahler's premise that colour acted as a metonymic political signifier in Tricontinentalist texts as dissensus and an encounter with the sublime. To elucidate, race was a key part of the distribution of the sensible of the Cold War - as noted earlier. Furthermore, the depiction of race followed certain norms and expectations; namely, that skin colour in visual representations adhered to the sensible racial hierarchies. Garland Mahler, however, suggests that Tricontinentalist texts disrupted this aspect of the sensible by

using colour to denote politics and political ideology as opposed to ethnic or phenotypic groups. Thus, readers or viewers of these texts were confronted by a new alternative system of representation whereby colour - previously a racial signifier - was transformed into a political signifier. As a result, they were forced to reconcile what they expected with what they experienced on viewing the Tricontinentalist texts. We can therefore conceptualise the interactions between the artist-poster-viewer as moments of encounter with the sublime, and the use of colour as a metonymic political signifier as a challenge to the sensible aesthetics of the Cold War. While discussing Alfredo Jaar's work on the Rwandan genocide, Rancière (2009b, p. 97) comments that 'the political figure par excellence is metonymy'. In particular, he notes that in one photograph - *The Eyes of Gutete Emerita*, fig. 9 - the gaze of a woman who has witnessed the massacre of her family stands in place of the spectacle of horror. This metonymy similarly disrupts the sensible through an act of representation. For Rancière (2009b, p. 93):

> Representation is not the act of producing a visible form, but the act of offering an equivalent […]. The image is not the duplicate of a thing. It is a complex set of relations between the visible and the invisible, the visible and speech, the said and the unsaid.

However, as discussed in chapter one, Garland Mahler focuses on African Americans and the Jim Crow South in the United States and apportions relatively little attention to the role of Africa in the Tricontinental Movement or its official cultural production via OSPAAAL. Thus, chapter four examines her premise that colour acted as a metonymic political signifier in Tricontinentalist texts through a close reading of the African series of OSPAAAL posters.

The Tricontinental Imaginary

Key to this research is the notion of 'the Tricontinental imaginary', by which I refer to how the Tricontinental community and its politics were represented and imagined as part of the international. The word 'imaginary' - used here as a noun as opposed to an adjective - has been gaining currency in the social sciences since the late twentieth century (Nerlich and Morris, 2015). Its exact meaning varies with respect to the context - for example, it is possible to read discussions on the spatial imaginary; the social imaginary (Brown, 2013), Appadurai (1990), for instance, frames globalisation in terms of collective cultural imagination, the imagination as social practice; the Global South imaginary (Field *et al.*, 2020, p. 6); the

American imaginary, Weber (1999, pp. xiv, 11), for instance, refers to the 'imagined American body politic'; the political imaginary (Bottici, 2011; Opondo and Shapiro, 2012); the climate imaginary; and the sociotechnical imaginary. However, it can broadly be described as a shared or collective imagining that works to shape the distribution of the sensible. It operates across the community, but it is not homogeneous at the level of the individual. It also should not be confused with the unreal, fictitious or fictional.

Its etymology is often linked to the work of Cornelius Castoriadis, a Greek émigré to France who wrote *The Imaginary Institution of Society* in 1975 (Bottici and Challand, 2011; Nerlich and Morris, 2015). For Castoriadis, society was a product of collective imagination. Speaking of the social imaginary, Castoriadis (1987, p. 3) explained:

> In particular, it has nothing to do with that which is presented as 'imaginary' by certain currents in psychoanalysis: namely, the 'specular' which is obviously only an image *of* and a reflected image […] The imaginary of which I am speaking is not an image *of*. It is the unceasing and essentially *undetermined* (socio-historical and psychical) creation of figures/forms/images, on the basis of which alone there can ever be a question *of* 'something'. What we call 'reality' and 'rationality' are its works.

Hence, for Castoriadis, the social imaginary, the collective imagination of language, norms and customs, worked to constitute society itself (Elliott, 2012). This shares similarities with Rancière's work on the distribution of the sensible, particularly regarding the inherent power structures that determine who is visible and who is not. On the one hand, the social imaginary functions as the police - maintaining, regulating and protecting the institutionalised conditions. However, on the other hand, it is imagination that contains the transformative energy necessary to create dissensus.

Benedict Anderson's work on 'imagined communities' has also greatly contributed to discussions on 'the imaginary'. Although Anderson originally used the term 'imagined communities' to discuss nations and nationalism, it has since been adapted to different contexts across numerous disciplines - see, for example, Mahmod (2016) and Mandaville (2001). In *Imagined Communities*, Anderson (2006, p. 4) sets out to explain the previously naturalised notion of the nation-state:

> My point of departure is that nationality, or, as one might prefer to put it in view of that word's multiple significations, nation-ness, as well as nationalism, are cultural artefacts of a particular kind. To understand them properly we need to consider carefully how they have come into historical being, in what ways their meanings have changed over time, and why, today, they command such profound emotional legitimacy.

Anderson (2006, pp. 6-7) describes nations as 'imagined political communities'. *Imagined*, 'because the members of even the smallest nation will never know most of their fellow-members, meet them, or even hear of them, yet in the minds of each lives the image of their communion'; and *imagined as a community*, 'because, regardless of the actual inequality and exploitation that may prevail in each, the nation is always conceived as a deep, horizontal comradeship. Ultimately it is this fraternity that makes it possible, over the past two centuries, for so many millions of people not so much to kill, as willingly to die for such limited imaginings'. He also links nationalism to the rise of the printing press as printed media contributed towards a sense of national consciousness. This has parallels with the role of OSPAAAL posters in creating the Tricontinental imaginary. However, unlike Anderson's nations, the Tricontinental community was not imagined as limited or sovereign. Furthermore, Anderson fails to recognise that imagination is about much more than simply picturing or visualising objects or subjects. It is creative, involves our other senses, feelings and emotions, and in this way is aesthetic, necessitating aesthetic approaches and interpretivist methods. Castoriadis (1987, p. 3), for example, noted that the imaginary was more than 'an image *of* something'.

Where Anderson only begins to hint at the emotional and affective power of imagined communities, Emma Hutchison takes it as the principal subject of her research. Central to her work on trauma and collective emotions in world politics is the notion of 'affective communities', which Hutchison (2018, para. 4) defines as:

> Forms of community distinguished by widely-held and collectively understood forms of feeling. This means that the respective community is constituted - and to an extent unified, at least temporarily - through shared patterns of emotional meaning and understanding.

This echoes Castoriadis' argument that collective imagination works to constitute society. However, for Hutchison, it is collective feeling that works to constitute the community be it

local, global or transnational. Hutchison (2018, para. 8) also argues that representation is key to the formation of these communities, noting that 'representational practices provide a pathway through which emotions acquire a collective dimension and, in turn, shape social and political agency, behaviours, and policies'. Hence, the importance of printing presses and OSPAAAL posters in the development of the Tricontinental imaginary. However, heeding Hinderliter *et al.* (2009, p. 12), this is not simply a reference to collective spectatorship. Indeed, Garland Mahler (2018, p. 10) has observed that 'through the circulation of its publications and films, and through the iconic posters for which it is now recognized, the Tricontinental created something akin to Benedict Anderson's notion of an "imagined community"'. However, she goes on to refine this by applying Christopher Lee's notion of a 'communitas'.

> Communitas refers to a community of feeling, an affective community of solidarity that transcends national and regional geography and whose affinities are not based on location, language, or blood. (Garland Mahler, 2018, p. 10)

This is an apt clarification of how the imagined Tricontinental community differed from Anderson's imagined nations, based on 'trans-affective solidarity' as opposed to geography, linguistics or ethnic groups.

Thus, the notion of the Tricontinental imaginary builds on these theoretical foundations. In the first instance, it proposes that collective imagination was key to the formation of the Tricontinental community. Secondly, akin to Anderson's imagined nations, the members of this community did not know most of their fellow members. However, owing to a shared sense of solidarity similar to the horizontal comradeship and fraternity Anderson speaks of, they were able to imagine this transnational community. And thirdly, this imagined community effected and was partly constituted by emotional and affective forms of feeling that worked to consolidate and motivate the Tricontinental Movement. Thinking about the Tricontinental community and its politics in this way enables this research to conceptualise how this transnational community gained form and affective power through collective imagination.

In sum, this theoretical framework is based on the work of Jacques Rancière and Roland Bleiker's and Michael J. Shapiro's notions of the sublime. By applying this theoretical 'lens' to Anne Garland Mahler's premise that colour acted as a metonymic political signifier in Tricontinentalist texts, this research is able to conceptualise the OSPAAAL posters as capable

of intervening in the sensible of the Cold War. The following analysis chapters therefore explore Garland Mahler's premise with regard to the African series of the OSPAAAL posters and the posters themselves as political and aesthetic interventions in the sensible. The Tricontinental imaginary was key to the Tricontinental Movement and shaped by practices of visual representation such as the OSPAAAL posters. While this chapter outlines an aesthetic approach, the next chapter discusses visual research and methodology.

Chapter Three: Methodology

As Callahan (2020, p. 66) observes, 'since Roland Bleiker declared the aesthetic turn in IR theory in 2001, much has been written about the need to resist the rational methods and the linear teleological narratives that frame our understanding of ourselves and the world'. In précis, Bleiker (2001, p. 510) argued that the field of international politics needed to address the gap in representation as opposed to ignoring or seeking to narrow it - as per mimetic approaches - by drawing attention to 'images, narratives and sounds, such as literature, visual art, music, cinema and other sources that extend beyond 'high art' into popular culture'. While there is now a large body of literature that explores the visual in international politics, relatively few studies discuss their methodology. This risks undermining the credibility and authority of visual insights into world politics. In contrast, this research seeks to be methodologically explicit in order to lend transparency, build confidence and further encourage visual approaches in IR. This chapter therefore begins by discussing approaches to the study of images and visual research, theoretically grounding the methodology. It then reflects on Gillian Rose's 'critical visual methodology' apropos the OSPAAAL posters as a means of examining the research materials, before discussing iconography as the primary method of analysis, the archival research and fieldwork, and subjectivity and ethics with regard to this research.

Approaches to Images and Visual Research

As the oft quoted aphorism goes, 'a picture paints a thousand words'; but in what sense, if any, are pictures analogous to words? It is common for images to be likened to a visual language, especially where iconography and semiotics are concerned. Bonnell (1997, p. 10), for example, imagines images as a visual language complete with lexicon and syntax; where the lexicon comprises key icons, such as the male worker or female peasant, and the syntax, the positioning of these icons in relation to each other and their visual surroundings. Van Leeuwen (2001) similarly draws on the analogy of images as a visual language to explain that as methods of analysis, semiotics and iconography primarily deal with the 'lexis' or vocabulary of images. While this approach has utility, it is important to keep in mind that this visual language is usually translated into a verbal language in order to communicate research findings - though this speaks of convention rather than necessity. Burke (2001, p. 14) and

Evans (1999, pp. 12-13) warn that the two languages, visual and verbal, do not always 'translate' easily. For example, take a picture of a gun. Images have no tense. Thus, we cannot differentiate between 'this is a gun', 'this was a gun' or 'this is a gun in the future'. This approach also fails to capture the ways in which images are fundamentally different to words. As Bleiker (2018, p. 9) queries, why is it that viewers are warned before seeing shocking images in the media? The notification 'caution - this programme / film / article may contain upsetting images' is all too familiar, whereas no such warnings typically accompany written descriptions of similar content. It would seem that we intuitively understand that images have the power to affect us in ways that words do not, an intuition that has been central to the visual turn.

As noted in chapter one, the visual turn has altered our approach to images from merely illustrative to a more nuanced appreciation of 'the social construction of the visual' and 'the visual construction of the social' (Mitchell, 2006, p. 343; Callahan, 2020, p. 19). Thus, this research approaches images, specifically the African series of OSPAAAL posters, in terms of 'what images mean' and 'what images do', adopting Callahan's (2020) visibility / visuality dyad. Indeed, do images *mean* anything? Following the visual turn, there has been a sustained interest in the meaning of images. Initially, this was based on the premise that meaning existed in the image and that this meaning could be 'uncovered' or 'deciphered' by a knowledgeable viewer, skilled researcher or the proper visual research method. Linked to this was the notion of authorship; or rather, the idea that artists imbued images with meaning, intentionally or otherwise. Hence, an historian might analyse a painting from the Renaissance period, reading 'between the lines' to discover a meaning that the artist did not know they were communicating (Burke, 2001, p. 14). However, this premise is problematic on two accounts. Firstly, as Mannay (2016, p. 1) emphasises, 'beyond their making, images themselves are constantly subject to interpretation and re-interpretation'. They do not 'make sense' on their own, but gain meaning through interpretation (Bleiker, 2018, p. 16). Secondly, it assumes that images contain a singular meaning. As Hall (1997, p. 3) explains:

> Things 'in themselves' rarely if ever have any one, single, fixed and unchanging meaning. Even something as obvious as a stone can be a stone, a boundary marker or a piece of sculpture.

The meaning attached to an icon in an image can change over time, for example. Akin to Rose (2016, pp. xxi-xxii), I do not consider images to contain an essential or fundamental truth.

Meaning is not *in* the image, rather it is formed through the process of interpretation. Hence, as an image can be interpreted in different ways by different viewers in different contexts, it does not have a singular static or fixed meaning. However, I would argue that artists are not completely external to the meaning-making process and that authorship still influences interpretation. Thus, I conceptualise meaning as formed through the relationship between artist-poster-viewer.

In addition to asking 'what do images mean?', this research also asks, 'what do images do?' Echoing Bleiker, Callahan, and Grayson and Mawdsley, I take the position that images 'do things' and actively shape international politics. Bleiker (2018, p. 3), for example, elucidates with reference to the Muhammad Cartoon Crisis, pointing out that the cartoons had far reaching political effects, triggering significant international tension and several violent attacks in Paris and Copenhagen that killed fourteen people (see also Hansen, 2011; and Müller and Özcan, 2007). Callahan (2020) draws on cartographic maps, such as the disputed territories of the South China Sea and a fictional representation of Europe in 2035, to show how images can provoke and perform social-ordering and world-ordering practices; while Grayson and Mawdsley (2019) explore the ongoing controversies surrounding targeted killing via drones to show how the scopic regimes of modernity shape the ordering of global space. This approach to images has similarities with Rancière's politics of aesthetics. For Rancière (2009b, p. 103):

> The images of art do not supply weapons for battles. They help sketch new configurations of what can be seen, what can be said and what can be thought and, consequently, a new landscape of the possible.

Thus, images have the capacity to 'do things', but more specifically, they have the capacity to intervene in the distribution of the sensible. As Bleiker (2018, p. 4) notes, 'images are political in the most fundamental sense: they delineate what we, as collectives, see and what we don't and thus, by extension, how politics is perceived, sensed, framed, articulated, carried out and legitimised'.

Although exploring 'what images mean' and 'what images do' might sound like conflicting approaches to visual research, Callahan (2020) frames them as part of a productive tension or dynamic dyad between visibility and visuality. Visibility referring to the social construction of

the visual, and visuality, the visual construction of the social (Callahan, 2020, pp. 1-2). This dualism between visibility and visuality, meaning and doing, ideology and affect, and hermeneutics and critical aesthetics is conceptualised by Callahan not as a binary opposition or historical progression but as a productive if uneasy relationship. Rose (2016, pp. 10, 14) alludes to this same dyad in her discussion of representational and nonrepresentational/affective approaches to visual research. This 'tension' is also present in my own research. While one aspect of the research examines the OSPAAAL posters themselves, their composition, and the context in which they were created, circulated and viewed; the other considers what they could 'do' and their capacity to disrupt the sensible of the Cold War. Akin to Callahan, I conceptualise this as a productive as opposed to problematic tension.

The invisible is the often unspoken half of the visual; together, visibility and invisibility form the visual (Bleiker, 2018, p. 20; Van Veeren, 2018). The majority of visual research focuses on the visible or in making the invisible, visible. See, for example, Harman's (2019) *Seeing Politics: Film, Visual Method and International Relations*. Indeed, Rancière, Bleiker and Shapiro all attend to the process by which the invisible becomes visible. The sensible is precisely a distribution of what can be seen and what cannot, and the sublime, a moment in which the invisible clashes with the visible. However, as Burns (2013) cautions, it is important not to assume that the invisible is always undesirable or that the objective of the research is always to make visible the invisible. Callahan (2020, p. 25) similarly warns against fixating on the visible/invisible, noting that it threatens to reproduce the familiar inside/outside binary of IR; instead, drawing our attention to hierarchies of the visible that would otherwise be obscured by a visible/invisible binary. Crucially, as Callahan (2020, p. 1) posits at the outset of *Sensible Politics*, 'images […] shape our view of the world, by making some things visible while at the same time making other things invisible'. This research is sensitive to the visible and the invisible, recognising that they are mutually constituted. At the same time, by attending to 'what images do', it also moves beyond the visible/invisible binary.

Rose's Critical Visual Methodology

Based on a survey of the literature on visual research methods, Rose (2016) proposes a 'critical visual methodology'. This offers a way of thinking about different approaches to research with

images and takes the form of a framework based on four sites: the site of production, where an image is made; the site of the image itself, its visual content; the site of circulation, where it travels; and the site of audiencing, where the image encounters its spectators. Each of these four sites has three modalities: technological, compositional and social (Rose, 2016, pp. 24-26). Although the framework is predominantly centred on 'what images mean', it also encompasses 'what images do'. Rose takes note of discussions on the agency of images, affect, the premise that images construct as well as reflect social difference, and making images as part of the research process, all of which concern what images 'do'. In addition to offering a way of thinking about how approaches to visual research differ, this framework enables me to position this research within the wider field of visual studies. The following will therefore discuss each site in turn with regard to the African series of OSPAAAL posters.

The Site of Production

This site encompasses questions about how images are made (technological modality), their genre (compositional modality), and by whom, for whom, when and why (social modality) (Rose, 2016, pp. 27-32). Although it is not the main focus of the analysis, the site of production is still a key part of this research. It works to inform the analysis by providing a contextual layer of knowledge regarding the OSPAAAL posters. For example, regarding the technological modality, Burke (2001, p. 16) notes that there have been two key revolutions in image production, 'the rise of the printed image (woodcut, engraving, etching and so on) in the fifteenth and sixteenth centuries, and the rise of the photographic image (including film and television) in the nineteenth and twentieth'. Both of which made the OSPAAAL posters possible as they often used photographic material as well as being a printed medium. Fig. 10, for example, incorporates a photograph of Patrice Lumumba; while fig. 11 is based on a photograph by Ernest Cole, fig. 12.

Indeed, posters were a direct product of the printing revolution, which 'made possible a quantum leap in the number of images available to ordinary people' (Burke, 2001, p. 17). The ability to make large numbers of images, or more specifically, copies, is fundamental to the poster as a form of propaganda or art. As Walter Benjamin (2008) argued, the invention of the printing press profoundly changed our relationship to art and images. While the use of art to persuade others can be traced back to Mesopotamian civilisations at around 2550BC (Moore,

2010, pp. 15-16), posters could only exist in 'the age of mechanical reproduction'. To recall Sontag's (1999, p. 199) comments on the form of posters:

> Unlike a painting, a poster was never meant to exist as a unique object. […] From its conception, the poster is destined to be reproduced, to exist in multiples.

Unimaginable before the printing press, they still had to wait for the development of colour lithography and high-speed presses to make mass-produced, large-format colour printing a reality (Sontag, 1999, pp. 197, 199; Tschabrun, 2003, p. 306). This technology emerged in the mid-nineteenth century and gave rise to a boom in poster production by governments during the interwar period (Bénaud, 2002, p. 88; Craven, 2006, p. 15; Cushing, 2003, p. 8; Tschabrun, 2003, p. 306). However, Tschabrun (2003, p. 306) remarks that 'the post-World War II period has been notable for the transformation of the political poster into a communication modality used in political protest by much smaller political entities, collectives, and even individuals, while simultaneously witnessing the spread of the political poster to all four corners of the globe'. Indeed, writing in 1970, Gary Yanker noted the surge in posters turned to political purposes by an array of groups around the world; while Craven (2006, p. 15) asserts that the poster was, in effect, reinvented in Latin America during the mid-twentieth century as a form of popular art.

As well as enabling the widespread production of posters, printing technology influenced their design and style. In the 1960-1980s, silkscreen - also known as serigraphy - and offset lithography were the two most common techniques. As Eckmann (2006, p. 39) explains:

> Serigraphy makes use of a squeegee to force ink through a screen containing a stencil directly onto a surface such as a piece of paper, while offset lithography is a photo-mechanical technique in which the image is first offset onto a rubber-covered cylinder, and then printed onto paper.

Each had its advantages and disadvantages. Offset lithography, for example, was better suited to large print-runs and the use of photography. This was why it was used to print the OSPAAAL posters, which were produced in larger numbers than most other posters in Cuba (Bermúdez, 2010, p. 228; Eckmann, 2006, p. 48). Often, one technique would dominate, influencing that country or group's style of posters. For example, in Puerto Rico silkscreen printing dominated due to the island's links with silkscreen artists and printmakers in the United States (Eckmann, 2006). In Cuba, both offset lithography and silkscreen were used. However, there is some

debate as to which was more prevalent. Lincoln Cushing, a graphic designer and archivist specialising in Cuban posters, and Teresa Eckmann, an academic specialising in Latin American art, state that offset lithography was more common (Cushing, 2003, p. 16; Eckmann, 2006, p. 39). Whereas Jorge Bermúdez, an academic at Havana University and authority on Cuban posters, notes that the use of very few colours and 'flat colour' associated with silkscreen was one of the defining characteristics of the Cuban poster tradition (Bermúdez, 2010, pp. 228-229) (see also Cushing, 2003, p. 14). This, however, might simply be a reflection of convention and style. On a similar note, Cushing (2003, p. 17) observes that nearly all Cuban posters were portrait as opposed to landscape even though there does not appear to be any particular reason other than convention. Nonetheless, while poster production in the 1960-1980s was certainly driven by artistic and political movements, it is important to highlight that the development of printing technology played a key role in the emergence and style of political posters including the OSPAAAL posters.

With regard to genre (compositional modality), the OSPAAAL posters are largely regarded as propaganda or art. This ambiguity over their genre is at the heart of this research and draws attention to a distribution of the sensible that historically considered art and propaganda as mutually exclusive. It also informs the discussion in chapter seven, which explores the ways in which the African series of OSPAAAL posters did not conform to the norms and expectations of its genre thereby disrupting the aesthetic sensible of the Cold War.

The social modality of the production of the OSPAAAL posters - the by whom, for whom, when and why - is discussed throughout this thesis. However, it is worth noting here a few details that are not covered elsewhere. Firstly, it is important to understand that the OSPAAAL posters were created amid a nationwide cultural movement that emerged in the years following the Cuban Revolution and generated a plethora of graphic art (Luis, 2001, pp. 161-162). Part of the success of the Cuban poster tradition was linked to the state support for political posters printed through the *Instituto Cubano del Arte e Industria Cinematográficos*, the *Editora Política* and OSPAAAL (Mor, 2019, p. 50). Secondly, it is important to consider the poster artists themselves; not only because they were largely responsible for the poster designs, but also because they are part of the artist-poster-viewer relationship discussed above. Cushing (2003, p. 11) states that while some worked as staff designers, others contributed on a freelance basis.

> Each one brought a particular style that was generally encouraged, rather than subsumed, in the design process. Most had formal training as designers (Félix Beltrán) or painters (Raúl Martínez). Each left an indelible stylistic mark. Bachs, whose work as a children's book illustrator was influenced by Polish posters, adopted a decidedly whimsical and loose approach. Martínez is generally credited with introducing the "pop" style to Cuba. Beltrán's work is characterized by elegant simplicity. Alfrédo Rostgaard was able to inject the unexpected into images that had been exhausted by previous artists. Mederos was a master at combining painterly flat fields of color with exquisite line work, and Alberto Blanco explored photomontage in many of his OSPAAAL posters.

Interestingly, despite the Cuban Revolution's efforts to empower women and achieve socialist equality, only eight women designed twenty-two of OSPAAAL's three hundred and twenty-six posters - less than seven percent (Cushing, 2003, p. 12). Thirdly, regarding 'for whom' the OSPAAAL posters were produced, it follows that the primary intended audience was the readership of the Tricontinental Magazine. Mor (2019, p. 50) notes that it was sent directly 'to organizations and leaders allied with tricontinentalist ideals'. Thus, an audience sympathetic to the movement and its politics. However, the nature of posters - highly mobile and designed for display - would suggest that the artists might also have expected to draw the attention of passers-by beyond the readership of the magazine. The use of four languages and minimal text would have made them intelligible to a large proportion of any potential audience.

The Site of the Image

The site of the image itself comprises its visual effects (technological modality), composition (compositional modality) and visual meanings (social modality) (Rose, 2016, pp. 32-34). This is the primary focus of the analysis. In particular, the aspect of the research that centres on 'what images mean' addresses the social modality of the African series of OSPAAAL posters. As a result, this site is discussed in detail throughout the following chapters, which explore visual effects such as op art, gaze and visual metaphor, composition in terms of imagery and use of colour, and visual meanings in the sense of what the posters convey about the role of Africa in the Tricontinental imaginary.

The Site of Circulation

Akin to the site of production, the site of circulation is not the main focus of the analysis. However, it is still an important consideration, not least because the international distribution of the OSPAAAL posters is a key part of why these images were selected over other visual materials. Furthermore, the circulation of images can play a central role in their effects and what they 'do'. Callahan (2020, p. 35), for example, notes that part of the reason why the 'Europe in 2035' maps became so influential was not their ideological value, but their capacity for circulation and exchange. For Rose, the site of circulation comprises how images are circulated (technological modality), how images change through circulation (compositional modality), and who or what organises this circulation and why (social modality) (Rose, 2016, pp. 34-38).

How the OSPAAAL posters were circulated - their technological modality - is unusual. As noted in chapter one, they were folded as an insert within the Tricontinental Magazine. Cushing (2003, p. 10) remarks that 'this simple act, of violating the conventional formal purity of a poster by folding it up for mailing, was the key to what became the most effective worldwide poster distribution system ever'. Their compositional modality vis-a-vis the site of circulation has less bearing on the research questions. However, there is one fantastic poster of Richard Nixon that morphs as the viewer unfolds the paper, transforming him into a goblin-like creature - figs. 13a-d. Here, the unconventional folding of the poster is crucial to its meaning and visual effect. Lastly, questions about the social modality of the circulation of the OSPAAAL posters are especially important as they tie into questions about the social modality of their production. OSPAAAL, as an organisation, was largely responsible for their circulation, but why they were circulated is inseparably linked to why they were created. Namely, to generate support and solidarity for the Tricontinental Movement and its politics.

The Site of Audiencing

This site is associated with how an image is displayed and where (technological modality), its viewing positions and relation to other texts (compositional modality), and how it is interpreted, by whom and why (social modality) (Rose, 2016, pp. 38-46). It is also the site associated with reception. Although it would be valuable to research the reception of the

African series of OSPAAAL posters, determining where they were displayed, who their audiences were and how they were interpreted is beyond the scope of this project. Their international distribution, the ease with which they could be moved, and their ephemerality mean that addressing this aspect of the posters is not practical or feasible.

Other areas of visual research encounter similar problems, but particularly research on political posters. Perhaps unsurprisingly, it is a relatively understudied aspect of political poster research. That said, discussions regarding the social modality of the site of audiencing - how images are interpreted, by whom and why - are common. Whalen (2013) and Philipps (2015), for example, analyse the practice of defacing political posters in Afghanistan and Germany respectively. Although their research focuses on the site of the image, they begin by considering how the local population and the people doing the defacing initially received and interpreted the posters. Thus, the site of audiencing is not altogether absent in political poster research.

Although I do not address this site in the analysis, I can still consider questions of audiencing. As Mor (2019, p. 50) remarks of the Tricontinental Magazine, 'while it is always difficult to speak directly to the question of reception, it is notable that archives of leftist political parties and organizations around the world still contain sizeable collections of issues and that references to its articles and reprints of its photographs and images feature prominently in the circulation of news stories of many leftist organs'. For example, the OSPAAAL posters were evidently regarded as worth collecting by a number of individuals and institutions. Of particular note are the private collections of Lincoln Cushing and Mike Stanfield. However, beyond private collections, OSPAAAL posters also appear in archives around the world, such as the José Martí National Library in Havana, the Hoover Institution and the Bancroft Library in California, the Lindsay Webster Collection of Cuban Posters at Wofford College in South Carolina, the Victoria and Albert Museum in London, the Dulwich Poster Gallery, also in London, and the International Institute of Social History in Amsterdam, to name only a few. They have also been published in books, such as *The Art of Revolution* by Dugald Stermer, *The Tricontinental Solidarity Poster* by Richard Frick and *¡Revolución! Cuban Poster Art* by Lincoln Cushing; and exhibited in galleries and museums, such as *Designed in Cuba: Cold War Graphics* at the House of Illustration in London, *The OSPAAAL Posters Show* at the Kemistry Gallery, again in London, and *Art of Solidarity* at the International Slavery Museum in Liverpool.

The attraction of these posters appears to vary, but the commonly cited explanations centre around their aesthetic or historical value. Mike Tyler (2017), for example, owns thirty-two OSPAAAL posters and states:

> Many collectors are interested in the politics whilst some have an affinity with Cuba. For me, the appeal is their artistic merit, which has long been revered in the world of both propaganda art and graphic design.

Interestingly, the differences in how they are interpreted as a collection of posters is often reflected in the different contexts in which they are archived and displayed. For example, in the exhibition at the International Slavery Museum in Liverpool the posters were described as 'a form of social and political resistance, designed to support freedom movements around the world' and '[highlighting] some of the liberation and independence movements that swept through Africa after the Second World War'. Whereas in the exhibition at the House of Illustration in London more emphasis was placed on their artistic style, design and value as propaganda art. On occasion the OSPAAAL posters take centre stage in these various exhibitions, archives and books, but more often they form part of broader collections that further frame their interpretation. For example, many are part of collections on Cuban art or graphics, while others focus on radical or socialist posters from Latin America (see Davidson *et al.*, 2006) or around the world (see Wells *et al.*, 1996).

As a researcher studying the posters, I am also a site of audiencing. Obviously, my impression of the OSPAAAL posters is one of many possible interpretations and it is important to be aware of my positionality as a researcher - discussed further later in this chapter. Nevertheless, it is worth stating that like several of the collectors mentioned above I was initially drawn to Cuban poster art by the bright, bold and colourful designs associated with its pop art aesthetic. My attention was then directed to the OSPAAAL posters in particular owing to the transnational politics of the Tricontinental Movement. On a personal note, I like them for their ability to say so much while hardly saying anything at all and for their seeming refusal to fit into any 'box' - whether that be political or aesthetic.

It should be noted that these four sites are not as discrete as Rose's framework might suggest. Rose (2016, p. 26) herself states that 'the fact that all three modalities are found at all four sites, though, does suggest that the distinctions between sites are less clear than my sections

[…] here might imply'. For example, Cushing (2003, p. 14) comments that the use of 'flat colour' in Cuban poster art was partly due to the technical limitations of silk-screen stencils - linking the technological modality of production to the technological modality of the site of the image, 'how it was made' to 'its visual effects'. As mentioned, the social modality of the site of production and the site of circulation of the OSPAAAL posters was inseparably linked. There are also connections between their genre - the compositional modality of production - and how they were interpreted, by whom and why - the social modality of audiencing; and between who made them - the social modality of production - and the imagery used - the compositional modality of the image itself. Accordingly, while Rose's framework offers a way of thinking about different approaches to images and visual research, it should not constrain analysis to any one site or modality.

Methods of Analysis in Political Poster Research

Visual research draws from a large number of disciplines, is often interdisciplinary and seemingly has a propensity for approaching subjects from new and unusual angles. As a result, there are numerous methods of visual analysis and very little consensus on which methods are used when. However, turning to other research on political posters, it is possible to delineate a few commonalities. Firstly, that qualitative methods are more common than quantitative methods.

Although the majority of political poster research adopts a qualitative approach, there are four notable examples that use quantitative or mixed methods. These are Vliegenthart's (2012) longitudinal study of Dutch election campaign posters between 1946 and 2006, which uses a statistical analysis of the visual and textual characteristics of the posters; Dymarczyk's (2014) comparative study of Polish and Soviet war posters from 1919-1921, which uses a form of grounded theory adapted to visual data to code and analyse similarities and differences; Lee and Campbell's (2016) study of the persuasive and organisational roles of political campaign posters on Facebook, which uses a statistical analysis akin to Vliegenthart's but with different variables; and Marquart *et al.*'s (2016) and Matthes *et al.*'s (2016) studies of selective exposure to political posters, which use eye-tracking technology.

Vliegenthart's (2012) and Lee and Campbell's (2016) studies are of particular interest as they both work with large numbers of posters - 225 and 2,447, respectively. Indeed, many have highlighted the advantages of using quantitative methods when working with large amounts of data as they enable researchers to see patterns that might otherwise be overlooked (see, for example, Bock *et al.*, 2012; and Rose, 2016). Vliegenthart's (2012) and Lee and Campbell's (2016) statistical analyses both involve a content analysis that seeks to identify aspects of the posters related to their research questions. For example, Vliegenthart's (2012, p. 142) study into the professionalisation of political communication asks, 'does the poster contain a party logo, or is the name of the party portrayed in a stylized manner?' and 'does the poster contain an image of the party leader?'. In each study the content analysis is used as the basis of the statistical analysis, which informs a qualitative discussion about the patterns that emerged. These studies highlight the value of quantitative methods in political poster research, especially where large numbers of posters are concerned.

Of the qualitative methods used in political poster research, iconography and semiotics are by far the most commonly cited. Iconography is mentioned by Berk (2015), James (2009), Maasri (2009; 2012), Philipps (2015), Schembs (2013) and Whalen (2013), a number of whom also mention the seminal text *Iconography of Power: Soviet Political Posters under Lenin and Stalin* by Bonnell (1997). Interestingly, iconography, and its derivations such as iconology and iconographic analysis, are used to refer to different research methods. As Müller (2011, p. 283) explains, since its origin in the sixteenth century as a tool for categorising the visual motifs of paintings, iconography has developed into an art history method and a more general approach to visual research. These are discussed in detail below.

The other commonly cited methodological influence in political poster research is semiotics. 'Semiotics (from Greek, *sēmeion*, 'sign') is the study of signs' (Nöth, 2011, p. 298). It is a transdisciplinary field that is based on the work of Charles Peirce and Ferdinand de Saussure, two linguists who explored how languages convey meaning and how that meaning is interpreted. Peirce's and Saussure's work has since been adapted to visual systems of representation, most notably by Roland Barthes and Umberto Eco (Sturken and Cartwright, 2001, p. 28). Broadly speaking, visual semiotics is based on the notion of images as akin to language, composed of signs where the signifier (the image) and signified (the concept evoked by that image) together form meaning (Sturken and Cartwright, 2001; Van Leeuwen, 2001).

As noted at the outset of this chapter, this is a common way of conceptualising images in visual research.

Semiotics is mentioned by several scholars, including Dabbous *et al*. (2010), James (2009), Jones (2014), Maasri (2009; 2012), Miner (2011), Mizsei-Ward (2012) and Whalen (2013). However, only Maasri (2009) provides an explanation of how semiotics influenced her research. The other texts either refer briefly to a semiotic analysis, for example Dabbous *et al*. (2010); or use the term to refer to the characteristics of the posters, for example:

> Like all representations, posters have a life history. […] I want to offer an interpretation of some of these documents first in terms of a semiotics of solidarity. (James, 2009, p. 38)

> It speaks for the powerful semiotic appeal of the Joker image that it should have been used to deride and malign both Republican and Democratic presidents. (Mizsei-Ward, 2012, p. 180)

In contrast, Maasri (2009) uses Stuart Hall's model of encoding and decoding, which is ground in semiotic approaches to language and representation, and explains in detail how Barthes' work has informed Hall's model. Thus, not unlike iconography, semiotics is used in political poster research to refer to both a method and an approach.

Although semiotics is a commonly cited methodological influence in political poster research, this research uses iconography to analyse the African series of OSPAAAL posters. This is primarily due to its contextual element, which is discussed in greater detail in the following sections. As van Leeuwen (2001, p. 117) explains, 'Barthian visual semiotics remains restricted to textual arguments, at least insofar as its explicit conceptual apparatus is concerned, whereas iconography also uses arguments based on intertextual comparison and archival background research'. I am therefore using iconography partly in recognition that I am in many ways temporally and spatially removed from the original context of the transnational Left during the Cold War. Segal (2016, p. 8) notes that 'iconography […] reconstructs historical meaning that is for us no longer self-evident or even comprehensible, because social, religious or cultural changes have disentangled the relation between image and traditional interpretation'. This contextual element makes iconography better placed to assess what the

African series of OSPAAAL posters conveys about the role of Africa in the Tricontinental Movement.

Iconography, the Study of Images

Iconography - from the Greek *eikonographia*, meaning 'sketch' or 'description' - is the study of images (D'Alleva, 2012, p. 19). Originally devised as a tool for categorising the visual motifs of sixteenth-century artworks, it was first modernised by the art and cultural historian Aby Warburg at the beginning of the twentieth century. It was then later refined by Erwin Panofsky, an art historian who popularised it as a method of visual analysis in the 1950s and 1960s (Müller, 2011, p. 283). Warburg and Panofsky were concerned with what they perceived as too great a preoccupation with the formal qualities of art, such as composition, material and colour. Panofsky (2009, p. 220) described iconography as 'that branch of the history of art which concerns itself with the subject matter or meaning of works of art, as opposed to their form'. Thus, iconography developed in response to theories of formalism in art history, focusing instead on the content, meaning and context of artworks (Burke, 2001, pp. 34-35; Preziosi, 2009, pp. 217-218; D'Alleva, 2012, pp. 16-20).

Panofsky delineated iconography as a method in the introduction to *Studies in Iconology: Humanistic Themes in the Art of the Renaissance* (Panofsky, 1939). However, though often associated with Panofsky's method, iconography also refers to a more general approach to visual research. Burke (2001, p. 36), for example, states:

> Readers should be warned that later art historians who have taken over the term 'iconology' have sometimes employed it in different ways from Panofsky. For Ernst Gombrich, for instance, the term refers to the reconstruction of a pictorial programme […]. For the Dutch scholar Eddy de Jongh, iconology is 'an attempt to explain representations in their historical context, in relation to other cultural phenomena'.

Similarly, Müller (2011, pp. 284, 285) lists several examples of scholars from the early to mid-twentieth century that used iconography as an approach; but concludes that 'the legacy of the iconographic-iconological founders is to apply iconography as a critical, analytical, and transdisciplinary method with a bifocal perspective - focusing on the visual aspects of contemporary problems in politics, society, and culture, reflected in the lens of thorough

historical comparison'. Moreover, the origins and history of iconography help to illuminate its contemporary use as a method and an approach in visual research.

Iconography as a Method

Iconography is most commonly used as a method within the canon of art history (see, for example, D'Alleva, 2012, pp. 19-26). As a method, Müller (2011, p. 285) describes it as 'a qualitative method of visual content analysis and interpretation, influenced by cultural traditions and guided by research interests originating both in the humanities and the social sciences'. Outlined by Panofsky in 1939, it works to deconstruct the layers of denotation, connotation and contextual meaning in images in order to explore their subject matter (Preziosi, 2009, pp. 217-218). It is comprised of three levels of analysis. The first focuses on the primary subject matter, the elements that constitute the image. As Howells and Negreiros (2019, p. 36) explain, 'to understand the meaning at this primary level, we do not need any inside cultural, conventional or art historical knowledge'. The second focuses on the conventional subject matter, the culturally shared visual signs and connotations. To use Panofsky's (2009, p. 222) example, we recognise that a group of people seated at a dinner table in a certain arrangement represents The Last Supper. The third focuses on the intrinsic meaning of the image with regard to its social, political and historical context. This level of analysis can shed light on the basic attitude of a nation, a period, a class, or a religious or philosophical persuasion (Panofsky, 2009, p. 222). At this third level of analysis Panofsky differentiated between iconography and iconology. Although often used interchangeably, Panofsky (2009, pp. 223-224) described this third level of analysis as iconology and the method as a whole as iconography.

> For as the suffix 'graphy' denotes something descriptive, so does the suffix 'logy' - derived from *logos*, which means 'thought' or 'reason' - denote something interpretative. […] Iconology, then, is a method of interpretation which arises from synthesis rather than analysis.

Where the analogy of images as a visual language is used, the primary and conventional subject matter is imagined as akin to words and sentences and the intrinsic meaning of the image as akin to the meaning imparted from a text as a whole (Van Leeuwen, 2001; Rose, 2016, p. 201).

Panofsky (2009, p. 228) was careful to note that while he described the three levels of analysis separately, 'in actual work, the methods of approach which here appear as three unrelated operations of research merge with each other into one organic and indivisible process'. Thus, as Preziosi (2009, p. 218) summarises, 'Panofsky's 'iconographic analysis' became a method for correlating visual imagery with other (principally textual) cultural information'. Or, as Müller (2011, p. 286) artfully explains, it is at heart a forensic method, '[taking] on the form of a detective story, in which various threads are woven together to gain a full picture of a given period and its visual reproduction'. It therefore analyses the site of the image itself, particularly its compositional and social modalities, but while taking into consideration the sites of production, circulation and audiencing as part of the third level of contextual analysis. Of course, iconography as outlined by Panofsky is based on the premise that meaning exists in the image and that this meaning can be determined by careful and thorough analysis. As discussed, this approach to images and meaning is problematic. In addition, Burke (2001, p. 41) notes that there are dangers in assuming that an image expresses 'the spirit of the age', warning that the images in any given period are never homogeneous. D'Alleva (2012, p. 21) also notes that many art historians have questioned if it is possible to view an image without preconceptions, as per the first level of analysis, or with sufficient contextual knowledge, as per the third level of analysis.

Iconography as an Approach

As a conceptual approach, iconography refers to a way of thinking about and interpreting images that stems from Warburg's as opposed to Panofsky's work. Warburg was strongly opposed to the notion of disciplinary boundaries and expanded the scope of art history by including images irrespective of their artistic value. Thus, iconography in the Warburg tradition is associated with a wide range of visual materials and transdisciplinary influences, such as history and cultural history, psychology, comparative religious studies, and even Charles Darwin's biological approach to the study of emotions (Müller, 2011, pp. 284-285, 288). As Preziosi (2009, p. 218) observes, ''iconography' came […] to be a generic term for the study of visual subject matter, guided by an assumption that every image 'contained' a certain amount of hidden or 'symbolic' matter that could be elicited by a close reading of the image and some knowledge of the referential context of the work'.

In contrast to Panofsky's method, iconography as an approach varies considerably. That said, it has two main forms: as a study of the icons in images and as a study of the systems of representation in images. At the outset of *Iconology: Image, Text, Ideology*, Mitchell (1986, p. 1) describes iconology as 'a study of the "logos" (the words, ideas, discourse, or "science") of "icons" (images, pictures, or likenesses)'. Bonnell's (1997) often cited *Iconography of Power: Soviet Political Posters under Lenin and Stalin*, for example, focuses on icons - those of the worker, women, the leader, and internal and external enemies. Other examples include Hansen's (2015) research on international icons and the case of Abu Ghraib, and James' (2009) *Picture This: World War I Posters and Visual Culture*. Beyond the arts and humanities and social sciences, iconography as a study of icons has also appeared in the natural sciences. Two notable examples are Manzo's (2010) and Grittmann's (2014) work on the iconography of climate change, which examine climate change images in contemporary media campaigns and discourses.

Iconography as a study of the systems of representation in images is an approach to visual research that overlaps with semiotics. In this approach, the emphasis is placed on understanding the gap between what is represented and how we recognise what is represented. Parallels are drawn between Roland Barthes' denotative signifiers and signified and connotative meaning or 'myths', and Panofsky's primary and secondary levels of analysis (Rose, 2016, p. 201). For van Leeuwen (2001, p. 92), for example, semiotics and iconography ask the same two fundamental questions, 'the question of representation (what do images represent and how?) and the question of the 'hidden meanings' of images (what ideas and values do the people, places and things represented in images stand for?)'.

Beyond these two main forms of iconography as an approach, Müller (2011, p. 288) notes that there are others who simply use iconography as a classification tool or system to categorise the content of images - a descriptive approach that essentially stops short of Panofsky's iconological level of analysis. Also of note is Gillian Rose (2016) who aligns an iconographic approach with discourse analysis.

Iconography and Political Poster Research

Although traditionally applied to sixteenth-century European paintings, an increasingly inclusive and interdisciplinary approach to art history has seen iconography applied to subject matter other than 'high art'. Van Leeuwen (2001, pp. 92-94, 102), for example, makes a case for using iconography to study contemporary and even abstract images. While Howells and Negreiros (2019, pp. 39-42) apply it to an analysis of The Beatles' *Abbey Road* album cover; and D'Alleva (2012, pp. 23-26), a South Asian sculpture that depicts the Hindu goddess Durga slaying the demon Mahisha. Especially relevant to this research are studies using iconography to examine political posters and the German tradition of *Politische Ikonographie*.

Hence, though political posters would have traditionally fallen outside the remit of iconographical and art history research, iconography is now a commonly cited influence in research on political posters. For example, it is mentioned by Berk (2015), James (2009), Maasri (2009; 2012), Philipps (2015), Schembs (2013) and Whalen (2013). Interestingly, only Philipps (2015) uses iconography in a manner akin to Panofsky's method. In order to explore the defacement of election posters as a form of visual protest in the German federal election in 2005, Philipps uses 'visual documentary interpretation'. This process is inspired by Panofsky's method and separated into three stages: pre-iconographic, iconographic and reflecting interpretation, which reflect Panofsky's three levels of analysis. The remaining research noted above applies iconography as an approach that echoes W.J.T. Mitchell's work, focusing on the 'icons' of various poster traditions. Schembs (2013), for example, discusses the icon of 'the worker' in Peronist Argentinean posters, noting the differences and similarities with earlier iconographic traditions in Argentina. Similarly, John M. Kinder (2009) in James' edited volume explores 'the iconography of injury' and how wounded bodies were portrayed in World War I posters.

Also of note is the German tradition of *Politische Ikonographie*, detailed by Müller (2011, pp. 289-292). This iconographic approach is based on a revival of Warburg's work by the German art historian Martin Warnke and is concerned with politics in the widest sense. Although it has largely gone unnoticed by the non-German-speaking academic community, this body of scholarship offers valuable examples as to the potential of iconography when applied to political research. For example, Müller and Özcan (2007) explore the political iconography of

the Danish cartoons of the Prophet Muhammad that sparked international controversy in 2006.

An Iconographic Analysis

Although there are areas of overlap, this research project recognises iconography as a method and iconography as an approach as two distinct tools in visual research. While it is sensitive to iconographic traditions, its principal aim is not to analyse the African series of OSPAAAL posters as per an iconographic approach - as a study of icons or system of representation. Rather, it explores what the African series of OSPAAAL posters conveys about the role of Africa in the Tricontinental Movement. Thus, differing from the majority of the research on political posters that cites iconography, it adopts Panofsky's method.

Panofsky's three levels of analysis in effect provide a framework through which to examine the layers of denotation, connotation and contextual meaning in the posters. As D'Alleva (2012, p. 23) notes, it can be helpful to work through these three levels in turn even though the findings would not be presented as such. The effect is to force the viewer to look carefully at the image, 'to examine it actively - in detail - rather than simply 'seeing' it in passing' (Howells and Negreiros, 2019, p. 28). In practice, this involved printing postcard-sized reproductions of the posters and affixing them inside an A4 notebook. This produced a small physical copy of the African series of OSPAAAL posters with space for annotations. The annotations for each level of analysis were colour-coded, creating a layered analysis of each poster that worked through the layers of denotation, connotation and contextual meaning - see, for example, figs. 14, 15, 16 and 17. Although this use of pen and paper is somewhat 'low-tech', I find the tactile nature of working in this way valuable in creative processes such as visual interpretation. Interestingly, though I set about the analysis via Panofsky's three levels, they began to blur together and overlap as many scholars have noted (see, for example, D'Alleva, 2012; Müller, 2011; and Panofsky, 1939). Furthermore, I found myself repeatedly revisiting the posters in order to consider different aspects, such as their historical context or aesthetic dimensions, which resulted in multiple layers of the third level of analysis.

As the African series of OSPAAAL posters comprises eighty-eight posters, a rough content analysis was incorporated into the first level of iconographic analysis. As noted earlier, content

analyses are a useful way of identifying common or recurring themes when working with large numbers of images. It also provided a helpful 'starting point' from which to begin the analysis. Panofsky's method requires a thorough background knowledge of the images in question, specifically the cultural, social and political context in which the images were produced, circulated and viewed. As Rose (2016, p. 198) explains, '[it] requires a grasp of the historically specific intertextuality on which meaning depends'. As I was not a part of the Third World Left during the Cold War, it was especially important that I familiarise myself with the relevant political history and poster traditions of that period. Hence, although this research centres on the African series of OSPAAAL posters, many more images and sources, including the wider collection of OSPAAAL posters, inform the iconographic analysis.

Although this research adopts Panofsky's method, it borrows from 'iconography as an approach' in two ways. Firstly, it builds on its tradition of applying iconography to a wide range of visual materials outside 'high art' and its openness to interdisciplinary and transdisciplinary research. Secondly, it is sensitive to the use of icons in poster designs. Cushing (2003, p. 15), regarding Cuban posters, states:

> Many posters use commonly understood visual shorthand to express their subject. Icons include Uncle Sam, the imperial eagle, the dollar sign, continental shapes, stylized flags, and machetes.

For example, figs. 18 and 19 use chains to symbolise oppression and links to slavery. Thus, an awareness and understanding of these icons is an important part of Panofsky's second and third levels of analysis that consider the connotative and contextual meaning of the image.

It is also important to note that iconography primarily addresses 'what images mean' (Bann, 2009, p. 259; Burke, 2001, p. 41). That is, the visibility of Callahan's visibility/visuality dyad. While the theoretical framework provides the tools to consider the visuality of the African series of OSPAAAL posters - what they 'do' - iconography enables this research to address their visibility. In reality, the distinction is not so clear cut - insights gleaned from the iconographic analysis speak to the visuality of the posters and vice versa. However, it is still important to be aware that iconography is concerned with the meaning of images and therefore the first part of the research question.

Archives and Fieldwork

Hence, the first step was to identify archives, libraries and institutions that had collections of posters, graphic art, political art and propaganda, focusing on the 1960-1980s but broadly from the twentieth century. Although the African series of OSPAAAL posters was produced between 1967 and 1987, it was important that I look beyond this period to gain a sense of the visual context in which they were created. Of course, the principal archive was Lincoln Cushing's OSPAAAL poster archive; however, I also explored Cushing's general catalogue of Cuban posters, OSPAAAL's poster index, the International Institute of Social History's collections of posters and visual materials, the Lindsay Webster collection of Cuban posters, and the Cuban poster collection at the Bancroft Library, among others, all available to view online. In addition, I attended any exhibitions that I could reasonably travel to, such as *Designed in Cuba: Cold War Graphics* at the House of Illustration in London and *Art of Solidarity* at the National Slavery Museum in Liverpool; and sought out printed materials such as *Slanted #21: CUBA - The New Generation, ¡Revolución! Cuban Poster Art* by Lincoln Cushing, *Latin America Posters: Public Aesthetics and Mass Politics* edited by Russ Davidson, *Posters of the Cold War* by David Crowley and *Propaganda Prints* by Colin Moore.

The fieldwork comprised two trips to Cuba during which I visited several key institutions, exploring their collections, events and exhibitions. These included *La Biblioteca Nacional de José Martí*, *El Museo Nacional de Bellas Artes*, *La Casa de África*, *La Casa de las Américas*, *El Centro Hispanoamericano de Cultura*, *El Instituto Cubano de Amistad*, and OSPAAAL, *Editora Politica* and *El Instituto Cubano del Arte e Industria Cinematográficos*, the main poster producing organisations in Cuba. Through these various archival, visual and cultural resources, I began to develop my background knowledge of the political and artistic context in which the African series of OSPAAAL posters were created. Specifically, with a view to the second and third levels of Panofsky's iconographic analysis.

Subjectivity and Ethics

Visual research is not without its complexities. As Stanczak (2007, p. 4) notes, 'moving the image both figuratively and literally into social scientific research has epistemological implications that raise widely applicable questions of validity, subjectivity, and rapport'.

Spencer (2011, p. 2), for example, observes that while we perceive language as a precise form of communication, there is a sense that images are less reliable as a means of conveying simple messages. As discussed, the African series of OSPAAAL posters is open to multiple interpretations. Indeed, the interpretation of images is innately subjective.

However, subjectivity is a key element of iconography. An iconographic analysis is informed by the background knowledge, experience and interpretation of the researcher. At the primary level, only a basic 'practical experience' is required (Panofsky, 2009, p. 220); but at the second and third levels of analysis, a knowledge of the cultural, social and political context and a degree of intuitive synthesis is required. To return to Panofsky's (2009, p. 225) example, an Australian bushman unfamiliar with sixteenth-century European paintings is unlikely to recognise *The Last Supper* by Leonardo da Vinci as anything other than 'an excited dinner party'. Equally, any European unfamiliar with Aboriginal art is unlikely to understand the cultural significance of the symbols and icons used in indigenous Australian paintings. Thus, iconography is a subjective method of visual analysis, which has the potential to be its strength and weakness.

This raises the need to be conscious of my part in the analysis and aware that my positionality as the researcher reflects a certain distribution of the sensible. However, it is not simply a matter of noting and eliminating bias in order to restore positivist objectivity (Banks, 2007, pp. 50-51). Indeed, there is no such easy remedy. The question of subjectivity lies at the centre of epistemological debates between qualitative and quantitative practices and subjective and positivist methods (Stanczak, 2007, p. 7). Collier (2001, p. 59) argues that visual research is both an art and a science and 'it is both necessary and legitimate to allow ourselves to respond artistically or intuitively to visual images in research'. This research therefore adopts a reflexive approach, '[recognising] the centrality of the subjectivity of the researcher to the production of […] knowledge' (Pink, 2001, p. 19). For example, the gravitational centres around which my own experience and worldview revolve are far removed from the context of the Cold War and the Third World - temporally, spatially and epistemologically. This made the many layers of the iconographic analysis invaluable, as I could reflect on any judgements I had made as part of the interpretation of each poster.

The ethical considerations of archival research that does not involve participants or photographs of people are typically minimal. In this regard, this research is no exception. However, Bleiker (2009, p. 10) cautions that 'aesthetics, politics and ethics can, in fact, be seen as inevitably intertwined'. His concern is that in seeking to open up alternative approaches to the study of world politics, such research faces the potentially problematic consequence of also moving away from established ethical principles that are bound up in traditional ways of knowing. As opposed to dispensing with ethics, Bleiker (2009, p. 12) advocates embracing the idea that 'ethics, then, becomes a mode of being rather than a set of principles'. This is echoed by Rose (2016, p. 371) who notes that while the language of 'rights' and the assumptions that inhere in it are central to modernist ethics, many visual researchers are calling for alternative forms of ethics. For example - and especially relevant to this research - an ethics of recognition. Copyright, as a concept and legal right, is linked to the development of capitalism and individual and intellectual property rights in Europe and the United States. It does not easily 'translate' to socialist contexts, such as Cuba. Indeed, many examples of Cuban art are unsigned or anonymous, created for the greater social good. However, in this research care has been taken to address image permissions and credit artists wherever possible in order to afford recognition and embody ethics as a way of doing research.

Thus, this methodology is firmly grounded in visual research practices, adopting Callahan's (2020) visibility / visuality dyad to explore 'what images mean' and 'what images do'. While Rose's (2016) 'critical visual methodology' offers a framework to examine the African series of OSPAAAL posters as 'sites of research', Panofsky's (2009) iconography provides the scaffolding for the analysis. The following analysis chapters are a direct product of the theoretical framework and methodology outlined thus far and begin by considering Garland Mahler's (2018) premise that colour acted as a metonymic political signifier in Tricontinentalist texts.

Chapter Four: Africa and the Tricontinental Movement

As detailed in chapter one, the Tricontinental Movement emerged in the 1960s following the Tricontinental Conference in January 1966 in Havana, Cuba. Although its inception was rooted in the struggles of the peoples of Africa, Asia and Latin America, it quickly became a global solidarity movement whose influence and activities extended beyond the three continents. Focusing specifically on anti-black racism and the African diaspora, it recognised imperialism and racial oppression as interlinked and sought to oppose them as part of a worldwide revolution. This chapter analyses the African series of OSPAAAL posters apropos Garland Mahler's premise that colour acted as a metonymic political signifier in Tricontinentalist texts. It begins by examining how various currents in oppositional political thought came together to form the Tricontinental Movement, before considering the posters themselves. Although it finds that the African series of OSPAAAL posters does not support Garland Mahler's premise, the analysis hints at the influence of Cuba's post-revolutionary racial politics and other ways in which the posters potentially disrupted the sensible of the Cold War.

The Tricontinental Movement is often accredited to the Tricontinental Conference. Certainly, the conference precipitated the formation of OSPAAAL - the mouthpiece of the Tricontinental Movement - and brought together the ideas and ideals that ultimately shaped the movement. However, both the movement and the conference were products of earlier events, politics and currents in oppositional political thought. By and large, the 1960s are remembered as a decade notable for its social activism and political unrest (Christiansen and Scarlett, 2013b; Elbaum, 2018; Fink *et al.*, 1998; Marchesi, 2017). The year 1968, in particular, is often noted as a flashpoint in a decade of radical politics. For example, the Prague Spring in Czechoslovakia and the May '68 protests throughout France. Focusing on the United States, Elbaum (2018, p. 1) states:

> During the first four months of 1968, the Vietnamese Tet offensive ended Washington's hopes of victory in Southeast Asia, incumbent President Lyndon Johnson was forced to abandon his re-election bid, Martin Luther King was assassinated, and Black rebellions erupted in more than 100 cities. Flames reached within six blocks of the White House; 70,000 troops had to be called up across the country to restore order. These jolts punctuated a decade of civil rights organizing, anti-war protests, cultural ferment and youth rebellion that shook the entire country.

However, this narrative reflects a history written from the Global North. In Africa, the 1960s were framed by decolonisation and armed struggle for national sovereignty. Furthermore, political unrest in the Global South influenced social activism in the Global North and vice versa (Dirlik, 2013; Marchesi, 2017, p. 5). Thus, the decade as a whole, including the Tricontinental Conference in Havana in 1966, shaped the international politics of the Cold War. Nonetheless, akin to any key moment in history, it is best understood in light of earlier events - beginning here with the Bandung Conference in 1955.

From Bandung to the Tricontinental

The Bandung Conference took place in April 1955 in Bandung, Indonesia. Organised by India, Indonesia, Ceylon, Burma and Pakistan, it was attended by representatives of almost all of Asia and independent Africa. In total, twenty-nine countries from Africa and Asia were represented there[5], with the addition of two African American invitees from the United States[6], the African National Congress from South Africa as an observer and, though not yet independent, Cyprus (Acharya, 2016; Young, 2005). As Young (2005, p. 11) notes, the Bandung Conference is routinely emphasised as 'the seminal moment in the political formation of postcoloniality'. Indeed, it is often framed as the precursor to the Afro-Asian Peoples' Solidarity Organisation, the Non-Aligned Movement, OSPAAAL, the Tricontinental Conference and the Tricontinental Movement (Eslava *et al.*, 2017, pp. 12-13; Gronbeck-Tedesco, 2008, pp. 653, 659; 2015, p. 200; Young, 2005). Acharya (2016) similarly argues that it was key to the formation of the post-war international order, informing emergent norms regarding anti-colonialism, decolonisation, national sovereignty, universalism, human rights and regionalism in South-East Asia. Although political movements rarely stem from a single moment, Lee (2019, pp. xvi-xvii) asserts that events - such as the Bandung Conference - can act as loci where contemporary currents of thought are articulated and consolidated.

[5] Afghanistan, Burma, Cambodia, Ceylon, China, Egypt, Ethiopia, Gold Coast, India, Indonesia, Iran, Iraq, Japan, Jordan, Laos, Lebanon, Liberia, Libya, Nepal, Pakistan, the Philippines, Saudi Arabia, Syria, Sudan, Thailand, Turkey, the Democratic Republic of Vietnam, the State of Vietnam and the Kingdom of Yemen.

[6] Congressman Adam Clayton Powell of Harlem, New York and the novelist Richard Wright.

The majority of the attendees at Bandung were bonded by a shared post-colonial condition and it was this that set the tone of the conference (Gronbeck-Tedesco, 2008, p. 659; Young, 2005, p. 12). Although decolonisation had occurred and was still occurring at a different pace across Asia and Africa, the nations in attendance sought to discuss issues such as independence, sovereignty and non-intervention. However, as Eslava *et al.* (2017, p. 7) write:

> The agenda was not only about asserting independence against an imperialist past and present; it was also about facing an uncertain future. The stakes of peace and cooperation were nothing less than the fear of global nuclear war and the sedimentation of a reloaded, international structure that could be used, once again, against the interests of the Global South.

Despite fears in 'the West', Bandung was not anti-Western, pro-Soviet or pro-Chinese (Acharya, 2016); rather, as Gronbeck-Tedesco (2008, p. 659) observes, 'the conference created a staging ground for non-aligned nations to seek an alternative order to the bivalent East-West and to narrow the gap between the North and South'. This disrupted the political sensibilities of the Cold War by actively imagining an alternative 'third way'. In the main, attendees were keen to avoid the dualistic power struggle of the Cold War and proposed a non-violent way forward based on mutual support, cooperation and Afro-Asian solidarity - but one that also recognised and respected national independence and sovereignty (Mišković, 2014; Young, 2005, p. 12; Young, 2006, pp. 1-2). Thus, the conference focused on matters of economics, race and nation-building, and the problems of postcolonialism, uneven development, global racism, war and nuclear proliferation (Gronbeck-Tedesco, 2008, pp. 653, 659). These discussions formed the basis of what is commonly referred to as 'the spirit of Bandung' (see Eslava *et al.*, 2017, p. 6; and Rodriguez, 2006), used to indicate 'a method of international diplomacy' or 'a "feeling" of Third World solidarity' (Garland Mahler, 2018, p. 60).

The Bandung Conference is widely regarded as the precursor to the Afro-Asian Peoples' Solidarity Organisation (AAPSO), which later gave rise to OSPAAAL. Founded in December 1957 in Cairo, Egypt, AAPSO was an alliance of seventy-five organisations from across Africa and Asia (Garland Mahler, 2018, pp. 22, 60). Broadly, it sought to garner support for national liberation movements in Asia and Africa and continued the Bandung spirit (Mor, 2019, pp. 55-57). However, in contrast to Bandung, AAPSO is generally considered to have been more

'communist-aligned'. It also welcomed and made visible nongovernmental organisations and representatives from national liberation movements as well as official heads of state - a divergence from the Bandung Conference that would continue through to the Tricontinental Conference in 1966 (Garland Mahler, 2018, pp. 23, 73-74; Lee, 2019, p. 17).

The Non-Aligned Movement

As Young (2005, p. 12) remarks, 'to credit Bandung with the formation of the Non-Aligned Movement is true in spirit, though not in fact'. As discussed, the general idea of non-alignment was present at the Bandung Conference in April 1955. The attending nations from Asia and Africa had been keen to retain their newly acquired independence and felt that staying out of the superpowers' ideological orbits was an effective means of doing so. However, at the time, this did not translate into the formation of a unified alternative bloc; rather, the focus had been on independence, sovereignty, mutual respect and solidarity (Acharya, 2016; Young, 2005, p. 13; 2018, p. 517).

The Non-Aligned Movement (NAM) was formed in Belgrade, Yugoslavia in 1961. It represented formerly colonised nations that 'sought to resist both global capitalism and expansive communism and promote political independence as a third bloc' (Mor, 2019, p. 46). Scholarship on the movement is surprisingly scarce given its role as an international actor, influence on the United Nations and role in broadening the community of actors participating in international politics (Dinkel, 2019, pp. 1-2; Mišković, 2014, p. 1; Mor, 2019, p. 46). Furthermore, it is often discussed as a relic of the Cold War when in actuality its membership has grown year on year and it still meets to this day. Its last summit was in Azerbaijan in October 2019 and after the United Nations it is the largest international organisation of states with approximately one hundred and twenty members (Dinkel, 2019, pp. 1, 5; Muhammad-Bande, 2019).

The first summit at Belgrade in 1961 was organised by the then leaders of India, Egypt and Yugoslavia, Jawaharlal Nehru, Gamal Abdel Nasser and Josip Broz Tito, and attended by twenty-five participating countries and three observer delegations (Dinkel, 2019, p. 100). Nehru, Nasser and Tito, often celebrated as the fathers of the NAM, conceptualised non-alignment as 'active neutrality which did not keep quiet and passive in international politics'

(Mišković, 2014, p. 7). In essence, the NAM aspired to be 'a statement of disarmament, against the escalation of the Cold War' (Mišković, 2014, p. 7); and 'a third force within world affairs outside the respective orbits of the Western and Soviet blocs, in which the newly decolonised nations sought to establish an international political, economic and ideological identity, distinct from those of the capitalist West and the communist East' (Young, 2005, p. 11). How successful the movement has been in the intervening years is not my focus here - for this, see Dinkel (2019); rather, it is to note that the NAM formed part of the ideological foundation of the Tricontinental Movement.

The Third World in the United States

As the Bandung Conference, AAPSO and NAM began to draw together recently decolonised countries and anti-colonial sentiment across Africa and Asia, the West took note. As Christiansen and Scarlett (2013a, p. 1) remark in the opening to their volume:

> The shadow of the Third World hangs over the study of the radical protest movements of the 1960s in Europe and the United States. […] Scholars have long acknowledged that individuals, groups, language, ideology, tactics, and, indeed, the very idea of a Third World liberation movement inspired student groups and activists in Europe and the United States.

Indeed, as noted at the outset of this chapter, the Third World informed - as much as it was formed by - the social activism and political unrest associated with the West in the 1960s. Congressman Adam Clayton Powell of Harlem, New York and African American novelist Richard Wright were both, for example, in attendance at Bandung; while W.E.B. Du Bois, an African American intellectual and civil rights activist, and Paul Robeson, an African American singer, actor and political activist, were invited but prevented from travelling by the United States government. Irrespective of whether they were able to attend in person or not, all were greatly enthused by the occurrence of the Bandung Conference and helped to circulate its ideas to a Western audience (Garland Mahler, 2018, pp. 60-63; Rodriguez, 2006, p. 125; Young, 2005, p. 11; Young, 2006, p. 1). Similarly, Martin Luther King's visit to Ghana in the year of its independence inspired many in the Civil Rights Movement to look towards Africa (Christiansen and Scarlett, 2013a, p. 4). Elbaum (2018, p. 17) writes that in the United States, 'by fall 1968, public opinion polls indicated that one million students saw themselves as part

of the left, and 368,000 people "strongly agreed" on the need for a "mass revolutionary party"'. African American, Chicano, Puerto Rican, Asian American and Native American groups all contributed to this new radical left inspired by the Third World.

In the United States, of particular note and renown were the Civil Rights Movement, the Women's Liberation Movement, the Chicano Movement, the Fair Play for Cuba Committee, the Young Lords, opposition to the United States' involvement in the Vietnam War, and the Black Power Movement, though there were many others. While each had its own objectives - for example, civil rights, gender equality, U.S.-Cuban solidarity, Puerto Rican independence, etc. - many identified with the broader concept of Third World liberation. As Christiansen and Scarlett (2013a, p. 1) explain:

> The Third World not only inspired many students to take to the street in the 1960s, it also provided a model for the radicalism of the decade. Many activists in the Civil Rights Movement, for example, saw the Third World as a natural ally. The Third World and the Black Power movement became so intertwined in the 1960s that many in the United States no longer differentiated between the two causes. Decolonizing the Third World meant freedom at home for African-Americans, and vice versa.

Indeed, many conceptualised their struggle as part of a global fight against imperialism and began to recognise imperialism and racial oppression as interlinked. Young (2006, p. 2), for example, states:

> If Bandung heralded the entrance of the Third World nations onto the world stage, it also spurred the transformation of leftists of color in the United States. Du Bois suggests as much when he links African Americans to colonized peoples, anti-imperialism to antiracism, forcefully arguing that "color, caste and class" are interconnected. In doing so, Du Bois defines "colored" identity as a global identity, one profoundly shaped by racism, colonialism, and imperialism.

However, the history of these movements is often told through a framework that emphasises the national over the transnational and subsumes black activism under pan-Africanism. The Black Power Movement, for example, was not antithetical to the Civil Rights and Student Movements of the 1960-1970s. Young (2006, p. 6) argues that 'the boundaries between political philosophies and organizations were often more permeable and fluid than scholars acknowledge', tending to 'overemphasize race as a rallying point, ignoring the fact that

assaults against Jim Crow segregation and equality were also assaults on entrenched class and gender exploitation'. Similarly, Rodriguez (2006, pp. 120-123) notes that the international dimension of black activism in the United States in the 1960-1970s is often omitted, portrayed instead as 'black nationalism'. The Fair Play for Cuba Committee is a case in point. A multiracial activist group set-up in New York in April 1960, its primary concern was the truthfulness of the news and information reaching the American public regarding the Cuban Revolution. However, it soon drew parallels between Cuba's struggle against U.S. imperialism, the struggle for racial equality in the United States and national liberational struggles around the world, advocating for a transnational solidarity with the oppressed peoples of the world that transcended race (Gott, 2004, pp. 177-178; Rodriguez, 2005).

Latin America and Cuba

As transnational networks from the Bandung Conference, AAPSO, NAM and within the United States began to draw together under the overarching principals of Third World liberation and solidarity, Latin America was the missing piece of the puzzle. In comparison to Asia and Africa, Latin America as a region had already transitioned through colonialism and decolonisation towards a postcolonial condition. Having largely gained its independence from European colonial powers in the nineteenth century, it had since had to contend with imperialism in the form of the United States. Through measures such as the Monroe Doctrine, interventionist regime changes, the Organization of American States, the Alliance for Progress and Operation Condor, the United States worked to consolidate its dominance in what it considered 'its backyard' (McSherry, 2005; Taffet, 2007; Young, 2005, pp. 15, 19). Beyond its experiences of imperialism, Latin America also introduced influential theories of economic development - for example, *desarrollismo* (developmentalism) and *dependencia* (dependency) - and a revolutionary dimension to the Third World Left (Field *et al.*, 2020, p. 6; Marchesi, 2017, p. 4). It was at the third summit of AAPSO in Moshi, Tanganyika in 1963 that Latin American delegates were first invited to participate as observers. A key point of discussion was the aspiration to expand the organisation to include Latin America and its fight against U.S. imperialism. Two years later in Accra, Ghana, the decision was made to include Latin America with the next summit to be held in Havana, Cuba (Barcia, 2009, p. 210; Getchell, 2020, p. 155). Thus, the expansion of AAPSO to encompass Latin America aligned anti-imperial and anti-colonial movements in the Third World.

Within Latin America, Cuba was a pivotal actor in the development of the Tricontinental Movement - a role that is discussed in detail in the next chapter. Owing to its political and economic isolation at the hands of the United States, Cuba sought international relations through organisations such as NAM and AAPSO and pushed for the inclusion of Latin America. A key part of Cuba's advances towards the Third World also centred on racial politics. As with the Bandung Conference, AAPSO, NAM and oppositional groups in the United States, Cuba linked imperialism and racial oppression. Framing Cuba as 'Afro-Cuban', Castro skilfully drew together the Afro-Asian bloc, African Americans and Latin America. Furthermore, the Cuban Revolution, particularly its success with armed guerrilla warfare, was a significant source of inspiration and became instructive for the Third World as a political project (Gronbeck-Tedesco, 2015, p. 200; Prashad, 2008). Thus, as Gettig (2020, p. 241) notes, 'Cuba decisively shaped the terms under which the rest of Latin America associated with the Third World'. By the time the decision was made to expand AAPSO to include Latin America, Cuba was the obvious choice to host the next summit (Barcia, 2009, p. 210).

Capitalism, Communism and the Third World

The various threads of the Tricontinental Movement came together in the context of the Cold War. As such, they were influenced by the Cold War's polarising binary of capitalism vs. communism. As anti-colonial movements in Africa and Asia began to align with anti-imperial movements in Latin America and political and social activism in the United States and Europe, they became associated with communism. Initially, as discussed, many of these movements started out on the premise of non-alignment. At the Bandung Conference, the emphasis lay on sovereignty and independence. The Soviet bloc, for example, was viewed with suspicion as a possible form of contemporary colonialism (Acharya, 2016, pp. 346-347; Eslava *et al.*, 2017, p. 30; Young, 2005). AAPSO focused on solidarity between Africa and Asia, and NAM took non-alignment as its namesake. However, as the Tricontinental Conference approached, non-alignment began to fall away.

This was in part due to the United States' policy of containment, which was intended to prevent the spread of communism around the world. Owing to the binary conceptualisation of Cold War politics, this policy in effect labelled any country at odds with the United States or capitalist Europe as communist. Even within the United States, oppositional groups, such

as the Civil Rights Movement, often felt the need to actively distance themselves from communism (Gronbeck-Tedesco, 2015, pp. 202-204). However, this policy could also be leveraged in their favour. Gronbeck-Tedesco (2015, p. 202) states, for example, that African Americans at times used the threat of communism to get the United States to take a more pro-African stance regarding racial equality and decolonisation. Similarly, Young (2005, p. 15) writes:

> By the same token, those resisting anti-colonial struggles were now able to do so in the name of resisting communism […]. This strategy was used most effectively by the South African government, who conflated the ANC and local communists (whether Communists or Trotskyites) with the perceived global designs of the Soviet Union. Thereafter apartheid was nicely sustained on an anti-communist ticket, with tacit US and British support.

As a result, many anti-colonial and anti-imperial movements began to move towards socialism in the 1950-1960s, accepting material support from communist China and the Soviet Union. In contrast to Bandung, the Soviet Union was now seen as a major ally and non-alignment was turning to alignment (Young, 2018, p. 517). Ironically, the United States' policy of containment, executed through the binary politics of the Cold War, helped to consolidate the Third World as an international, transnational and socialist political project. As anti-colonial, anti-imperial and other oppositional movements were 'pushed' into the same communist sphere, they increasingly identified with a global fight against U.S. imperialism and capitalism.

At the same time, these currents of thought also contributed towards the 'new Left' - where Third World liberation came to replace Soviet Marxism (Elbaum, 2018; Marchesi, 2017). As Fink *et al.* (1998, p. 25) attest, 'with the fading of the Marxist and Soviet models, the heroic factory worker and peasant had been replaced by the heroic Third World freedom fighter'. This speaks to who was visible as a political actor (and who was not) and therefore who was seen as capable of politics (and, again, who was not). Similarly, Gronbeck-Tedesco (2015) notes that in the United States African Americans had become disillusioned with the 'old Left' and were increasingly turning towards Tricontinentalism.

The Tricontinental Conference

The Tricontinental Conference took place in January 1966 in Havana, Cuba. Born out of the decision to expand AAPSO to include Latin America, it brought together approximately five hundred delegates from eighty-two countries (Gronbeck-Tedesco, 2008, p. 659; Halliday, 1999, p. 118). Attended largely by the leaders of African, Asian and Latin American countries and national liberation and oppositional movements, it sought to develop a global socialist organisation with the objective of international revolution (Young, 2018, p. 520). As Gronbeck-Tedesco (2015, p. 209) notes, 'the gathering proposed to resuscitate the spirit of Bandung to align third world nations against the forces of colonialism and imperialism'.

A large part of the organisation of the Tricontinental Conference was the work of Mehdi Ben Barka, a Moroccan revolutionary and leading figure of the international Left (Barcia, 2009, p. 208). Through his work preparing and publicising the conference, Barka defined its political agenda and orientation (Young, 2018, p. 519). However, in October 1965, only a few months before the conference was set to take place, Barka was abducted in the centre of Paris by French police and later assassinated (Halliday, 1999, p. 118). Young (2018, p. 518) states that 'according to *Time* magazine, and other commentators, the Moroccan government, French intelligence agents, the CIA, and Mossad were all variously involved'. Moreover, as Barcia (2009, p. 208) observes:

> For the Tricontinental Conference the kidnapping of Ben Barka was simultaneously a set back and a very opportune example of the excesses of which US imperialism was capable. […] The hundreds of delegates that started to arrive in Cuba from late December 1965 to attend the conference did so convinced that the disappearance of Ben Barka was the work of agents of the Northern Empire. What had been conceived as a sabotage action against the conference became, in fact, a reason for encouraging even further the anti-American feeling among those attending the event.

The agenda of the conference, as per the 'preparation pamphlet' (cited in Young, 2018, p. 520), was as follows:

1. Fight against imperialism, colonialism and neocolonialism.

2. Addressing urgent problems in the three continents, identified as Vietnam, Dominican Republic, Congo, Portuguese colonies, South Rhodesia, South Arabia, and Palestine.
3. Anti-imperialist solidarity among the Afro-Asian-Latin American peoples in the economic, social and cultural aspects.
4. Political unification and organization of the African, Asian, and Latin American efforts in their common struggle for national liberation.

While many topics were discussed, the main themes of the conference centred around the spectre of imperialism. The chief offender in this regard was the United States. In particular, its policy of containment, which had led it to intervene in numerous countries in Africa, Asia and Latin America - all in the name of defending the 'free world' against communism. Young (2005, p. 18) provides a summary of these actions that is worth quoting here at length:

> These convictions led the US to support anti-communist forces in Vietnam, Korea, colonial autocracies such as the apartheid government in South Africa, as well as a range of neo-colonial regimes in Latin America. Thus in Latin America, in Guatemala, the leftist President Jacobo Arbenz Guzmán was overthrown with US help in 1954 after he had nationalised the US-owned United Fruit Company; in Brazil, President João Goulart was overthrown by a military coup in January 1964 and his successor initiated a campaign of persecution of 'communists'; in Bolivia, the government of the Nationalist Revolutionary Movement (MNR) was overthrown in November 1964 by the military, with US support. In Asia, in 1955 the US organised the deposition of Bao Dai, South Vietnamese head of state, and his replacement by the dictator Ngo Dinh Diem, who was himself then disposed of in a military coup in 1963, which heralded direct US military intervention. In the Middle East, in 1956 US Secretary of State John Foster Dulles withdrew US promised financial aid to Egypt for the building of the Aswan Dam on account of his distrust of Nasser's policies of Arab socialism.

And, of course, the Bay of Pigs in April 1961 in which one thousand five hundred Cuban exiles - trained and funded by the CIA - landed on the coast of Cuba with designs to assassinate Castro; yet another attempt in an ongoing series of attacks intended to overthrow the Cuban government (Gott, 2004, pp. 190-195).

Hence, it is easy to see why the conference quickly became, 'a platform from which to shout insults about US imperialism' (Barcia, 2009, p. 210). However, it was the United States' intervention in Vietnam that generated the most discussion and consolidated a sense of global resistance to imperialism among the attendees. In his *Message to the Tricontinental* Che Guevara (1967) identified the United States as the head of imperialism, condemning its actions in Vietnam and drawing parallels between the Vietnamese resistance, the Cuban Revolution and other liberation struggles around the world; famously calling on the Third World to create 'two, three or many Vietnams', as celebrated in the OSPAAAL poster fig. 20. Consequently, the idea of creating 'more Vietnams' became a central theme of the conference (Barcia, 2009, p. 212).

The role of armed guerrilla warfare in the fight against imperialism was also a key point of discussion. Halliday (1999, pp. 247-248) notes that owing to the nuclear stalemate of the Cold War, guerrilla warfare became an international phenomenon - particularly in the Third World as oppositional movements rarely had the military resources to win in direct conflict. In contrast to Bandung, 'non-violent moral force' had given way to a model of armed revolution based on the Cuban and Vietnamese experiences (Young, 2005, p. 13; 2018, p. 522). Indeed, the Cuban Revolution had captured the imagination of the Third World and become 'a model to be followed, observed and emulated' (Gronbeck-Tedesco, 2008, p. 660). The prevalence of Che Guevara's image in the 1960s, for example, reflected the popular appeal of the Cuban Revolution and its influence on oppositional and national liberation movements (Marchesi, 2017, p. 5). Garland Mahler (2018, p. 74) frames this change between Bandung and the Tricontinental as a shift from a 'catching-up-with-the-West' model of development to 'a commitment to global militant resistance'. Certainly, the conference affirmed that imperialist violence must be answered with revolutionary violence (Getchell, 2020, p. 157).

Another topic of debate was the apartheid regime in South Africa and more broadly the role of imperialist forces in racial discrimination in the Third World. For example, as Barcia (2009, p. 212) relays:

> Edward Ndlovu speaking on behalf of the Zimbabwe African Peoples Union, attacked Britain and accused the British government of 'secretly conniving with the illegal government of Rhodesia'. Here, also, Guevara's message 'put the finger in the wound' when he attacked equally both British colonialism in Rhodesia and the white minority in

> the southern part of Africa. He also called for the ending of the apartheid regime and predicted that '*Cuando las masas negras de Sud Africa o Rhodesia inicien su auténtica lucha revolucionaria, se habrá iniciado una nueva época en el Africa'* ['when the black masses of South Africa or Rhodesia start their authentic revolutionary struggle, a new era will have dawned in Africa'].

Other topics discussed included national independence and sovereignty, the elimination of foreign military bases in Africa, Asia and Latin America, the end of the policy of military pacts, the prohibition of the use, production, testing and storage of nuclear weapons, and the universal commitment to the dismantling of all existing nuclear weapons (Barcia, 2009, p. 212). At the close of the conference, a further summit was scheduled to take place in 1967 in Cairo, Egypt and the decisions made to create OSPAAAL and the Latin American Solidarity Organisation (Barcia, 2009, p. 213). Although some argue that little came of the Tricontinental Conference (see Barcia, 2009, pp. 213-215; Eslava *et al.*, 2017; Halliday, 1999, p. 119; and Young, 2018, pp. 521-522, for further discussion), the Tricontinental Movement that it generated took on a life of its own.

The Tricontinental Movement

From the Tricontinental Conference came the Tricontinental Movement, a global solidarity movement that connected peoples across Africa, Asia, Latin America and the Global North through the currents of thought articulated in Havana in January 1966. As with the conference, the movement was a product of anti-colonial and anti-imperial politics, black radicalism, human and civil rights activism, and opposition to U.S. hegemony and global capitalism, all in the context of the Cold War. Although OSPAAAL's headquarters were located in Havana, the movement existed well outside the confines of the Caribbean island. As noted in chapter one, there was a flurry of guerrilla activity from liberation movements around the world following the Tricontinental Conference (Barcia, 2009, pp. 213-214). Halliday (1999, p. 119) summarises:

> In the course of the ensuing two decades individual organisations represented there were to take power through victory in guerrilla war – in South Yemen (1967), the former Portuguese colonies of Africa (1974-5), Vietnam, Cambodia and Laos (1975), Nicaragua (1979), Zimbabwe (1980) and, much later, South Africa (1994) and Palestine (1994).

Links were also drawn between these struggles. For example, speaking at a press conference in Cuba, the then Minister of Education for the Black Panther Party[7] stated:

> "In order to bring humanity to a higher level," U.S. Blacks would "follow the example of Che Guevara, the Cuban people, the Vietnamese people and our leader and Minister of Defense, Huey P. Newton [and] … Malcom X, Lumumba, Ho Chi Minh and Mao Tse-tung." (Murray, 1968 cited in Rodriguez, 2006, p. 131)

Of course, one of the most visible activities of the Tricontinental Movement was its propaganda output, comprising posters, the Tricontinental Bulletin, the Tricontinental Magazine, photography, various documentation and leaflets, radio, television and film (Young, 2018, pp. 522-523).

The movement's political discourse and ideology are often referred to in the literature as 'Tricontinentalism'. Gronbeck-Tedesco (2008, p. 660), for example, describes Tricontinentalism as a 'counter-discourse [that] challenged the modernisation strategies and anti-communist politics prescribed by the 'Free World', and projected a language of liberation and nationhood for the deterritorialised and decolonised'. Garland Mahler (2018, p. 3), in contrast, emphasises the movement's racial politics, stating that Tricontinentalism '[reflected] a deterritorialized vision of imperial power and a recognItion of imperialism and racial oppression as interlinked'. It is also worth noting that in addition to these ideas and ideals, Tricontinentalism was characterised by fairly misogynistic and disparaging attitudes towards women and male homosexuals (see Gronbeck-Tedesco, 2008, pp. 665-667; 2015, pp. 231-232); an aspect of the movement that conflicted with its celebration and positive depiction of women as guerrilla fighters - see, for example, figs. 21, 22 and 23.

Tricontinentalism also differed from pan-Africanism, though the two are often conflated. Rodriguez (2005, p. 63) states that mistakenly attributing black internationalism to pan-Africanism has obscured a large part of the history of Tricontinental thought. Although

[7] The Black Panther Party was a political organisation founded by Huey P. Newton and Bobby Seale in Oakland, California in 1966. Broadly speaking, it advocated for black self-determinism; however, its political discourse and ideology changed over time and with respect to local chapters. Its membership and activities peaked in the late 1960s and early 1970s. See Bloom and Martin (2016) and Malloy (2017) for further details.

Tricontinentalism drew on aspects of pan-Africanism, there were key points of difference that at times put them at odds with one another. While many African American activists and intellectuals in the United States - such as Huey P. Newton and Bobby Seale - conceptualised their struggle against racism and inequality as part of a global fight against imperialism and oppression, others - such as Malcom X - did not see their politics as inclusive of non-black peoples (Garland Mahler, 2018, pp. 60-63; Gronbeck-Tedesco, 2015; Rodriguez, 2006). Gronbeck-Tedesco (2015, p. 224), for example, comments that 'Newton was leery of Afrocentrism and the myth of black cultural purity and eyed Back to Africa movements suspiciously, for they promoted racial essentialism that jeopardized the third world political project'.

Africa and the Tricontinental Movement

As noted in chapter one, Africa, its people and the African diaspora played a key role in the Tricontinental Movement - not only in the movement itself, but also in how its political discourse and ideology were imagined. In the first instance, Africa, along with Asia and Latin America, was foundational to OSPAAAL and the Tricontinental Movement. It was also central to the concept of the Third World, which in turn informed the political discourse and ideology of the Tricontinental Movement. Of course, more specific to Africa was its experiences of colonialism and postcolonialism, which inspired the Bandung Conference, the formation of AAPSO and NAM, and later the Tricontinental Conference, Tricontinental Movement and OSPAAAL. Christiansen and Scarlett (2013a, pp. 3-5), for example, note the significance of the Algerian and the Ghanaian struggles for independence and the Rhodesian and the South African struggles against white minority rule for the Third World in the 1960s. Similarly, Young (2005, p. 16) observes that between Bandung and the Tricontinental, 'there was a growing awareness of the forces of neo-colonialism in post-colonial Africa after the murder of Lumumba by the CIA in 1961'[8].

[8] Patrice Lumumba was leader of the Congo's first democratically elected government after its independence from Belgium in June 1960. He was assassinated in January 1961. (Gerard and Kuklick, 2015)

Indeed, much of the 'post-Bandung era' was informed by the politics of decolonisation and postcolonialism (Gronbeck-Tedesco, 2015). Christiansen and Scarlett (2013a, p. 4) actually conceptualise the Third World in the 1960s as a product of two overlapping waves:

> The first wave, which ended in the mid-1960s, consisted of movements that focused on the anti-colonial struggle for national independence. […] Activists in the second wave, however, fought against neo-colonialism and the project of the nation-state.

Crucially, however, they note, 'the themes that comprised the anti-colonial nationalism of the earlier part of the decade often echoed in the social movements [of the later part of the decade]'. Thus, the decolonisation of Africa, its anti-colonial movements and experiences of post- and neo-colonialism were formative with regard to the political discourse and ideology of the Tricontinental Movement.

As discussed, race was also a central component in how the Tricontinental Movement imagined its fight against imperialism. Crucially, it saw racial oppression and imperialism as interlinked. Garland Mahler (2018, p. 3), for example, argues that '[the Tricontinental Movement] articulated its critique of global capitalism precisely through a focus on racial violence and inequality'. Although the movement encompassed many different nationalities and ethnicities, the African diaspora was at the heart of its politics. Shaped by anti-colonial movements in Africa, the history and past injustices of the transatlantic slave trade, the subsequent inequality and oppression faced by black peoples in the Americas, the Jim Crow laws and Black Power Movement in the United States, and more broadly, pan-Africanism, Africa, the African diaspora and anti-black racism rose to the top of the Tricontinental Movement's agenda. At the same time, colour became a metonymic political signifier - as discussed in the preceding chapters - where the colour black symbolised oppositional politics and the colour white symbolised imperialism and capitalism (Garland Mahler, 2018; Gronbeck-Tedesco, 2015, pp. 231-232).

Lastly, Africa was an important and active site of resistance to imperialism for the Tricontinental Movement. Apartheid South Africa, for example, was a particular point of focus, as its explicit racial hierarchies and imperialist interventionism epitomised the global systems of inequality that the Tricontinental Movement opposed (Garland Mahler, 2018, pp. 23, 180-183). Similarly, the national liberation turned proxy war in Angola was of special

significance - not least because it represented a victory over imperialism. Thus, we can begin to understand the various ways in which Africa was positioned within the Tricontinental Movement with regard to its international politics, political discourse and ideology, which contextualises the African series of OSPAAAL posters. The following section analyses the posters apropos Garland Mahler's premise that colour acted as a metonymic political signifier in Tricontinentalist texts.

Colour as a Metonymic Political Signifier

On the one hand, there is some evidence to suggest that the African series of OSPAAAL posters supports Garland Mahler's premise; that is, that within the Tricontinental Movement colour acted as a metonymic political signifier - representing politics as opposed to race. Take, for example, fig. 24. This poster depicts a black silhouette holding a rifle, surrounded by flowers and the text 'SOLIDARITY WITH THE PEOPLES OF AFRICA' in French, Spanish, Arabic and English. The profile of the silhouette is not markedly African, by which I mean the features are nondescript and the ethnicity open to interpretation. Although this might sound like an incidental or inconsequential detail, there are many more examples of OSPAAAL poster artists emphasising facial features that were associated with racial stereotypes of Africa such as wide lips and/or a broad nose - see, for example, figs. 25, 26, 27, 28 and 29. The lack of these features in fig. 24 is therefore a conscious albeit subtle decision. The gender of the silhouette is also ambiguous. The suggestion of a headscarf could indicate a female figure, but this detail alone provides little certainty. Instead, the identity of the silhouette, in terms of race, ethnicity and gender, is left open-ended. Interestingly, the flowers that border the central image are unlike any other designs in the African series of OSPAAAL posters, which use tribal imagery, weapons and nationalist iconography, such as spears and flags, in abundance, but never flowers. Instead, the border of flowers is reminiscent of the countercultural 'hippie' movement that swept the United States in the 1960s and 1970s (Rorabaugh, 2015). This disconnect between the poster image and any specifically African imagery further favours an open interpretation. Thus, the silhouette could be anyone, but it is also no one - a notion that is explored further in chapter six - seemingly standing in for anyone and everyone in solidarity with the peoples of Africa. The open-ended image makes it possible for the viewer to imagine the identity of the silhouette, encouraging them to 'fill in the blank'. The silhouette is also black. While the use of black ink to render a silhouette is far from unusual, OSPAAAL poster

artists frequently used colour in abstract ways - as discussed in the following sections. Thus, once again, this should be understood as an aesthetic choice. It is therefore conceivable that this silhouette alluded to colour as a metonymic political signifier, where the use of black ink played with the notion that anyone in solidarity with the peoples of Africa was 'black' in a political sense.

The black silhouette of a revolutionary - indicated by a rifle - also appears in other designs from the African series of OSPAAAL posters. In fig. 30 it 'grows' out of the child's tears, while in fig. 31 it emerges from the broken remains of the white bust. In both, the black silhouette could similarly act as a metonymic political signifier - representing oppositional politics and resistance to neo-colonial oppression in Namibia and South Africa. Hence, the colour black and more specifically the depiction of figures as 'black' potentially signified political ideology as opposed to race, ethnicity or simply the shadow of a silhouette.

However, this interpretation is complicated by the African context referenced in the posters. In figs. 24, 30 and 31 the black silhouette could act as a metonymic political signifier, as discussed; and yet, the context of the posters - Africa, Namibia and South Africa - makes it difficult to separate any metonymic political signifier from the situational reality. That is, to separate being black in the Tricontinental sense from being black in the phenotypic sense of being African or from Africa. For example, take four further posters referencing Zimbabwe, figs. 32 and 33, and South Africa, figs. 31 and 34. In fig. 32 there is a brown figure behind white bars that forms part of a white silhouette, and the text '17th of March DAY OF WORLD SOLIDARITY WITH THE STRUGGLE OF THE PEOPLE OF ZIMBABWE' in Spanish, French, English and Arabic. Akin to the black silhouettes discussed above, the brown figure is ambiguous. It appears to be male but has few identifying features. When contrasted against the white silhouette, a binary aesthetic is created. This aesthetic - coloured vs. white - frames anyone in solidarity with the people of Zimbabwe as 'coloured' and everyone else as 'white'. Thus, colour acts as a metonymic political signifier. However, at the same time, the reality in Zimbabwe was that a white minority was oppressing the coloured population. Consequently, the colours used in the poster could also simply reflect the Zimbabwean context.

A similar impasse presents itself in figs. 31, 33 and 34. Fig. 33 also refers to Zimbabwe and depicts three white (yellow given the use of colour) police officers seemingly arresting a black

man. The contrast in colour and race is accentuated through the black uniforms of the police and the white/yellow shirt of the arrested man. This could allude broadly to imperialism, casting the black man as representative of oppressed peoples around the world. Indeed, Garland Mahler (2018, p. 4) comments, 'that in these materials the image of a white policeman metonymically stands in for global empire, and conversely, the image of an African American protestor signifies the Tricontinental's global and transracial resistant subjectivity'. However, it also reflects the reality of Zimbabwe at the time, particularly regarding police corruption and brutality. Figs. 31 and 34 reference South Africa where the policy of apartheid made the binary aesthetic of white vs. non-white a lived reality. In fig. 34, for example, the black footprints and white writing abstract race in such a way that the colour black could signify a political stance against apartheid, racism and white imperialism. However, it could equally refer to the realities of apartheid law. Thus, although these posters could be using colour as a metonymic political signifier, it is difficult if not impossible to separate it from the African contexts that the posters depict.

In addition to the issue of context, there are a few further examples in the African series of OSPAAAL posters that appear to indicate what I would describe as the opposite of Garland Mahler's premise. That is, rather than acting as a metonymic political signifier, colour and race are used to specifically identify Africa and African peoples. For example, figs. 11, 35, 36 and 37 draw on the stereotype of Africa as starving and impoverished. In these posters, African people, in particular children, are depicted as thin, underweight and wearing tattered clothing - see, for example, the pronounced collarbones and ribs visible in figs. 35 and 36. Kuhn (2013) locates this stereotype in the Nigerian Civil War between the Nigerian government and the secessionist province of Biafra in the late 1960s. Owing to the ongoing conflict, Biafra experienced a severe famine. However, it largely went unnoticed by the international community until 'images [showing] starving children, reduced to walking skeletons with distended bellies and faded hair due to undernourishment' were disseminated to the international press and media in an effort to generate support and humanitarian aid (Kuhn, 2013, p. 72). As Kuhn (2013, p. 78) notes in his concluding remarks, 'these images of Africa as aid receiving, starving from hunger, and struck by war are long lasting and remain today'. Indeed, this stereotype is present in the crouched form of the child in fig. 11, the outstretched hand in fig. 36 and the failing gaze of the child in fig. 37. These images, juxtaposed with barbed wire symbolising oppression in fig. 35, the word 'apartheid' in figs. 11 and 37, and the logos

of several large American companies in fig. 36, build on and reassert the stereotype of Africa and African peoples as starving, impoverished, vulnerable, weak and suffering.

Akin to the photographs of children affected by the famine in Biafra, these posters were intended to be emotive. Fig. 11, for example, is based on a photograph by Ernest Cole, fig. 12, that was part of a collection designed to draw attention to the black experience of apartheid. Cole was a black photographer and photojournalist who sought to capture the lived reality of black people in apartheid South Africa. His work was published in the photobook *House of Bondage* in 1967 (Gaule, 2017; TATE, 2021). Although it was banned in South Africa, the use of Cole's work speaks of the transnational links within the Tricontinental Movement. The original photograph shows a black child clutching a slate in a school classroom in South Africa. Ott (2017) provides an insight into the reception of this photograph:

> As viewers, we begin to notice his small and fragile form, curled into a ball and draped in an oversized shirt. This child's entire body fits into the bottom left corner of the image. The compression of his form into a single corner of the frame is no accident. The photo begins to scream at the viewer: this boy is fragile, innocent, and small; in short, he is a child, and no child should be forced to crouch in a corner of the world, making himself smaller than he already is. Then we see his face, his sweat, and his concentration. The photo asks us: if this boy can endure so much and remain so determined, how can we not feel determined to help him, to make his life better, and to protect what is innocent?

These same sentiments are evoked by the poster but given a harsher and more emphatic edge by the bold contrasting colours and bright red text that reads 'APARTHEID'.

These emotive posters encounter a similar problematic to that described by Callahan regarding humanitarian photojournalism in Africa. As Callahan (2020, p. 121) explains, these photographs are taken by professional photographers in order to document the violence of wars and humanitarian crises.

> These aren't realist images that seek to reflect reality, but activist images that aim to make invisible suffering more visible […]. Humanitarian photographs hope to "serve as a catalyst for positive change" by evoking compassion in the viewer.

Similarly, OSPAAAL hoped that its visually striking and emotive posters would generate support and solidarity for liberation movements in Africa by making their struggles more

visible to an international audience; and - in making the invisible, visible - effect a redistribution of the sensible. However, as Callahan (2020, p. 121) goes on to say:

> Still, such photos are problematic because they tend to universalize and homogenize Africans into nameless, passive victims. The activism also risks reproducing the hierarchy of postcolonial power relations in a politics of pity wherein helpless Africans rely on Euro-American saviours.

Although Callahan is discussing a Euro-American - African dynamic, 'Euro-American saviours' could be replaced by 'Third World revolutionaries' with regard to figs. 11, 35, 36 and 37 - though there are, of course, stark ideological and historical differences. Hence, the depiction of colour and race here does not signify anyone and everyone in solidarity with peoples oppressed by imperialism; rather, it emphasises specific associations between Africa, African peoples, famine and poverty to generate an emotive response. Thus, in these posters, colour and race are used to identify a specific group of people via a specific stereotype.

Another example is the four posters that reference North Africa, specifically Western Sahara, figs. 38, 39 and 40, and Libya, fig. 41. If the colour black was used as a metonymic political signifier, we might expect to see more visual devices such as black silhouettes or abstracted figures and footprints. Instead, all four posters depict race in a way that is specific to North Africa; in that the figures in the posters can be clearly identified as North African from their dress, lighter skin tone and facial features. Thus, these examples oppose Garland Mahler's premise that colour acted as a metonymic political signifier as race was a non-transferable, specific identifier in these particular Tricontinental materials. In addition to these considerations, there are several notable themes and aesthetic devices in the African series of OSPAAAL posters as regard colour and the depiction of race; namely, the use of black and white colour, abstraction using bright colours, tribal imagery and the absence of race in poster designs. The following sections discuss each in turn.

In Black and White

The use of the colours white and black is touched on above. The most striking examples, perhaps unsurprisingly, reference South Africa and apartheid. See, for example, figs. 31, 34 and 42. In fig. 34 black footprints cross the words 'APARTHEID', which form a corner and are

printed in white. This conveys the notion that the black footprints, or the owner of the black footprints, are walking across the physical and figurative boundaries and restrictions imposed by apartheid and white minority rule. In fig. 31 the white head and shoulders of a figure bound by chains breaks apart to reveal the black silhouette of a revolutionary fighter, making an association between freedom from slavery and 'the beginning' of revolution; and in fig. 42 a white handprint and the word 'APARTHEID' are positioned across the black face of an African child, bringing to mind the gesture to 'stop' or to prevent someone from proceeding. In all of these posters the colour white alludes to white minority rule and the policy of apartheid in South Africa, while the colour black is used to represent the black population of South Africa. 'Apartheid' is also printed in white in figs. 37, 43 and 44. This use of the colours white and black is inverted to striking effect in fig. 29, which depicts the face of an African man using white ink against a black background and within his pupils the words 'WHITES ONLY' - a reference to the segregation laws of apartheid South Africa. This inversion of white and black causes the viewer to pause, to look twice, as the mind works to relate what it sees with what it expects to see in a moment of disarray akin to the sublime.

Beyond apartheid South Africa, there are further examples of the colour white being used to represent colonial and neo-colonial powers. For example, figs. 32 and 45 reference Zimbabwe where following a period of British colonial rule a white minority government had declared unilateral independence resulting in a civil war between the government, the Zimbabwe African People's Union (ZAPU) and the Zimbabwe African National Union (ZANU) (Gleijeses, 2002, p. 273; Mlambo, 2014). The white hat depicted in fig. 45 is reminiscent of the 'pith helmets' worn by European military personnel in Africa during the mid-nineteenth to mid-twentieth century and widely regarded as a symbol of colonial oppression (Rovine, 2019)[9]. The helmet is pierced by a green arrow, which likely alluded to the efforts of the guerrilla movements ZAPU and ZANU. As Ray (2020, para. 2) observes, 'the spare but powerful image is so fiercely anticolonial because the pith helmet is so quintessentially colonial'. Thus, akin to the white silhouette in fig. 32, the white helmet represents the neo-colonial government of Zimbabwe. Figs. 18 and 46 refer to Guinea-Bissau and Cape Verde where the *Partido Africano da Independência da Guiné e Cabo Verde* (PAIGC) was fighting for independence from the

[9] In 2018, Melania Trump sparked fierce criticism for opting to wear a pith helmet on a Kenyan safari as part of a tour of Africa as First Lady of the United States (Burke, 2018).

Portuguese Empire[10]. Despite the assassination of the movement's leader, Amílcar Cabral, in January 1973, the PAIGC won Guinea-Biassau's independence later that same year and Cape Verde's in 1975 (Gleijeses, 2002, pp. 185-213). In fig. 46, white space is used to highlight French Guinea; and in fig. 18, white chains are shown breaking in front of the national flag - a reference to the PAIGC's recent successes against the Portuguese Empire. Thus, both the white chains and the white space indicating French Guinea allude to colonial power.

The colour black is used to various effects in the African series of OSPAAAL posters, including but not limited to the black backgrounds, footprints and silhouettes discussed above - figs. 24, 30, 31, 34, 45 and 46. For example, see figs. 27, 28, 47, 48, 49 and 50. In fig. 50 the colour black is used to depict the continent of Africa, which is contrasted against a yellow background and the image of a man intended to represent the United States. This grotesque scene[11] uses colour to portray Africa as black and the United States as its binary opposite, linking the economic exploitation of African resources[12] - namely oil - by the United States with colour politics. In fig. 47 the colour black is used to recreate the artwork of Emory Douglas, discussed further in chapter seven, drawing links between the Black Panther Party and the Tricontinental Movement[13].

[10] At various points this conflict involved not only Guinea-Bissau, Cape Verde and Portugal, but also the United States, the Soviet Union, Cuba, Sweden, Norway, Denmark, the Netherlands, and concerned much of Portuguese Africa. As well as playing a key part in the collapse of the Portuguese Empire and the decolonisation of Africa, it was an important chapter in the international politics of the Cold War. (Gleijeses, 2002)

[11] This poster design evokes feelings of disgust. However, as Ahmed (2014, p. 84) explains, disgust is an amalgamation of desire and revulsion. We are drawn to the image at the same time as we seek to look away. This speaks to Kant's sublime that is both horrible and fascinating.

[12] Extractivism, the large-scale exploitation of natural resources by centres of global capital, boomed during the colonial era in Africa, Asia and Latin America. It is inherently linked to capitalism and inequality at a transnational level and was a key issue in the decolonisation of Africa. (Pereira and Tsikata, 2021)

[13] Although the Black Panther Party is usually associated with black nationalism or pan-Africanism, the Black Panthers linked their own struggle with that of other racialised and oppressed peoples throughout the Tricontinental. (Rodriguez, 2006).

Furthermore, the use of the colours white and black as a binary aesthetic - with variations such as white and brown, fig. 32, or yellow and black, figs. 33 and 50 - works to create a parallel binary political aesthetic. Such that everyone in solidarity with the peoples of Africa, Asia and Latin America and more broadly the Tricontinental Movement is black; and everyone else is part of the imperialist project and therefore white. There is no political in-between, just as there is no aesthetic in-between.

The colours white and black were therefore used consciously and strategically with regard to representations of race and politics. Although there were, of course, exceptions, such as black and white photographs and duotone images, which did not politicise the colours white and black, poster artists were evidently aware of the significance of these colours and this binary aesthetic in the political discourse of the Tricontinental Movement. While the case could be made that in some of these posters the colours white and black acted as metonymic political signifiers, they encounter the same issue of context - whereby it is difficult if not impossible to separate the use of the colours white and black from the reality of the African context. It is, however, interesting to note that the colour white as much as black potentially acted as a metonymic political signifier, representing colonial and imperial powers. Thus, white represented oppression and black, the oppressed.

Abstract Colour and the Depiction of Race

In contrast to the colours white and black, the use of bright and vivid colours disrupted sensible representations of race. Take, for example, figs. 51 and 52 of Patrice Lumumba and Amílcar Cabral. The former was born in the Belgian Congo to Congolese parents and fought for the independence of what would become the Democratic Republic of Congo. The latter was born in Guinea-Bissau to Cape Verdean parents and fought for the independence of Guinea-Bissau and Cape Verde from the Portuguese Empire (Davidson, 2007; Gerard and Kuklick, 2015; Lopes, 2007; Zeilig, 2015). Both martyrs were black and of African descent and yet the poster designs do not draw attention to their 'race'. Nor do they use black or brown, or skin-tone colours to render their portraits - as per figs. 4, 53, 54 and 55. Instead, the two poster artists, Alfredo Rostgaard and Olivio Martínez, used bright and vivid colours in a pop art style. As a result, Cabral is depicted in various shades of orange and green, and Lumumba, in red and blue. In effect, Rostgaard and Martínez avoid identifying Cabral and Lumumba as

black - in either a phenotypic or political sense. Similarly, a large number of the duotone posters depict African people in various shades of green (figs. 1, 21 and 43), purple (fig. 56), orange (figs. 44, 50, 57, 58 and 59), yellow (figs. 30, 33 and 60) and blue (figs. 61 and 62). Instead of portraying African people as black, this abstract use of colour works to sidestep the colour politics surrounding the representation of race. The same effect arises in the black and white duotone posters (see, for example, figs. 25, 63 and 64), black and white photographs (see, for example, fig. 65) and grayscale pencil sketches (see, for example, figs. 66 and 67), which remove the significance of the colours white and black with regard to race and politics.

This is surprising in light of the Tricontinental Movement's assertion that racial oppression and imperialism were interlinked and its focus on 'blackness' as a political signifier. Indeed, one would have expected poster artists to use this opportunity to emphasise people's African descent through the use of colour. It is, of course, possible that this was entirely an aesthetic choice to incorporate artistic styles such as pop art - certainly, the colour choices do not have any clear significance regarding national flags, for example. However, it may also have been influenced by the attempt to create a *dēmos* open to anyone and everyone, which is discussed in chapter six, or racial politics in Cuba, which are discussed in the next chapter. The colour red, for example, appears in both figs. 51 and 52, and has connotations with revolution, armed struggled and socialism. The *Movimiento 26 de Julio*[14], for instance, was represented by the colours red and black - fig. 68. Thus, the use of the colour red in these posters might link Cuba's revolutionary ideology with African liberation movements, subsuming racial politics under socialism. Irrespective, the effect is to avoid identifying the people in these posters as black, disrupting sensible representations of race by depicting black individuals through a spectrum of colours.

Tribal Imagery

While the use of colour discussed above had the effect of avoiding identifying African peoples as black, the use of tribal imagery identified African peoples as very specifically African. To

[14] Named to commemorate the attack on the Moncada Barracks on the 26th July 1953, the *Movimiento 26 de Julio* was the revolutionary guerrilla movement led by Fidel Castro in the late 1950s that ultimately overthrew Fulgencio Batista and established the Cuban Revolution (Gott, 2004).

elucidate, many of the poster designs include tribal imagery that is specific to Africa. For example, see figs. 26, 48, 69, 70, 71, 72, 73 and 74, which mix tribal imagery, weapons and pop art aesthetics to illustrate African peoples and African struggles. Figs. 72 and 74, for example, reference solidarity with the Congo and Zimbabwe and depict African masks, which played an important role in traditional rituals and ceremonies. Similarly, figs. 70, 71 and 73 reference Africa, Angola and Zimbabwe and depict African idols, traditionally carved from wood or other natural materials (Meyer, 1992). Masks and sculptures of idols were also presented as gifts from Africa. At *La Casa de África* in Havana, the walls are lined with tribal masks, sculptures and ceremonial clothing given to Cuba. In addition to the religious imagery of *Santería*[15], this likely would have informed Cuba's - and Cuban poster artists' - conceptualisation of African culture. There are also other more subtle examples of tribal imagery in the African series of OSPAAAL posters in the forms of spears, arrows and traditional dress - see figs. 45, 46, 47, 66, 67, 75, 76, 77, 78 and 79.

As this tribal imagery was specific to Africa but not the African diaspora or the Tricontinental Movement, it identified African peoples as very specifically African as opposed to 'black' or part of a global transracial subjectivity. However, though the use of tribal imagery rooted liberation movements in Africa in African culture and tradition, it was usually combined with images of small weapons or arms and references to solidarity alongside the OSPAAAL logo. This linked liberation movements in Africa to the Tricontinental vision of a global fight against imperialism based on localised guerrilla warfare. Indeed, Mor (2019, p. 59) states that 'OSPAAAL's poster art iconographically connected the ideological struggles of Latin American revolution with those of Vietnam, Palestine, the Congo, Yemen, and elsewhere, [suggesting] the ability of individual causes to be considered from within a comparative frame and as interconnected on a trans-regional level'. For example, in fig. 80, Africa, Asia and Latin America are presented as three distinct components of the Tricontinental Movement. The poster depicts a four-petalled flower with the OSPAAAL logo at its centre and the text 'DISAPPEARANCE OF BEN BARKA (OCTOBRE 29)'. While one petal refers to the disappearance of Mehdi Ben Barka in October 1965, the other three petals each represent one of the three

[15] The religious imagery of the Afro-Cuban religion of *Santería* - also known variously as *La Regla de Ocha, La Regla de Ifá* and *La Religión Lucumí* - often included masks, idols or dolls, sculptures or figures of deities, and tribal iconography (Brown, 2003).

Tricontinental continents. The images for each continent come from previous poster designs by the artist Jesús Forjans, see figs. 70, 81 and 82, which reference the people of Africa, Asia and Latin America respectively. Alternatively, the images can be read from left to right and top to bottom as a visual sequence of common struggle ending with the disappearance of Ben Barka as a powerful closure. Either way, Africa and African peoples are identified as distinct from, but still part of, the Tricontinental Movement.

The Absence of Race

There are, of course, posters in which references to race are absent. This does not include posters that depict African peoples, martyrs, or use the colours white or black to signify or allude to skin colour, as these all introduce the subject of race into the poster design. Rather, it refers to the posters in which any and all references to race are absent. Take, for example, figs. 83, 84, 85 and 86, which were designed by Lázaro Abreu, Victor Manuel Navarrete, Faustino Pérez and Rafael Enríquez and refer to Angola from 1970 to 1982[16]. Fig. 83 is a particularly abstract design that uses geometric shapes, sharp lines and contrasting colours to depict a rhombus shaped object in the foreground and a broken barrier in the background - possibly a reference to the role of diamonds in the Angolan conflict (see Le Billon, 2001; and Power, 2001). Crucially, despite the significance of race in the political discourse and ideology of the Tricontinental Movement, this poster does not touch on or even allude to race through the depiction of people or its use of colour.

Fig. 84 depicts the African continent with a serpent coiled around South Africa and poised over Angola, highlighted in green. The serpent is wounded and the accompanying text reads 'For the future of Africa / LONG LIVE THE PEOPLE'S REPUBLIC OF ANGOLA'. It was printed in 1976, the year following Angola's independence from Portugal and Cuba's decisive intervention in the Angolan Civil War that propelled the *Movimento Popular de Libertação de Angola's* (MPLA) to victory over the *Frente Nacional de Libertação de Angola* (FNLA) and the *União*

[16] Angola was part of Portugal's Colonial Empire. By the early 1970s, Angola's independence movement had been drawn into a civil war between national liberation parties. This quickly became a key proxy war of the Cold War, involving the United States, the Soviet Union, Cuba, China, South Africa and Portugal. (Gott, 2004; Polack, 2013)

Nacional para a Independência Total de Angola (UNITA) - the latter of which was supported by the United States, South Africa and China (Polack, 2013, p. 17). Although the exact symbolism of serpents varies with respect to time and culture, they commonly denote 'the embodiment of evil' - an iconographic legacy strongly influenced by Christianity (Charlesworth, 2010, p. 2). They also frequently appear in war poster imagery, representing 'the insidious enemy'. For example, there is an established tradition of portraying Jewish people as snakes in antisemitic images (Ranta, 2017; Vogt, 1975). In fig. 84, the serpent refers to the South African government, the South African support to UNITA in Angola and the wider reach of imperialism through interventionism. However, as Gleijeses (2002, p. 8) notes, the role of race in this conflict had global repercussions:

> This changed everything. "In Angola Black troops - Cubans and Angolans - have defeated White troops in military exchanges," a South African analyst observed, "and that psychological edge, that advantage the White man has enjoyed and exploited over 300 years of colonialism and empire, is slipping away."

It was also an important victory for Cuba's foreign policy and the Tricontinental Movement. Hence, it seems amiss that the poster makes no reference to this dimension of the conflict.

Similarly, figs. 85 and 86 miss an opportunity to draw attention to race. The former depicts many hands clasped together in front of the Angolan national flag, conveying the notion of cooperation. However, instead of depicting various skin tones and colours, the clasped hands are drawn in white and grey. Fig. 86 steers clear of race by focusing on images of fruits and bullet casings to symbolise agricultural production and military defence. The decision to exclude or avoid the subject of race is a choice on the part of the poster artist as much as any decision to include or allude to race. Although we cannot know if it was a conscious decision or the extent to which it was influenced by stylistic, cultural or political considerations, it is important to reflect on the absence of race as well as its inclusion in the African series of OSPAAAL posters. Garland Mahler's premise is obviously not applicable in the posters discussed in this section. However, akin to the use of abstract colour, the absence of race avoids identifying Africa, African peoples and African struggles with any form of black politics. This is especially surprising given the significance of race in Cuba's intervention in Angola in 1975, the neighbouring apartheid regime in South Africa, and the political discourse and ideology of the Tricontinental Movement.

Beyond Colour as a Metonymic Political Signifier

With regard to Garland Mahler's premise, colour does not act as a metonymic political signifier in the African series of OSPAAAL posters. While there are a handful of posters that could allude to 'the Tricontinental's global and transracial resistant subjectivity' (Garland Mahler, 2018, p. 4), this reading is complicated by the political and racial reality of African struggles during the Cold War. In contexts where the black population was oppressed by or actively resisting a white ruling elite or form of imperialism, it is difficult if not impossible to definitively separate any potential metonymic political signifier from the reality of the struggle. There are also examples of poster artists engaging colour and race in a way that I have described as the inverse of Garland Mahler's premise. In these posters, African people and African peoples are portrayed as very specifically African as opposed to black in any phenotypic or political sense. This can be observed in the use of tribal imagery and the stereotype of Africa as starving and impoverished, which differentiated Africa from Asia and Latin America. This suggests that despite the centrality of a transracial subjectivity in the political discourse and ideology of the Tricontinental Movement, the notion of Africa as a distinct region, culture and peoples dominated in the African series of OSPAAAL posters thereby refuting Garland Mahler's premise with regard to these Tricontinentalist texts.

However, the use of the colours white and black in some of the poster designs indicates that the artists were aware of the significance of this binary aesthetic in contemporary world politics. Furthermore, the use of black and white duotone and abstract colour to depict African peoples and the absence of race in other poster designs suggests that the artists were also sensitive to the subject of race. These decisions to avoid the depiction of African peoples as black mirror silences around race and colour in Cuba's domestic policy - a thread that is taken-up in the following chapter - suggesting that Garland Mahler may not have fully appreciated the influence of Cuban racial politics on OSPAAAL poster artists. Nonetheless, colour is still an important aspect of the poster designs, the way in which Africa and its people were depicted, and the role of Africa in the Tricontinental imaginary.

Although the African series of OSPAAAL posters did not disrupt the sensible by using colour as a metonymic political signifier, the analysis indicates that it challenged the sensible in other ways. Namely, through the depiction of African people and African peoples and by challenging

the sensible aesthetics of the Cold War. To elaborate, from the analysis it is clear that Africa was depicted via the people and peoples of Africa as opposed to the leaders of its governments and liberation movements - with the obvious exception of political martyrs. However, in the police order of the Cold War, Africa was marginalised as an international actor and its people rendered invisible. Thus, by depicting African people and African peoples in the context of international politics, the posters made them visible as international actors thereby challenging the police order. The posters also challenged the sensible aesthetics of the Cold War by rejecting the styles of art typically associated with socialism, adopting styles such as pop art and using abstract colour to disrupt sensible representations of race. These themes therefore form the basis of chapters six and seven, which explore the aesthetics of politics and the politics of aesthetics of the African series of OSPAAAL posters.

Chapter Five: A Cuban Perspective

As noted in chapter four, Cuba was a pivotal actor in the development of the Tricontinental Movement. Moreover, the analysis hints at the influence of Cuba's racial politics on the poster artists and their designs. This chapter therefore supplements the preceding analysis chapter by considering the role of Cuba's post-revolutionary racial politics apropos the African series of OSPAAAL posters. It begins with a brief introduction to the Cuban Revolution and race, before continuing to domestic and foreign policy, key points of conflict, and Cuba's relationship with Africa. It finds that this national perspective illuminates certain aspects of the African series of OSPAAAL posters - such as inconsistencies in the representation of race and the use of tribal imagery - indicating that the posters were products of not only the Tricontinental Movement, but also Cuban politics.

Racial Politics in Pre- and Post-Revolutionary Cuba

As Hugh Thomas (1971, p. xxi) observed, 'so much that seems obscure in the present Cuban scene becomes more comprehensible if set against the experiences of the previous four or five generations'. Indeed, Taylor (1988, p. 20) notes that 'it was principally during the slavery era and on the sugar plantations that racism in Cuba first took firm root'. Black slaves taken from Africa were an established part of the Spanish Empire and were thus present in Cuba from Diego de Velásquez's landing in 1511 (Gott, 2004, pp. 12, 24). Social theories regarding race were routinely used to rationalise black subjugation and exploitation. However, it was following the slave revolt in Saint-Domingue in 1791-1804 that racism in Cuba markedly intensified. Moving to fill the gap in sugar production left by the Saint-Domingue revolt, Cuba began to import an increasing number of slaves. In the twenty-five years between 1791 and 1817 the slave population more than doubled from 85,000 to 199,000 (Gott, 2004, p. 46). No longer a society with slaves but a slave-society, white fears of an uprising like that on Saint-Domingue fuelled racism and discrimination in Cuba (Ferrer, 2014; Morrison, 2015, p. 239).

During the next century Cuba fought three wars of independence: the Ten Year War, 1868-1878; the Little War, 1879-1880; and the Cuban War of Independence, 1895-1898 - the latter of which culminated in the Spanish-American War and Cuba's independence from Spain (Ferrer, 1999; Pérez, 2006). The Ten Year War has been described as 'the crucible of mass

nationalism in Cuba', as it marked the first time that black and white Cubans came together under the same political agenda (Knight, 1970, p. 162; Taylor, 1988, p. 21). Black Cubans comprised over seventy percent of the armies that fought in these nationalist wars, participating with the belief that a greater degree of equality would accompany the new republic. Instead, a pattern of formal inclusion and informal discrimination followed. Furthermore, the myth of racial equality served to hinder the development of a black consciousness (De la Fuente, 1998; Sawyer, 2006, pp. 36-41).

Nationalism and race therefore had a complex historical relationship in Cuba prior to the Cuban Revolution in 1959. Fulgencio Batista, the U.S.-backed military dictator of Cuba between 1952 and 1959, had had a sizeable following among the black population due to his mulatto heritage (Gott, 2004, pp. 146, 173). However, the material reforms proposed by the *Movimiento 26 de Julio* strongly appealed to the poor, the majority of whom were black. Thus, black political support shifted in favour of the new revolutionary movement (Taylor, 1988, pp. 22-23). Although race did not feature prominently in Castro's speeches or writings prior to 1959 (Moore, 1988, pp. 6-7; McGarrity, 1992 cited in Sawyer, 2006, p. 52), as Taylor (1988, p. 19) remarks, 'the Cuban Revolution […] inherited a race problem'.

In January 1959, the Rebel Army of the *Movimiento 26 de Julio* - led by Fidel Castro, Che Guevara and Camilo Cienfuegos - seized power in Havana thereby ending Fulgencio Batista's regime (Gott, 2004, pp. 166-167; Kapcia, 2008, p. 23). Although race had not featured prominently in the objectives of the *Movimiento 26 de Julio*, it quickly became a pivotal issue for two key reasons. Firstly, Castro recognised that the success of the Cuban Revolution depended on developing a broad base of public support (De la Fuente, 2001, p. 263). In 1959, at least fifty percent of the population was black (Moore, 1988, p. 15). While some gains towards racial equality had been made in the previous republic, black Cubans were still subject to racism and discrimination[17]. Castro was conscious of the feeling of discontent among the black population, which if not addressed might threaten the stability of the Revolution (Gott, 2004, p. 174). Secondly, much of the legitimisation of the *Movimiento 26 de Julio* was drawn from the shortcomings of the previous republic. Among these was the failure to create the

[17] The Cuban Constitution of 1940 formally outlawed discrimination based on race. However, as Gronbeck-Tedesco (2015, p. 123) notes, 'it was still freely practiced without penalty across the island'.

patria as imagined by José Martí - that is, inclusive irrespective of race or social class[18] (De la Fuente, 2001, pp. 259-260; Gronbeck-Tedesco, 2015, pp. 199-200; Kirk, 1983, pp. 122-123). Hence, the subject of race became an inescapable issue for the Cuban government.

The government therefore introduced a number of measures designed to improve the lives of black Cubans and reduce racial inequality. These included the abolition of discrimination in the workplace, the nationalisation of private schools and universities, and the opening of private hotels, restaurants and beaches that were previously closed to black Cubans. These measures - in tandem with broader social provisions, such as the expansion of income, education and medical services, and the reduction of rent and utility charges - reduced the inequality between the black and white populations and went a long way towards desegregating Cuban society (Taylor, 1988, p. 23). Castro also used strong language to undermine racism as counter-revolutionary and anti-national, declaring that 'what we need is to curse and publicly condemn such men who, because of ancient vices and prejudices, show no scruples in discriminating against and ill-treating Cubans because of their lighter or darker hue' (Castro, 1959 cited in Moore, 1988, p. 20). However, as Lusane (1999, p. 78) stresses, '[this] reduced racial discrimination to material relations, ignoring its political, social, and cultural-psychological dimensions'.

Furthermore, Castro found himself caught between trying to create a more inclusive society and needing to reassure white Cubans that the black population did not represent a threat (Sawyer, 2006, p. 55). Consequently, he was reluctant to implement anti-discrimination laws, stating:

> There should be no need to draft a law fixing a right inherent to human beings as members of society. Neither should it be necessary to legislate against an absolute prejudice. (Castro, 1959 cited in Moore, 1988, p. 20)

Instead, the Cuban government adopted a colour-blind approach to race, confident that the redistribution of wealth, equal access to services and public condemnation of racism would resolve racial inequality (Lusane, 1999, pp. 76, 78; Sawyer, 2006, p. 55). This in effect 'lifted barriers' as opposed to pursuing a programme of positive discrimination. Nonetheless, the

[18] See *Mi Raza* by José Martí, 1893. (Martí, 1999)

Cuban government viewed it as an effective means of tackling racial discrimination and consolidating the nation without jeopardising national unity.

This colour-blind approach to race found support in the Cuban Revolution's evolving political ideology. In December 1961, Castro announced that the Revolution was Marxist-Leninist (Domínguez, 1989, p. 34; Kapcia, 2008, p. 89). In accordance with Marxism, racial discrimination was regarded as a symptom of class conflict and material inequality. Thus, with the elimination of capitalism, racism would cease to exist (Taylor, 1988, pp. 19-20). Although this logic did not address the historical roots or social dimensions of racism, the Cuban government embraced the rhetoric that socialism had brought an end to racial discrimination. In February 1962, Castro read aloud the *Second Declaration of Havana* to a mass rally assembled in the capital. This manifesto expounded the right of the peoples of Latin America to sovereignty and independence but also made clear the Cuban government's assessment of domestic race relations.

> [Cuba has] suppressed discrimination on account of race or sex […]. It has made the enjoyment of human rights a living reality by freeing men and women from exploitation, lack of culture and social inequality. (Castro, 2008b, p. 255)

This construct of Cuba as a society free from racial discrimination helped to consolidate the nation and Cubans were encouraged to take pride in the Revolution's accomplishment. Furthermore, many black and coloured activists around the world praised Cuba as a positive example of progressive race relations, working to further consolidate a sense of national pride (Gronbeck-Tedesco, 2015, pp. 204-206; Kapcia, 2000, p. 200).

The above occurred despite a number of indications to the contrary, such as the predominance of white Cubans in senior political positions, the absence of black figures in the media and the lack of change in the teaching materials of the education system, which reflected a white euro-centric perspective of race (Taylor, 1988, p. 26). Gronbeck-Tedesco (2015, p. 215) similarly writes that:

> Historically entrenched racist norms continued in unmediated ways, with university attendance, government positions, and media professions occupied mostly by white applicants. White privilege continued to dominate the lives of everyday Afro-Cubans so that despite gaining in areas such as sports and music, black Cubans still encountered

racism in matters of work, tourist spaces, and standards of beauty. Economically, Afro-Cubans labored disproportionately to make ends meet, and religions such as Santería, Abakuá, and Palo Monte were, along with Catholicism and Protestantism, initially shunned in favor of a secular communist state.

This notwithstanding, the newly introduced policies and reforms of the Revolution did significantly improve the lives and living standards of black Cubans. In addition to abolishing institutional discrimination, the literacy campaign, redistribution of land, and better access to education, healthcare and government services did much to reduce the material inequality between black and white Cubans (Sawyer, 2006, pp. 57, 69; Taylor, 1988, p. 23).

However, with the adoption of a colour-blind approach and the declaration that racial discrimination no longer existed in Cuba, a silence descended on any issues pertaining to race. Not only was it counter-revolutionary to be racist, but also to raise the subject of race or racial inequality. As Gronbeck-Tedesco (2015, p. 218) explicates, 'while revolution brought more opportunities for Afro-Cubans, it also continued the discursive erasure of racism so that voicing criticism against racial inequality was now a form of criminal activity against the state'. The desegregation of public spaces and institutions had also abolished black societies and clubs. Thus, black groups were no longer able to mobilise around race and lost any agency through which to address racial issues (De la Fuente, 2001, pp. 279-285). Furthermore, as few black Cubans occupied senior or influential government positions, this amounted to a loss of political power (Taylor, 1988, pp. 23-24).

This uneasy silence around race is reproduced in the poster designs that avoid the representation of race or use abstract colour or black and white duotone to depict African peoples. As discussed, these posters demonstrate a sensitivity towards the subject of race but also a desire to 'sidestep' colour politics. For example, fig. 87 by Olivio Martínez refers to the conflict in Guinea-Bissau and depicts three firearms being discharged. However, the identity, appearance and therefore race of the people firing the weapons is omitted. Similarly, in fig. 69 - by Berta Abelénda, referencing South Africa - the figure is depicted in shades of green. This brings to mind military camouflage as opposed to race. This reflects Cuba's domestic racial politics, which fostered a consciously colour-blind approach to race. Thus, turning to Cuba helps to illuminate the political and social pressures facing OSPAAAL poster artists.

Revolution, Race and Foreign Policy

In addition to its role in domestic policy, race was a key part of Cuba's foreign policy. However, Cuba's post-revolutionary foreign policy was complex. The Cuban Revolution has attracted considerable academic attention partly because, in the words of Kirk (2006, p. 333), 'it simply defies logic, and it has survived, based upon its own model of development and its own distinctive foreign policy'. Indeed, there is a substantial body of literature that has sought to understand the rationale behind Cuba's foreign policy decisions - ranging from pragmatic realism to proletarian internationalism and counter-dependency to the surrogate thesis (Erisman, 2008, pp. 212-6). The following section therefore supplies a necessarily abridged discussion of foreign policy and race in post-revolutionary Cuba.

After the Cuban Revolution in January 1959, Castro and his government sought to transform the economic, social and political conditions on the island. This, in part, involved greater sovereignty and a rejection of U.S. hegemony. The United States did not welcome the presence of a socialist revolution on its doorstep and by 1960 was intent on breaking Cuba economically, withdrawing its sugar quota and imposing an embargo on exports to the island. The Cuban government, for its part, nationalised all U.S. properties and businesses and sought deeper ties with the Soviet Union (Gott, 2004, pp. 183-4; Kapcia, 2008, pp. 29-30). By the early 1960s, particularly after the Bay of Pigs in April 1961, Cuba found itself facing rapidly deteriorating relations with the superpower only ninety miles to its north. This was made all the more worrisome by the Missile Crisis in October 1962, after which Cuba felt betrayed by the Soviet Union and even more exposed to an attack by the United States (Blight and Brenner, 2002).

The United States also used its power and influence at the Organization of American States to oust Cuba and persuade the large majority of Central and South America to break ties with the new Cuban government (Garland Mahler, 2018, p. 73; Mor, 2019, p. 46). These economic and political sanctions - and that is to say nothing of the clandestine operations of the CIA - were intended to isolate and 'strangle' Castro's regime (Gott, 2004; Krull, 2014, p. 1; Pérez, 2003). Gettig (2020, p. 242) adeptly summarises how the interplay of these international relations subsequently shaped Cuba's foreign policy and approach to the Third World:

> U.S. administrations pursued three principal goals regarding Cuba, Latin America, and the Third World. First, Washington worked to isolate Cuba from the rest of the Third World. Second, it sought to isolate Latin America from the Afro-Asian world […]. Third, U.S. administrations tried to channel the Third World project toward thematic and institutional frameworks nonthreatening to U.S. interests. […] The Cuban government pursued essentially opposite goals. Cuba sought, first, to maximize Third World solidarity in order to demonstrate that it was not isolated. Second, Cuba sought to draw Latin America closer to Afro-Asia, […] a policy that positioned Cuba as a bridge between continents and a potential leader of a tri-continental movement. Third, Cuba sought to radicalize Third World internationalism, to define it as militant and uncompromising anti-imperialism, and to draw the Second and Third, nonaligned and socialist worlds together, hoping thereby to defeat U.S.-led imperialism once and for all.

Hence, Cuba reached out to the Third World in an effort to lessen its isolation and create crucial international ties. Garland Mahler (2018, p. 73) notes that as early as 1959 Castro was exploring the possibility of forging relations with the Afro-Asian bloc, an endeavour that resulted in an invitation to attend future AAPSO summits and ultimately the formation of OSPAAAL. Similarly, Gettig (2020, p. 243) states that Cuba's diplomatic overtures towards the Third World began in 1959 with Che Guevara's tour of Egypt, India, Burma, Japan, Indonesia, Ceylon, Pakistan, Iraq and Yugoslavia, laying the groundwork for Cuba's participation in the Non-Aligned Movement.

The political discourse and ideology of the Tricontinental Movement largely overlapped with that of the Cuban Revolution - not least because the former was influenced and inspired by the example of the latter. However, the movement was also a means through which Cuba could advance its foreign policy. As Gronbeck-Tedesco (2015, pp. 10, 200-201) argues, the Tricontinental was foundational to Cuba's geopolitical strategy in which it emerged as an international leader of the Third World. Indeed, it had the potential to forge international ties, lessen Cuba's economic and political isolation, further the spread of socialism and in some measure distract the attention of the United States away from Cuba specifically. It also offered a way to bring together the Second and Third World; to 'blend the two great currents of world revolution: that which was born in 1917 with the Russian Revolution, and that which [represented] the anti-imperialist and national liberation movements' (Barka, 1965 cited in

Barcia, 2009, p. 209). Cuba, with its links to the Soviet Union, positioned itself as the torchbearer of these two revolutionary currents (Getchell, 2020, pp. 155-157).

In addition to seeking international relations, Cuba actively supported revolutionary movements in Latin America and Africa (Brown, 2017; De la Fuente, 2001, p. 298; Gleijeses, 2002; 2013). This policy of 'exporting the Revolution' was based on the success of the Cuban Revolution and the theory that it could be repeated elsewhere in the world. As Hatzky (2012, p. 67) summarises, the main principles were as follows:

> 1. Popular forces can win a war against a regular army; 2. The rebellious core of a guerrilla army can create the preconditions for revolution, even if those preconditions do not exist objectively; 3. In underdeveloped America, the armed struggle must be fought in rural areas.

In the African series of OSPAAAL posters, people were frequently depicted as armed revolutionaries and guerrilla soldiers. See, for example, figs. 1, 25, 62, 67 and 78, which variously depict people in combat gear with rifles and often include the suggestion of dense undergrowth, bushland or a rural setting. Although many of the liberation movements in Africa were at times engaged in guerrilla warfare, for example in Algeria, the Congo, Guinea-Bissau, Mozambique, Zimbabwe, Angola, Namibia and Morocco; for Cuba, Africa was a place to potentially 'export the Revolution', continuing the struggle of the Cuban Revolution against imperialism. Hence, African people were portrayed as armed revolutionaries and guerrilla soldiers reflecting not only Cuba's own experience of revolution but also its expectations for liberation movements in Africa. As with the Tricontinental, 'exporting the Revolution' addressed many of Cuba's foreign policy concerns by fomenting the spread of socialist revolution, in effect creating allies and thereby lessening its political isolation. Halliday (1999, p. 121) comments that the aim was 'to overstretch the USA and in so doing to fend off pressure on Cuba itself'. Furthermore, the Tricontinental Movement offered a transnational network of solidarity through which to 'export the Revolution' throughout the Third World. Thus, Cuba presented itself as a model of revolution and source of aid (Halliday, 1999, p. 118).

In this context, two narratives regarding race emerged. The first was derived from the construct of Cuba as a colour-blind or race-less society that had achieved racial equality. As Gronbeck-Tedesco (2015, p. 199) notes, 'Cuba became the oft-cited exemplum of a new

antiracist vision that claimed the country was now free from racial segregation and economic inequality'. This proved to be a useful means of gaining international respect and recognition in the first few years of the Revolution. In 1959 and 1960, the Cuban government invited a number of intellectuals, political figures and journalists from around the world to Havana to witness the progress of the Revolution. The campaign was successful and positive accounts of the Cuban Revolution soon appeared in news and media worldwide (De la Fuente, 2001, pp. 296-297; Gronbeck-Tedesco, 2015, pp. 198-199). Many also drew comparisons between Cuba and the United States that were favourable to the former.

> The important lesson in the Cuban experience, is that great social change need not wait on the patient education of white supremacists. […] Surely a powerful and secure government like that of the United States could, if it chose, achieve remarkable results. If the democratic press, of which we boast, needs several generations to achieve what the Cubans have done in 18 months, then there is something wrong with it. (Mayfield, 1960 cited in De la Fuente, 2001, p. 297)

This served as a means to embarrass the United States, which was struggling to manage a period of strained race relations and black activism. Similarly, Castro's attendance at the United Nations General Assembly in New York in 1960 served to spotlight racial inequality in the United States while promoting Cuba's own approach to race and racism. On arrival at the Shelburne Hotel in Central Manhattan, the Cuban delegation was denied entry without a $10,000 cash advance. Refusing, Castro decamped to the Hotel Theresa in Harlem, a significantly less affluent and predominantly black neighbourhood. Rodriguez (2005, p. 62) writes:

> A downpour did not deter some two thousand U.S. blacks, Dominicans, Cubans, Puerto Ricans, and other Caribbean peoples from greeting Castro in Harlem. At one of the many rallies held for him during his stay, one Harlemite held up a sign that read "US Jim Crows Fidel just like US Jim Crows Us Negroes." Castro subsequently held meetings from his Harlem base with Egyptian president Gamal Abdel Nasser and Indian prime minister Jawaharlal Nehru, as well as the United States' own Malcom X and Robert F. Williams. Castro's image as a symbolic hero for postcolonial and racialized peoples had been solidified.

The comparison between Cuba as a race-less society and the United States as a society with a race problem was also conveyed back to the Cuban population. As De la Fuente (2001, p. 300)

explains, ‘Cubans were reminded, on almost a daily basis, that they lived in a superior society’. Furthermore, the Cuban government drew on the domestic construct of Cuba as a race-less society to underscore what socialism could achieve. At the same time, it contended that the poor race relations of the United States were an example of the perils of capitalism (Moore, 1988, pp. 62-3; Sawyer, 2006, p. 60). This rhetoric associated imperialism with racism and socialism with racial equality.

The second narrative portrayed Cuba as an Afro-Cuban society. In this construct, Castro emphasised Cuba’s black population and African heritage. For example, at the United Nations General Assembly in 1960 he stressed the historical links between Cuba and Africa, describing the latter as ‘this Continent from which came millions of slaves’ (Castro cited in Glick, 1964, p. 239); and in 1966, famously, but not for the last time, declared that ‘the blood of Africa runs deep in our veins’ (Castro cited in Lusane, 1999, p. 73). Castro even went as far as to petition the Organisation of African Unity for membership based on the notion that Cuba was an ‘overseas African country’ (Gronbeck-Tedesco, 2015, p. 210; Moore, 1988, p. 251). A key example of this second racial construct occurred at the Bay of Pigs in April 1961. While questioning the captured black Cuban exiles, Castro stated that ‘they were guilty of treason on two counts: they had betrayed the country and betrayed their race’ (Castro cited in Sawyer, 2006, p. 59). Here, he suggested that attacking Cuba was akin to attacking the transnational black community.

The success of Cuba’s intervention in Angola in 1975 only strengthened the narrative of Cuba as an Afro-Cuban society. As discussed in chapter four, the racial dimension of the conflict was hard to ignore. Within days the intervention was being extolled as ‘the return of the slaves’ with contemporary accounts noting the Angolan origins of many Cuban slaves and drawing comparisons between Cuba’s history of slave rebellions and Angola’s liberation struggle (Kapcia, 2000, pp. 199-200; 2008, p. 106). Castro (1979 cited in Hatzky, 2012, p. 83) summarised the role of race in Cuba’s relationship with Angola, stating:

> The imperialists want to prevent us from helping our Angolan Brothers. But we have to tell the Yankees that they should bear in mind that we are not only a Latin American nation, we are also an Afro-American nation. The blood of Africa runs deep in our veins. And it was from Africa, as slaves, that many of our ancestors came to this country. […]

> We are duty-bound by our principals, our ideology, our convictions, and our own blood to defend Angola, to defend Africa.

Thus, through this Afro-Cuban construct Castro reached out to Africa and African Americans, building on the pan-African movement to draw together the Afro-Asian bloc, Latin America and the Third World Left in the United States. In the geopolitical and ideological context of the Cold War where the Soviet Union, China, Europe and the United States were all vying for influence in the Third World, Cuba's links to Africa and the African diaspora were an emotive connection that the aforementioned countries could not replicate (Gronbeck-Tedesco, 2015, p. 210; Taylor, 1988, p. 28). It also had an historical precedent in the form of Afro-Cuban solidarity during the Italo-Ethiopian War in 1935-1936, when European imperialism threatened the African continent (Lambe, 2019). The construct of Cuba as an Afro-Cuban society therefore enabled Cuba to capitalise on the role of Africa, the African diaspora and anti-black racism within the Tricontinental Movement. As Gronbeck-Tedesco (2015, p. 209) notes, 'the Cuban state aggressively pursued a place of leadership by highlighting race and revolution'.[19]

Conflicting Constructs

Thus, in the domestic context a colour-blind approach to race dominated and Cuba was portrayed as a race-less society free from racial inequality and discrimination. In foreign policy, Cuba was also portrayed as an Afro-Cuban society, emphasising Cuba's black population and African heritage. Clearly, there is a contradiction between these two constructs. In the first, racial inequality and discrimination were conceptualised as symptoms of material inequality and class conflict. With the adoption of Marxist-Leninism, the subject of race was silenced. Castro argued that the Cuban Revolution had finally achieved Martí's vision of the *patria*, where 'man is more than white, more than mulatto, more than Negro' (Loughridge, 1945, p.

[19] This Afro-Cuban construct legitimised Cuba's overtures towards Africa to not only an international, but also a domestic audience. Cubans and Africans were portrayed as part of the same transnational fraternity, such that Cubans conceptualised African peoples as 'brothers in arms' in the fight against imperialism and racial oppression. This helped to create public support for Cuba's involvement in Africa, which relied on tens of thousands of Cubans volunteering overseas. (Gleijeses, 2006; Sawyer, 2006)

127). In the second, the concept of race that was silenced in the domestic sphere was embraced in order to portray Cuba as Afro-Cuban. This construct relied on Cuba's black population and historical links to Africa and the African diaspora through the transatlantic slave trade. It also emphasised these to distance Cuba from the 'white imperialism' associated with the United States and Europe. The fundamental difference between these two constructs was the silencing and emphasis of race; or, in other words, the invisibility and visibility of race. However, despite the inherent contradiction between these two constructs, both existed side by side in post-revolutionary Cuba.

This conceptual contradiction did, however, create very real tensions. For example, the fear of being counter-revolutionary by raising the subject of race was mixed with pride in Cuba's role in pan-African struggles. As Pérez Sarduy and Stubbs (2000, p. xi) comment, 'many felt discomfort at having to think more in racial terms; however, there was also an affirmation of pride in being black'. It also created tension when black activists from the United States and Africa visited Cuba. Although Castro regularly praised advocates of 'black power' at international events, black activists framed their struggle in racial terms. This was problematic if they spoke at rallies in Cuba, as the Cuban government preferred to discourage the subject of race at home (De la Fuente, 2001, pp. 300-302). This was the experience of black American activists Robert F. Williams, Eldridge Cleaver and Stokely Carmichael. Williams and Cleaver, for example, fled the United States for Cuba. Gronbeck-Tedesco (2015, p. 218) writes that 'Williams found this type of censorship problematic, causing him and his wife to leave Cuba and seek greener pastures in China and North Vietnam' (see also Rodriguez, 2005). Similarly, though Castro welcomed him, Cleaver was warned not to speak at public rallies or events. In the end, he concluded that 'Cuba's leaders, in giving public support to black liberation struggle abroad, while failing to complete that aspect of the Revolution at home, were guilty of a certain hypocrisy' (Lockwood, 1970, p. 19). Carmichael also assumed that he would find political support in Cuba, but ultimately disagreed with the assertion that communism addressed the problem of racism (Gronbeck-Tedesco, 2015; Seidman, 2012).

These conflicting constructs also shed light on the inconsistency in the representation of race in the African series of OSPAAAL posters. As discussed in chapter four, many of the poster designs directly engage with race and colour politics. However, in others, representations of race are absent or avoided through the use of bright colours, duotone images or abstraction.

This inconsistency between race being visible and invisible speaks of the tension between Cuba's two racial constructs, suggesting that the poster artists similarly wrestled with these two narratives regarding race. Echoing Yevgeniy Fiks' - a post-Soviet conceptual artist - comments on Soviet propaganda and imagery from the twentieth century, the Cuban legacy on race is far from uniform. It is both complex and contradictory, including genuine internationalism, anti-racism and solidarity alongside racial stereotyping and objectification. It is 'by no means totally progressive and by no means a pure propaganda pretence' (Fiks cited in Goff, 2016, para. 5).

Cuba, Castro and Africa

In the 1960s and early 1970s Cuba's activity in Africa was modest compared to its interventions in Latin America. Although it included a determined effort by Che Guevara to spark a continent-wide revolution from the Congo in 1965 and support to liberation movements in Algeria, Angola, Guinea-Bissau and Mozambique, by the mid-1970s the two military columns in the Congo and the Republic of the Congo had been withdrawn and other support reduced to technical assistance and a small military presence in Guinea-Bissau (Gleijeses, 2002; Gott, 2004). In part, this stemmed from the differing ambitions of the Cubans and their African counterparts. While the former imagined Africa as the next stage in a worldwide socialist revolution against imperialism, the latter were focused on their own national struggles and sovereignty. For example, during his tour of the continent in 1965, Che Guevara was met by an Africa unwilling to fight beyond national borders. Gott (2004, p. 224) notes:

> Most Africans did not share Guevara's internationalism. They were prepared to fight only for the liberation of their own country, not for the continent. […] The Cubans came to Africa with their own set of experiences and distinct views about what should be done. The Africans, closer to their own reality, had another view.

Indeed, a number of examples in the African series of OSPAAAL posters link the struggle of specific countries to the continent as a whole exemplifying this view of Africa. For example, in fig. 51 an image of Patrice Lumumba shaped like the African continent illustrates the 'DAY OF SOLIDARITY WITH THE CONGO'. Fig. 84 states 'For the future of Africa / LONG LIVE THE PEOPLE'S REPUBLIC OF ANGOLA!' and depicts Angola (in green) as part of Africa (in yellow). In

fig. 55 the text asserts the Tricontinental Movement's opposition to apartheid in South Africa, while the main image depicts a shirtless man with a bleeding heart shaped like the African continent. This conveys the notion that apartheid strikes at the heart of Africa. It is also worth noting that a further eight posters - figs. 21, 24, 35, 50, 70, 88, 89 and 90 - refer to Africa as a whole, similarly suggesting that to Cubans the continent was more than the sum of its parts.

Although Cuba's efforts to 'export the Revolution' were at first focused on Latin America, by the mid-1970s this gave way to a growing interest in Africa. The lack of progress regarding liberation movements in Latin America had been compounded by the failure of the guerrilla expedition and death of Che Guevara in Bolivia in October 1967. However, in November 1975, Cuba took the world by surprise when it deployed thirty-six thousand troops to Angola to assist the MPLA against the FNLA and UNITA (George, 2005; Gleijeses, 2002). On Cuba's intervention in Angola, Castro stated, 'at the request of the MPLA, the leadership of our party decided to send with great urgency a battalion of regular troops with anti-tank weapons to help the Angolan patriots resist the invasion of the South African racists' (Castro, 1976 cited in Bain, 2007, p. 28). The Cuban troops turned the tide of the conflict, pushing back UNITA despite its military support from the United States and South Africa.

Victory in Angola in 1975 revived Castro's enthusiasm for the revolutionary potential of Africa and in February 1977 he set off on a tour of the continent taking in Algeria, Libya, the Horn of Africa, Tanzania, Mozambique and Angola. It was during this tour that Castro began to appreciate the nuances of African politics - a notable departure from his previous conceptualisation of the continent as 'a blank sheet of paper' (Gott, 2004, pp. 256-258); 'one could say that I discovered Africa, just as Christopher Columbus discovered America' (Castro, 1977 cited in Gott, 2004, p. 258). Indeed, this might go some way towards explaining the at times simplistic illustration of African struggles in OSPAAAL posters during the 1960-1970s. Castro also argued that Africa could transition directly from tribalism to socialism.

> Africa is imperialism's weakest link today. It is there that the biggest crimes against humanity have been committed recently. Perfect opportunities exist there for the transformation from quasitribalism to socialism, without having to go through the various stages that were necessary in other parts of the world. […] Today, Africa has attained great importance. Imperialist domination is not as strong here as it is in Latin

> America. Therefore, real possibilities exist for a fundamental evolution of the African continent. (Castro, 1977, para. 15-16)

This transition 'from quasitribalism to socialism' was a particularly Marxist-inspired notion based on the premise that socialism was the endpoint of a linear model of societal development. Thus, Africa could 'skip' capitalism and progress straight to socialism. It also highlights that Africa was considered tribal and at an earlier stage of development than Cuba, which is reflected in the use of tribal imagery in the African series of OSPAAAL posters. In addition, Peters (2012, pp. 100-103) explains that Cuba's intervention in Angola generated two 'myths': 'the myth of return to an idyllic African past' and 'the myth of return to traditional African values'. These 'myths' imagined a debased interlude of European enslavement between an idyllic ancestral tribal life in Africa and an emancipated future featuring a return to precolonial traditional African values. Hence, an image of 'tribal Africa' was exoticised and romanticised within Cuba.

During his tour of Africa, the main event that caught Castro's attention was the revolution unfolding in the Horn of Africa. In Ethiopia, Colonel Mengistu Haile Mariam had assumed power and declared his intention to establish a Marxist-Leninist regime. While this would have tipped the balance between capitalism and communism in the Horn of Africa in favour of the Soviet bloc, Mengistu was at odds with the also socialist but less radical regime in Somalia. Allied to Somalia but keen to encourage the Ethiopian revolution, Castro attempted to broker an agreement between the two countries. His efforts, however, were unsuccessful and Cuba began supplying military assistance to Ethiopia, while Somalia sought support from the United States. On the subject, Castro explained:

> A profound revolution is taking place in Ethiopia. […] We believe that the success and consolidation of the Ethiopian revolution is extremely important for Africa. I believe that Mengistu is a true revolutionary and that the revolution now being carried out in that country is a true revolution. (Castro, 1977, paras. 17, 22)

As with Cuba's intervention in Angola, Cuba's military assistance proved decisive and by March 1978 the Somalian forces had withdrawn (Gleijeses, 2013; Gott, 2004, pp. 256-260). However, though this was a significant part of Cuba's involvement in Africa and an important part of the Cold War, it is not very visible in the African series of OSPAAAL posters. There is only one

poster that references Ethiopia and it was printed in 1967. This perhaps reflects the increasing silence around Cuba's activity in Africa in the late 1970s and 1980s.

Although the Cuban government planned to withdraw from Angola following the victory of the MPLA, the conflict between the South West Africa People's Organisation (SWAPO) and South African forces in Namibia began to encroach into southern Angola. Consequently, despite a desire to minimise overseas expenditures, the Cuban government continued to support the MPLA and SWAPO in the struggle for Namibian independence and strongly opposed apartheid South Africa throughout the late 1970s and 1980s (George, 2005; Gleijeses, 2006). Saney (2006) notes that while often unacknowledged in the literature, Cuba played a critical role in securing Namibia's independence and defeating the apartheid regime of South Africa. However, this resulted in silences at home regarding Cuba's involvement in Africa due to both rising costs and mounting casualties. Hatzky (2012, p. 88) notes that as Cuba's involvement in Southern Africa became more protracted, Castro mentioned it less and less in public addresses, stating that 'in the end the people of Cuba were kept in the dark about the increasingly difficult political and military situation'.

Thus, a Cuban perspective illuminates certain aspects of the African series of OSPAAAL posters - such as the prevalence of armed revolutionaries and guerrilla soldiers, inconsistencies in the representation of race and by extension the use of colour, the simplistic illustration of African struggles, and the use of tribal imagery. Although OSPAAAL was ostensibly an international and transnational organisation, the posters were also influenced by Cuban politics. Indeed, the poster artists themselves were Cuban, living and working in Havana, and as such, subject to the politics of the Cuban Revolution. This is perhaps why despite the centrality of a transracial subjectivity in the political discourse and ideology of the Tricontinental Movement, colour did not act as a metonymic political signifier in the African series of OSPAAAL posters. The posters therefore occupy a space between the international, transnational and national, which underscores why divisions between the national and international are problematic in the study of world politics. This research, in contrast, takes an aesthetic-political approach, finding an alternative way of studying the politics of the Cold War. The following chapters thus explore the politics and then aesthetics of the African series of OSPAAAL posters.

Chapter Six: Making the Invisible, Visible

This chapter explores the idea that the African series of OSPAAAL posters disrupted the distribution of the sensible of the Cold War by means of politics. In chapter four, the analysis highlights that Africa was depicted via the people and peoples of Africa as opposed to the leaders of its governments. However, in the police order, Africa was marginalised as an international actor and its people rendered invisible. Thus, by depicting African peoples in the context of international politics, the posters made them visible, framed them as international actors and thereby challenged the police order. As noted in chapter two, politics lies in the polemic redistribution of subjects and identities - a dissensual process that Rancière describes as 'the aesthetics of politics'. This chapter explores this process with regard to the African series of OSPAAAL posters and finds that by demonstrating an alternative way of imagining the international community and its actors that conflicted with the police, the posters challenged what was sensible and created space for the possibility of a new sensible of the Cold War. This was effected by making the invisible, visible - through the identification of a *dēmos*, the subjectivation of the political subject and the visual demonstration of an alternative voice.

The People of Africa, Asia and Latin America

Beginning with the identification of a *dēmos*, this section explains how the African series of OSPAAAL posters worked to identify a *dēmos* in the international community of the Cold War; namely, the people of Africa, Asia and Latin America. This also marks the inception of the Tricontinental imaginary - the way in which the Tricontinental community and its politics were imagined as part of the international. *Dēmos* is a Greek term adopted by Rancière that denotes 'the commons', 'plebians', 'citizens' or 'the people' and refers to those who have no part in the communal distribution of the sensible (Rockhill, 2004a, p. 84). In ancient Greek, it referred to the whole community, but also a particular section of that community (Elden, 2003, p. 135). As Rancière (2010, p. 32) explains using the example of 'the poor':

> Before being the name of a community, the demos is the name of a part of the community: the poor. But the 'poor', precisely, does not designate an economically disadvantaged part of the population, but simply the people who do not count […]. To be of the *demos* is to be outside of the count, to have no speech to be heard. […] The

> one who belongs to the *demos*, who speaks when he is not to speak, is the one who partakes in what he has no part in.

According to the logic of the police, the *dēmos* does not exist, as the police maintain that all of the community has been counted. Politics, however, rejects the police order and draws attention to the part of those without part, the very existence of the *dēmos*.

The African series of OSPAAAL posters depicts the people and peoples of Africa in relation to the international politics of the Cold War. There is a clear focus in aesthetic terms on 'people' or their metonymic representation. However, as discussed, the people of Africa, Asia and Latin America had no part in the police distribution of the sensible. Thus, by framing them as international actors, the African series of OSPAAAL posters, along with the wider collection of OSPAAAL posters, worked to identify a *dēmos* in the international community of the Cold War - moving the people of Africa, Asia and Latin America from invisibility to visibility. This was effected in part through the designs of the posters, the accompanying text and the OSPAAAL logo. For example, as noted in chapter four, fig. 80 depicts a four-petalled flower with the OSPAAAL logo at its centre and the text 'DISAPPEARANCE OF BEN BARKA (OCTOBRE 29)'. While one petal refers to the disappearance of Mehdi Ben Barka in October 1965, the other three petals each represent one of the three Tricontinental continents. The images for each continent come from previous poster designs by the artist Jesús Forjans, see figs. 70, 81 and 82, which reference the people of Africa, Asia and Latin America respectively. Thus, the people of Africa, Asia and Latin America are portrayed as a group united by OSPAAAL. The majority of the posters also use text to reference 'the people of…' specific countries or Africa more broadly, often via 'international' or 'world days of solidarity', a calendar of events created by OSPAAAL. Fig. 33, for example, prominently displays the text *'JOURNEE DE SOLIDARITE INTERNATIONALE AVEC LE PEUPLE DE ZIMBABWE'*; and fig. 89, *'SEMANA MUNDIAL DE SOLIDARIDAD CON LOS PUEBLOS DE AFRICA'*. These references to the people of Africa are augmented by the OSPAAAL logo, which is present in nearly all of the poster designs. The logo comprises a sphere - signifying the world - and an outstretched arm clasping a rifle above the acronym OSPAAAL, the overall design of which speaks directly to the organisation's vision of armed global resistance to imperialism via the three Tricontinental continents. Thus, the logo brings to mind the notion of the people of Africa, Asia and Latin America as a united group. Hence, through the designs of the posters, the accompanying text and the OSPAAAL logo, the

African series of OSPAAAL posters begins to identify the people and peoples of Africa as part of the larger 'people of Africa, Asia and Latin America'.

While these aspects of the posters begin to identify the people of Africa, Asia and Latin America as a distinct group, it is their cumulative effect that outlines the *dēmos*. Individually, each poster focuses on a specific country or continent. However, it is through the entire collection of OSPAAAL posters that the *dēmos* is delineated. From its inception in 1966 to its recent closure in 2019, OSPAAAL published hundreds of poster designs that collectively referenced the people of Africa, Asia and Latin America. The cumulative effect of propaganda, advertising and marketing is widely acknowledged. For example, on the subject of Hollywood films in the period after World War II, Jowett and O'Donnell (2018, p. 112) comment:

> Research has clearly demonstrated that movies, like other mass media, rarely bring about a major change of opinion; however, we also know that consistent exposure to a specific point of view […] stands a good chance of making some impact. Thus, the cumulative effect of filmic propaganda is greater than any individual film.

Thus, while the OSPAAAL posters worked to identify the people of Africa, Asia and Latin America as a distinct group in the context of the international politics of the Cold War, the individual posters themselves were limited as strategic interventions in mobilising the *dēmos*.

However, a *dēmos* is not simply a new group but the part of those without part. This applied to the people of Africa, Asia and Latin America on two accounts. In the first instance, Africa, Asia and Latin America were accorded less importance than the United States, Europe and the Soviet Union in the international politics of the Cold War owing to the focus on the superpowers, their nuclear capabilities, hard military power, and (post)colonial patterns of thought that conceptualised the three Tricontinental continents as peripheral to the centre of power in 'the West'. Secondly, international actors were conceptualised as nation-states. The people of a country were not considered to play a part in international politics separate to their respective government. Indeed, 'people' did not possess or wield nuclear weapons or national military forces, some of the key determinates of the police order of international politics. Consequently, the OSPAAAL posters worked to identify not only a distinct group, but also a *dēmos* in the sensible of the Cold War - a part of the international community that had no part, the people of Africa, Asia and Latin America.

The identification of a *dēmos* disrupts the distribution of the sensible as it cannot be counted - or accounted for - by the police, as the police maintain that there is no part of those without part. Thus, the identification of a part outside the count of the police causes a recount or redistribution of the sensible (Rancière, 1999; 2010). As Tanke (2011, p. 52) explains, 'the presence of the *dēmos* impacts the entire community, for the simple reason that it cannot begin to take part without altering the distribution of the sensible constituted at its expense'. Hence, the very existence of the *dēmos*, its identification, the act of it gaining visibility and coming into being as a political subject, contests assumptions about who belongs, what capacities they possess and what roles they can occupy.

Here, the identification of the people of Africa, Asia and Latin America as a distinct group in the context of the international politics of the Cold War disrupted the distribution of the sensible as international actors were defined as nation-states and the international community ordered according to national military power and nuclear capabilities. The *dēmos*, in contrast, was transnational and based on people-to-people solidarity fostered through a shared experience of oppression[20]. As a result, the sensible had to adjust to accommodate the notion of the people of Africa, Asia and Latin America as an international actor. This meant creating space for a new distribution of the sensible that was inclusive towards non-state actors and non-military power and offered a new way of imagining how the international community could be organised during the Cold War.

Indeed, this logic had informed the development of the Tricontinental Movement and the Tricontinental imaginary through the Bandung Conference, AAPSO, NAM and the Tricontinental Conference. As discussed in chapter four, these key events and organisations sought to forge a new alternative path that reimagined the international community of the Cold War; specifically, through non-alignment, mutual support, cooperation and trans-affective solidarity. Following the formation of AAPSO, non-governmental and non-state actors were also regularly included and by the Tricontinental Conference in January 1966,

[20] Of course, as discussed in chapter five, national influences did act on the poster artists and consequently the poster designs. However, though Cuba co-opted the Tricontinental Movement into its own foreign policy agenda, this did not fundamentally alter how the Tricontinental community was imagined.

people-to-people solidarity had become a central component. Consequently, through the identification of a part without part, a *dēmos*, OSPAAAL posters challenged who could be an actor in the international politics of the Cold War and the sensible of the international community itself.

Imagining the Tricontinental Community

The African series of OSPAAAL posters also challenged the sensible of the international through the subjectivation of the political subject, an activity that continued on from the identification of a *dēmos*. Variously translated as subjectivation, subjectivization or subjectification, *la subjectivation*, for Rancière, 'is the process by which a political subject extracts itself from the dominant categories of identification and classification' (Rockhill, 2004a, p. 92). Rancière (1999, p. 35) states:

> By *subjectification* I mean the production through a series of actions of a body and a capacity for enunciation not previously identifiable within a given field of experience, whose identification is thus part of the reconfiguration of the field of experience.

Thus, as with the identification of a *dēmos*, subjectivation is an integral part of the political redistribution of the sensible. As Davis (2010, p. 91) explains:

> The *sans-part*, prior to subjectivation, is invisible as a political subject. […] To become a political subject is to be heard and seen, and politics is the process of reconfiguring the ways in which subjects are heard and seen.

Subjectivation, then, is the process by which a *dēmos* is formed. Or, in Tanke's (2011, p. 67) words, 'the process by which the part of those without part struggle, in spite of their differences, to constitute themselves as a subject'. It is therefore the enactment of equality and functions as both the rejection of identities imposed by the police and the adoption of new identities that defy the police count (Hinderliter *et al.*, 2009, p. 8; Rancière, 1992). We can also understand it as how a *dēmos* is imagined, i.e., what form it takes and characteristics it possesses in the collective imagination. In this instance, the form of the Tricontinental imaginary. Thus, it was the process by which the non-part of the people of Africa, Asia and Latin America was rejected in favour of a new alternative identity - one that was based on trans-affective solidarity and armed warfare, assumed new ways of counting the international community and thereby challenged the sensible of the international.

Rendering the New Political Subject

The African series of OSPAAAL posters played a part in this subjectivation of the political subject by depicting a) the new political subject, and b) its impossible name. Beginning with the depiction of the political subject, by this I mean that the OSPAAAL posters gave the *dēmos* form and substance. For Rancière (1992, p. 62), political subjectivation is always a demonstration. As Davis (2010, p. 86) explains, 'the emergence of the subject in subjectivation is always also an emergence into the realm of perception, of visibility and audibility: it is a manifestation'. Indeed, 'it is only through the elaboration of bodies and voices not identified in the distribution of the sensible that politics takes place' (Tanke, 2011, p. 67). The OSPAAAL posters served as that manifestation of visibility and audibility, elaborating through their designs the people of Africa, Asia and Latin America. Here, it is useful to consider Mor's (2019, p. 44) concept of 'rendering'.

> "To render" can mean to provide or to give, such as to "render service," and can be used in this way to describe the means by which knowledge of some form is submitted for consideration, or otherwise delivered. […] Rendering, furthermore, means to artistically represent, depict, or visually describe, and by such means to interpret or express. I use the notion of rendering to point to the many ways that the visual can communicate judgement, suggest ethical considerations, describe the particularity of events and to frame narratives in the service of political consciousness.

Thus, we can think of the African series of OSPAAAL posters as 'rendering' the political subject, the literal and conceptual illustration of the people of Africa; a process that implied the rejection of police identities, the adoption of new identities, and as a consequence, the reimagination of the sensible.

Hence, the political subject was attributed a number of roles and characteristics via the African series of OSPAAAL posters. Firstly, and perhaps most prominently, the people and peoples of Africa were depicted as fighters; or rather, as actively fighting or resisting various forms of oppression and imperialism. This was largely conveyed through the depiction of guerrilla soldiers and the inclusion of small arms and weapons. See, for example, figs. 1, 25, 38, 39, 40, 41, 61, 62, 63, 64, 67, 78, 89 and 91. However, it was also conveyed through designs such as fig. 75, which shows the repeating image of a man holding up his fists in a boxing stance, figs.

59 and 88, which show the raised fists of a Namibian crowd and an African man, and fig. 58, which states 'FIGHT. HOMAGE TO THE FIGHTER'. As discussed in chapters four and five, this was in part influenced by Cuba's experience of revolution; but also, efforts to articulate the 'New Man'.

Following the Cuban Revolution in 1959, the government sought to outline and create a new revolutionary man that would embody the ideals, values and morals of the Revolution itself. This 'New Man' was part of the 'Great Debate' on the political, economic and ethical strategies needed to build a non-capitalist society (Chomsky *et al.*, 2003, p. 370); and was described by Che Guevara in his essay 'Man and Socialism':

> The road to success is pictured as beset with perils - perils that, it would seem, an individual with the proper qualities can overcome […] In this period of the building of socialism we can see the new man being born. (Guevara, 2003a, p. 371)

After Che Guevara's death in Bolivia in 1967, his martyred image came to represent the essence of this 'New Man': strong, brave, sensitive, and an antidote to capitalism. This emphasis on strength and military prowess as a guerrilla fighter likely influenced Cuban artists' depictions of African peoples and African struggles.

At the other end of the spectrum, the posters also depicted the people and peoples of Africa as victims, often suffering, silently, and in a far more passive capacity. For example, as starving, see figs. 11, 35, 36 and 37; under arrest or imprisoned, see figs. 32 and 33; or, through reference to the repression of the Soweto uprising, see figs. 79 and 92. This latter example began as a peaceful student protest against the introduction of Afrikaans in black schools in South Africa in June 1967. However, it was met by police brutality and violence. In the township of Soweto, the police opened fire on the crowds of students sparking weeks of local unrest. Among those killed was a thirteen-year-old boy named Hector Pieterson. The photograph of his body in the arms of Mbuyisa Makhubu, fig. 93 - reproduced in fig. 92 - quickly came to symbolise the Soweto uprising and the cruelty of apartheid South Africa (Brown, 2016; Heffernan and Nieftagodien, 2016). This contrast between actively fighting imperialism and passive victims of oppression demonstrates that the *dēmos* was not a one-dimensional construct but a complex political subject that inhabited multiple and sometimes conflicting roles.

For the most part, the African series of OSPAAAL posters depicts men. See, for example, figs. 1, 55, 69 and 91. All of the intellectual leaders depicted in the posters are also male. Indeed, Corrigan (2014, p. 71) notes that there is a 'prevalence of heroic men in Cuban posters'; while Cushing (2003, p. 12) comments that very few women worked as graphic designers or artists in Cuba. As a result, it is tempting to surmise that the posters reflect a male-dominated and patriarchal conceptualisation of the political subject - particularly given the valorisation of masculine characteristics in Cuba's 'New Man' (Chomsky *et al.*, 2003, p. 370; Corrigan, 2014). However, a gendered reading elicits a different conclusion. In 1983 Raewyn Connell coined the term 'hegemonic masculinity', drawing on Antonio Gramsci's concept of hegemony and contemporary critiques of masculinity to explain the emergence of gender roles within frameworks of power (Connell, 1998; 2014; Corrigan, 2014, p. 72). It has since been applied to the study of world politics to explore how international actors adopt or are imbued with gender roles or gendered characteristics. The United States, for example, is associated with masculine traits such as power, autonomy and military strength. However, hegemonic masculinity is also dependent on the existence of subordinate and devalued femininities (Tickner, 1992, pp. 6-7).

As Cynthia Weber (1999) argues, the United States has applied a feminising discourse to Cuba ever since the former 'rescued' the latter from the Spanish in the Spanish-American War in 1898. Since then, relations between the United States and Cuba have been framed by a dualism of masculinity and femininity, where Cuba is portrayed as the feminine, passive and exotic complement to the masculinised United States. Indeed, following the Cuban Revolution in 1959, the United States' language regarding Cuba reflected a desire to 'rescue' the island from communism. Speaking apropos the Bay of Pigs in 1961, President John F. Kennedy explained, 'our objection isn't to the Cuban Revolution, it is to the fact that Castro has turned it over to the communists' (Schlesinger, 1965, p. 245). As Corrigan (2014, p. 75) emphasises, 'gender became a major constitutive vernacular through which the United States and Cuba negotiated the geopolitical changes following the Cuban Revolution'. Thus, the posters actually reflect an attempt to assert a masculine identity in opposition to the feminising discourse of the United States. In contrast to the passive and exotic other, poster artists invoked gendered characteristics such as power, strength, independence and bravery to create a new international identity for the *dēmos*.

However, at the same time, the *dēmos* was not portrayed as exclusively male. There are posters that use abstract objects, abstract designs or gender ambiguous figures to circumvent the male-female binary, and many more that depict women. Of the posters that depict women (figs. 21, 24, 38, 47, 48, 64, 66 and 94), they are portrayed as female revolutionaries or through more traditional representations of motherhood. For example, fig. 66 is an ink sketch of a woman wearing rifle cartridges in place of a headdress and clothing. The poster, published in 1972, references 'February 4, Day of World Solidarity with the struggle of the people of Angola'. By 'wearing' a symbol associated with guerrilla soldiers and armed resistance to imperialism, the image merges the everyday domestic sphere of women with the masculine sphere of the revolutionary fighter. In fig. 21, published in 1977, the representation of a female revolutionary is layered with connotations of motherhood - signified through the rifle held aloft in one arm and the baby encircled by the other arm - similarly merging masculine and feminine performances of gender[21]. Indeed, with regard to women in OSPAAAL posters, Hanna (2020, p. 170) finds 'two affective aesthetic tactics: the mobilization of images of women represented as actors in armed struggle, and more commonly gendered representation of motherhood'. Thus, these posters worked to redefine traditional gender roles as part of the subjectivation of the political subject through not only the inclusion of women, but also their depiction as feminine *and* armed revolutionaries.

Of the posters that depict people, nearly all are young or youthful. The only exceptions in the African series of OSPAAAL posters are a handful of designs that refer to specific intellectual leaders, such as Olof Palme in fig. 95 who was 59 when he was assassinated in February 1986[22] and fig. 44, which depicts a slightly older-looking figure within the outline of the African continent. Otherwise, the people and peoples of Africa are portrayed as young, physically able and strong. See, for example, figs. 1, 41, 55, 67 and 69. This links to the depiction of the political subject as fighters and guerrilla soldiers, and Cuba's 'New Man'. However, it might also have reflected the relatively youthful population of Africa; or, the notion that the *dēmos*

[21] In 1988 Judith Butler proposed that gender was performative and therefore fluid, constructed through the repetition of feminine and masculine performative acts.

[22] Olof Palme served as Prime Minister of Sweden between 1969 and 1976, and 1982 until his death in 1986. He was a key socialist figure in European Politics and spoke out in support of Castro's Cuba and against South African apartheid. He was shot in the back one evening after going to the cinema in central Stockholm. His assassination and the motive behind it remain unsolved. (Bondeson, 2014)

was young in other ways, as a people, as an international actor, and reflecting new ways of thinking and doing in the international politics of the Cold War. For example, speaking on May Day at a mass rally in Havana in 1961, Castro asked, 'In this young, combative nation, who did not march today?' (Castro, 2008a, p. 197); while Che Guevara, writing in 1965, remarked that 'Socialism is young and has its mistakes. We revolutionaries often lack the knowledge and intellectual audacity needed to meet the task of developing the new man and women with methods different from the conventional ones' (Guevara, 2003b, p. 223). In Cuba, 'youth' defined the Revolution; not only in terms of the youth of its leaders, but also in the sense of a radical break with the past in order to create a new future (Luke, 2018). The posters suggest that Africa was conceptualised as similarly 'young', liberating itself from old colonial structures in the pursuit of a new future.

In addition to the youthfulness of the people portrayed in the posters, there are also a number of designs that depict children - though I am not including the infants in figs. 21 and 47, as they work to establish the women in the posters as mothers. Akin to the broader representation of the people and peoples of Africa, children are portrayed as fighters and guerrilla soldiers (figs. 38, 41, 64 and 67) or victims of oppression and imperialism (figs. 11, 30, 36, 37, 42 and 92). However, the depiction of children attaches an additional layer of denotation that evokes connotations such as innocence, naivety, purity, vulnerability and a need of protection. There are also two posters by Enrique Martínez and Victor Manuel Navarrete that use the direct gaze of a child - figs. 43 and 79. Both of these posters reference South Africa and use the same original image of a child repeated either vertically or horizontally. The eyes and facial expression of the child have the effect of creating an intent and watchful gaze that feels especially critical coming from a child as opposed to an adult, a sense of judgement from the youngest generation witness to the injustice of apartheid.

Of course, the representation of race, ethnicity and African stereotypes also played a part in the subjectivation of the political subject - see previous chapters. As discussed, the people and peoples of Africa were depicted as distinctly African as opposed to black. The posters also depicted the political views of the *dēmos*, further elaborating on the character of the political subject. For example, posters asserted the Tricontinental Movement's opposition to the United States, interventionism, corruption and exploitation, figs. 10, 36, 50 and 96; the imprisonment of Nelson Mandela, fig. 4; apartheid in South Africa; racial discrimination in

Zimbabwe, figs. 32 and 33; and support for liberation movements in Namibia, Guinea-Bissau and Cape Verde, and Western Sahara, to name only a few.

In addition, there is a distinct subset of the African series of OSPAAAL posters that depicts intellectual leaders - approximately nineteen percent of the collection. These include Mehdi Ben Barka, figs. 65, 80 and 97; Patrice Lumumba, figs. 10, 51, 56, 98, 99 and 100; Nelson Mandela, fig. 4; Amílcar Cabral, figs. 52, 53, 54, 58 and 101; Samora Machel, fig. 102; and Olof Palme, fig. 95. Mor (2019, p. 61) notes that these individuals were depicted as revolutionaries in a visually similar way to José Martí, Malcom X, and the Nicaraguan revolutionary figure, Augusto Sandino. With the exception of Nelson Mandela and Samora Machel, these intellectual leaders were assassinated owing to their political views and presented as martyrs to the Tricontinental Movement. Although these posters did not 'render' the political subject directly, they did add to the narrative of the *dēmos*, adding detail in the form of events, political thought and political figures that shaped the Tricontinental imaginary and the new political subject. For example, as discussed in chapter four, Mehdi Ben Barka played a key part in organising the inaugural Tricontinental Conference in 1966. Moreover, his abduction and later assassination strengthened many attendees' opposition to imperialism. The repetition of his image in figs. 65, 80 and 97 reinforces not only his death, but also his political views. Similarly, the images of Patrice Lumumba and Amílcar Cabral emphasise not only their assassinations and therefore the need for resistance to imperialism, but also their political views on socialism, national sovereignty and pan-Africanism. Hence, this subset of posters feeds into the point discussed above regarding the political views of the *dēmos*. For example, the images of Nelson Mandela and Olof Palme convey that the political subject opposed apartheid. Thus, in sum, through the African series of OSPAAAL posters, the people and peoples of African were given form as the political subject.

Impossible Names

Turning to the subjectivation of the political subject through its impossible name, as Rockhill (2004a, p. 92) explains:

> The very act of identifying these political subjects necessarily has recourse to misnomers, i.e. names that inadequately refer to the anonymous multitude that has no title in the police order. The logic of subjectivization is therefore based on the impossible

identification of political subjects, that is to say subjects who remain unidentifiable in the given field of experience and necessitate 'inaudible' modes of enunciation.

For Rancière (1992, p. 62), 'the logic of subjectivization always entails an impossible identification'.

> Political subjectivization is the enactment of equality - or the handling of a wrong - by people who are together to the extent that they are between. It is a crossing of identities, relying on a crossing of names: names that link the name of a group or class to the name of no group or no class, a being to a nonbeing or a not-yet-being. This network has a noticeable property: it always involves an impossible identification, an identification that cannot be embodied by he or she who utters it. (Rancière, 1992, p. 61)

The impossible name of the political subject has the potential to include everyone, but also refers to no-one. As such, it defies the police count of the community, challenging its sensible configuration. As Tanke (2011, p. 68) summarises:

> Impossible identifications rely upon tactical, world-opening devices such as: "We the people," "proletariat," and one which was formative for Rancière, the May 1968 slogan, "We are all German Jews." These declarations create subjectivities that are capable of lifting individuals out of their positions in the police order. Political names are at once poetic and polemical; they outline a shared world, and relate its inhabitants in a manner different from the one to which they are accustomed. Announcements such as "workers of the world" and "wretched of the earth" create political subjects and redraw sensible parameters. They work against the police claim that there is no part of those without part, inscribing it into the count of the community.

'The people of Africa, Asia and Latin America' functioned similarly. Sufficiently broad so as to include almost everyone and at the same time referring to no-one in particular, this impossible name of a part without part, of a people who were together to the extent that they were excluded from the international community, worked to challenge the sensible of the Cold War.

This impossible name was not only displayed on the OSPAAAL posters via text, which usually referenced 'the people of…' and/or bore the OSPAAAL logo, but was also supported by the accompanying designs. That is, 'the people' depicted in the posters were generally nondescript and non-specific, represented through abstraction, or not actually 'depicted' at

all. For example, fig. 28 depicts an abstract geometric design of alternating blue lines surrounding a nose, mouth and rifle barrel shooting a box-shaped target. The rifle barrel is positioned above the nose and mouth, where one would expect the eyes. Although this abstract design conveys the impression of a face, there are no identifying details - the identity of the face is open to interpretation. In figs. 34 and 87 the presence of people is implied through footprints and speech bubbles, even though no-*body* is actually depicted. In fig. 103, only a hand is depicted; and in fig. 104, only the suggestion of a hand through the placement of gun cartridges around a rifle strap. Similarly, in figs. 77, 87 and 105, arrows and guns have been fired and a dagger has been used, implying the presence of people; however, they remain unseen and unknown. Fig. 57 exemplifies the nondescript and non-specific nature of the people that are depicted in the posters. It is an orange and black duotone image of a figure with its mouth open wide, seemingly shouting or perhaps screaming. Not only is the figure indistinct and blurred, but there is also little in the way of identifying features or details. As noted in chapter four, the use of silhouettes and abstract colour, particularly through duotone images, similarly made the central figures ambiguous and open to interpretation. Hence, 'the people' in the posters could be anyone but were also no-one. Chapter seven examines a few of these aspects in further detail, namely through non-prescriptive designs and abstraction.

In addition, there is an important aspect of this impossible name that has not yet been addressed; namely, solidarity. Scholz (2021, p. 3) explains that 'more often than not, the understanding of solidarity is blurred as scholars use it to discuss external identity, shared experience, shared consciousness, and political resistance separately *and* simultaneously'. However, she settles on an understanding of political solidarity as 'political activism aimed at social change' (Scholz, 2021, p. 5). With regard to the OSPAAAL posters, I would add that solidarity signifies moral obligation, shared forms of feeling and an invitation to take part in the redistribution of the sensible. It was also a key component in the Tricontinental imaginary. To elucidate, the notion of solidarity is strongly emphasised through the text, logo and designs of the OSPAAAL posters. First and foremost, the majority of the African series of OSPAAAL posters explicitly refer to solidarity via 'international or world days or weeks of solidarity'. Even when solidarity is not referenced directly, the text often still conveys the notion of solidarity. Fig. 86, for example, asserts 'WITH ANGOLA IN DEFENSE AND PRODUCTION'; and fig. 1, 'NAMIBIA: FOR ITS TOTAL INDEPENDENCE'. Secondly, the logo - present in nearly all of the posters - brings to mind the name of the organisation, *La Organización de Solidaridad de*

los Pueblos de Asia, África y América Latina. And thirdly, poster designs such as figs. 80 and 85 allude to unity and cooperation between continents and people. A more subtle example is fig. 47, which uses artwork by the Black Panther Party artist Emory Douglas to draw links of solidarity between the Black Power Movement and the Tricontinental Movement. Thus, the political subject extended beyond the people of Africa, Asia and Latin America to include those in solidarity with these peoples. As a political subject, 'the people of Africa, Asia and Latin America, and those in solidarity with them' was open to anyone - through solidarity, everyone could be included.

As Tanke (2011, p. 70) observes, such impossible 'world-opening' names offer not only the means by which an excluded group begins to take part, but also opens a space for those already allotted a part to break with the police order. Here, 'solidarity' further expanded the *dēmos* across national borders and as a transnational group defied traditional means of counting the international community. It also opened-up the Tricontinental Movement to anyone and everyone irrespective of race. As discussed in chapter four, colour did not act as a metonymic political signifier in the African series of OSPAAAL posters as per Garland Mahler's premise - a black guerrilla fighter did not metonymically stand in for the Tricontinental community. However, through solidarity, the political subject was open to anyone and everyone irrespective of race.

Rancière's concept of 'impossible names' draws attention to how the articulation of the political subject disrupts the police order of the sensible. However, his work focuses on the verbal and oral identification of these groups - for example, 'we are all German Jews' and 'workers of the world'. At variance with these examples, I argue that the naming of the political subject can be as much visual as verbal and oral (and potentially auditory). For the people of Africa, Asia and Latin America, and those in solidarity with them, the visual depiction of their impossible name was as important a part of their political subjectivation as the words of the name itself.

It is also important to note that the process of subjectivation is often complex and confused. On the subject of political subjectivation, Rancière (1992, p. 62) remarks that 'this is, to be sure, an uncomfortable position'; while Tanke (2011, p. 70) elaborates:

> This is not to say that all is easy and tranquil. Dissensual politics prefers polemics, discord, and confusion to the identities, places, and capacities owned by the police. It is an arduous task to identify wrongs, give them a name, and maintain a federation in opposition to them. The struggle of politics is subjective, in the sense that it consists of building up and maintaining these groups in visibility against the forces that would return them to the shadows.

Indeed, the subjectivation of the *dēmos* in the African series of OSPAAAL posters was not always clear-cut or consistent. The posters navigated a difficult dynamic between depicting the new political subject and maintaining the inclusive ambiguity of its impossible name. For example, the depiction of African peoples as very specifically African as opposed to 'black' in any phenotypic or political sense risked excluding non-African peoples from the *dēmos*. However, this was tempered by the use of abstraction in the posters, which lent itself to more open and inclusive interpretations. Hence, the political subject was given form by way of multiple roles, characteristics and political viewpoints, but not depicted so narrowly that it conflicted with the notion that it was open to anyone and everyone.

Thus, through the depiction of the new political subject and its impossible name, the African series of OSPAAAL posters played a part in the subjectivation of the *dēmos* - a continuation of the identification of a *dēmos* discussed in the previous section. By means of the posters, the people of Africa, Asia and Latin America, and those in solidarity with them were imagined as a political subject and given form as the Tricontinental imaginary. Although *how* the political subject and its impossible name were depicted is not unimportant, the key point is that they *were* depicted. Simply asserting the presence of the *dēmos* and describing its form challenged how the international community was imagined and thereby disrupted the sensible of the international of the Cold War. Of course, the aesthetics of the posters also played a key part in the subjectivation of the political subject as the elaboration of roles and characteristics was partially conveyed through the styles of art and poster designs; however, this topic is explored in greater depth in the next chapter.

An Alternative Voice

The third way in which the African series of OSPAAAL posters worked to move the people and peoples of Africa from invisibility to visibility was through the visual demonstration of an

alternative voice. This had three components: *what* the posters said, *how* they spoke, and the fact that they *did* speak - all of which challenged the police order of the sensible. With regard to *what* the posters said, as noted, they were explicitly political with an international outlook and circulation. Consequently, they depicted various subjects, events and themes that were related to what could broadly be described as international politics. However, these subjects, events and themes conveyed a markedly different interpretation as to what constituted the international politics of the Cold War compared to the police. Although many of the designs referred to acknowledged events and discourses - such as the Soweto uprising, figs. 79 and 92, and the political imprisonment of Nelson Mandela, fig. 4 - the prominence given to them was distinct.

Indeed, the African series of OSPAAAL posters depicted proxy wars and peripheral conflicts as the central narrative of the Cold War. Of course, 'peripheral' only in the sense of the police order. For example, there are eight posters that reference Guinea-Bissau and Cape Verde and a further five that depict Amílcar Cabral, putting the PAIGC's fight for independence from Portugal front and centre. By placing these conflicts at the centre of its narrative, OSPAAAL increased their visibility and challenged the centre-periphery logic of the police. Thus, as Mor (2019, p. 58) argues, the rendering work of OSPAAAL poster artists 'allowed a particular hierarchy of struggle to take precedence over others in these international contexts'.

In addition, the posters also prioritised a different set of discourses to the police - such as opposing political views, African intellectual leaders and their politics, and notable assassinations, as discussed in the subjectivation of the political subject. For example, fig. 96, printed in 1967, references Ethiopia at a time when it had little significance in the dominant narratives of the Cold War[23]. The poster, however, challenges viewers to think twice about representations of Africa, specifically regarding Ethiopia and tourism. The two images contrast an idyllic-looking landscape with a smiling figure in the foreground against two men who have been hung by their necks from a tree. This intentionally shocking contrast is continued in the text, which states:

[23] Although the Ogaden Crisis, 1977-1987, would later become a flashpoint in the Cold War.

ETHIOPIA

SOME OF THE FAR AWAY PLACES WITH CHARMING NAMES THAT TOURISTS SHOULD VISIT:

ALEM BEKAGNE

the biggest prison in East Africa

KAGNEW

U.S. strategic military base for “technical” espionage

ADOLA MINES

where 20 000 men waste away doing forced labour

MASSAWA

important Ethiopian-U.S.-Israeli naval base for the control of the Red Sea

The posters also repeatedly referenced countries and political figures that were otherwise conceptualised as flashpoints during the Cold War, reframing them as long-running and ongoing issues. For example, the fight for Angolan independence that culminated in 1975 is usually viewed as a flashpoint in the Cold War - an internationalised civil conflict that threatened to upset the balance of power between the Western and Soviet blocs. However, the OSPAAAL posters that reference Angola span from 1968 to 1982, long before and after events in Angola gained the attention of the international community. In a similar vein, the assassination of Patrice Lumumba in 1961 remained a subject of the African series of OSPAAAL posters until 1980, long after international interest had faded. Thus, the African series of OSPAAAL posters did not reproduce the police order of the international, which focused primarily on interactions and issues pertaining to the two superpowers. Instead, the posters focused on the people and peoples of Africa. By prioritising an alternative set of discourses, they depicted an alternative way of imagining the international politics of the Cold War that differed from - and thereby challenged - the police.

While this alternative way of imagining the international politics of the Cold War was part of the visual demonstration of an alternative voice, which in turn was part of a process of dissensual politics, it is important to note that a change in perspective does not in itself equate to political dissensus. As Rancière (2010, p. 30) explains:

> Politics is a specific break with the logic of the arkhê. It does not simply presuppose a break with the 'normal' distribution of positions that defines who exercises power and who is subject to it. It also requires a break with the idea that there exist dispositions 'specific' to these positions.

A similar discussion, for example, is taking place in Global South Studies. Originally premised on filling the lacuna in traditionally Eurocentric academic research, many have begun to question if it really constitutes a new way of doing research or simply a different approach to the same problem (Wa Ngugi, 2012). Here, however, *what* the posters said must be considered alongside *how* they spoke and the fact that they *did* speak.

The African series of OSPAAAL posters 'spoke' through its own distinctive visual language. Although images were central to the international politics of the Cold War - take, for example, the role of aerial photographs in the Cuban Missile Crisis[24] or the role of visual propaganda in the ideological battle of capitalism vs. communism - OSPAAAL crafted its own distinctive form of communication that in time became an iconic collection of political posters. For example, there is the iconography of the posters with respect to icons as a system of representation. As Cushing (2003, p. 15) notes, many used visual shorthand to convey meaning. Some of the icons discussed thus far include stylised flags, continental shapes, tribal imagery, the dollar sign, banknotes, a pith helmet, a serpent, and small arms and weapons. With regard to the latter, Kunzle (1975, p. 97) remarks that 'Cuban symbology of armed popular struggle includes only small arms; when planes and bombs appear in posters, they are invariably those of the imperialist aggressor'. Indeed, this is reiterated by Cushing (2003, p. 14) who explains:

> Many Cuban poster artists use the imagery of weapons, from spears to AK-47s, to symbolize the ultimate extension of political power. […] The type of weapon also has a political dimension; sophisticated hardware, such as missiles and fighter jets, is always associated with the forces of oppression and imperialism.

Also of note are chains and barbed wire, which signify subjugation, repression and oppression. In fig. 44, for example, the word APARTHEID is spelled out in barbed wire; while barbed wire

[24] High-altitude aerial photographs taken by an American U-2 spy plane above Cuba on the 14th October 1962 helped establish that the Soviet Union was building offensive missile sites in Cuba. (Curley, 2018, pp. 12-13)

and chains feature in several of the other posters that refer to apartheid South Africa, figs. 27, 31, 37 and 92. With regard to image composition, chains and barbed wire are positioned in the foreground or surrounding objects or subjects conveying a sense of domination, restraint and unequal power - figs. 18, 19, 27, 31, 35, 44, 76, 90 and 92. For example, fig. 19 depicts the repeating image of a face behind and enclosed by chains with the text 'NAMIBIA STRUGGLES'. The poster, printed in 1978, refers to SWAPO's opposition to the illegal occupation of Namibia by South Africa.

The styles of art used in the posters also contributed to how the posters spoke. This is examined in detail in the following chapter. However, it is sufficient here to note that by combining a socialist rhetoric with 'Western' styles of art, such as abstraction, pop and op art, the posters departed from the police notion of what counted as speech thereby finding an alternative way of speaking. In addition, how the posters spoke was informed by their emotive nature. As discussed in the preceding chapters, images, and specifically political posters, tend to elicit an emotional response in the viewer (Bleiker, 2018; Sontag, 1999). The African series of OSPAAAL posters communicated in a way that was designed to stir passion and sympathy in aid of generating solidarity with the Tricontinental Movement. For example, a large number of the posters use a 'direct gaze' - see figs. 29, 30, 36, 37, 43, 52, 55, 66, 67, 79, 91 and 95. This disrupts the typical power relations between image and viewer whereby the viewer gazes at the image. Instead, the poster gazes back, and the viewer becomes the object of the gaze as well as the gazer. Olin (2003, pp. 326-327) describes this variously as a 'returned gaze', 'mutual gaze of equality' and 'shared gaze', noting that 'interactive works, whether artistic or informational, are based on a similar premise that input by both sides is mutually supportive'. Certainly, in the African series of OSPAAAL posters it has the effect of engaging the viewer in the emotional and affective work of the images. Thus, together these aspects of the posters shaped how the African series of OSPAAAL posters spoke, forming its own distinctive visual language. Indeed, Mor (2019, p. 61) comments that '[OSPAAAL] rendered specific struggles legible through a common visual framework', effectively linking them together as part of the same global fight against imperialism.

For Rancière, the demonstration of an alternative voice is a form of political dissensus, as the act of asserting an alternative voice to that of the police disrupts the distribution of the sensible. As discussed, the *dēmos* is formed of those who have no voice in the police order,

those who are not heard, not seen, and have no part in the community. Thus, the basic act of speaking when it should not be able to speak or exist to speak disrupts the sensible; 'political demonstration makes visible that which had no reason to be seen' (Rancière, 2010, p. 38). He expresses this with reference to equality. In précis, by speaking when it should not, the *dēmos* is making a claim to equality - the equal ability of all to speak. As Tanke (2011, p. 51) remarks:

> [Politics] is fundamentally a conflict over voice, between the police interpretations of sense that describe some as braying beasts and the actions undertaken by marginalised groups to demonstrate that what issues from their mouths is human speech. Whereas the police claims that hierarchical divisions of labor are just, politics disrupts such distributions of the sensible with the demonstration of equal facility.

Thus, by speaking, the *dēmos* demonstrates (its) equality and moves from invisibility to visibility. The African series of OSPAAAL posters acted as a visual demonstration of equality. Specifically, it demonstrated the equal ability of the *dēmos* - the people of Africa, Asia and Latin America, and those in solidarity with them - to speak in the international of the Cold War. It is therefore not only *what* the posters said and *how* they spoke, offering an alternative voice to that of the police; but also that they *did* speak, the basic act of speaking challenging the sensible of the international.

From a Cuban perspective, it is perhaps unsurprising that Cuba had a desire to assert its own voice in the international politics of the Cold War. Since its struggle for independence - the Ten Year War, 1868-1878, the Little War, 1879-1880, and the Cuban War of Independence, 1895-1898, the latter of which culminated in the Spanish-American War and Cuba's independence from Spain - it had largely been bypassed in the international arena. Firstly, in its own war of independence, which was subsumed into the Spanish-American War. Secondly, through the Platt Amendment from 1902 to 1933, which granted the United States an almost colonial control over Cuba. And thirdly, at the close of the Missile Crisis in 1962, which saw President John F. Kennedy and Soviet First Secretary Nikita Krushchev negotiate an agreement without consulting the Cuban government (Blight and Brenner, 2002; Gott, 2004). In this light, we can see Cuba's national history and desire to assert its own voice borne out in the African series of OSPAAAL posters.

Conflicting Worlds

Thus, the African series of OSPAAAL posters offered a new alternative way of imagining the international community and its actors. Through the identification of a *dēmos*, the subjectivation of the political subject and the visual demonstration of an alternative voice, the posters depicted a new sensible where the impossible was possible - one where the people and peoples of Africa existed as part of the Tricontinental community and were able to speak as equals within the wider international community. The depiction of this new sensible was akin to the construction of an alternative 'world'. As Rancière (2009b, p. 103) explains:

> The images of art do not supply weapons for battles. They help sketch new configurations of what can be seen, what can be said and what can be thought and, consequently, a new landscape of the possible.

Indeed, Callahan (2020, chap. 5) too describes the ways in which visuals can be 'world-ordering' or 'world-building' devices, actively creating new realities by shaping 'what can (and cannot) be seen, said, thought and done'.

The process of placing this new world in conflict with the world of the police is, for Rancière, the essence of political dissensus.

> The essential work of politics is the configuration of its own space. It is to make the world of its subjects and its operations seen. The essence of politics is the manifestation of dissensus as the presence of two worlds in one. […] Political argumentation is at one and the same time the demonstration of a possible world in which the argument could count as an argument, one that is addressed by a subject qualified to argue, over an identified object, to an addressee who is required to see the object and to hear the argument that he 'normally' has no reason either to see or to hear. It is the construction of a paradoxical world that puts together two separate worlds. (Rancière, 2010, pp. 37, 39)

The African series of OSPAAAL posters acted as a visual demonstration of this alternative world. Moreover, as this new imagined world conflicted with that of the police, the posters had the effect of juxtaposing one world with the other. As Rancière (2010, p. 38) explains:

> Political demonstration makes visible that which had no reason to be seen; it places one world in another - for instance, the world where the factory is a public space in that

> where it is considered private, the world where workers speak, and speak about the community, in that where their voices are mere cries expressing pain.

However, in this instance, it was the world where the people of Africa, Asia and Latin America and those in solidarity with them were visible and audible as part of the international community in that where they were excluded. Speaking more broadly, Craven (2006, p. 16) similarly observes that 'by helping us to think in alternative ways and thus to imagine the world anew, the partisan poster from Latin America encourages its audience to break with the mental landscape imposed by established hierarchies of power'.

It is important to note that this 'world-building' did not start with the poster artists and end with the posters; rather, it was part of the artist-poster-viewer continuum. Viewers played an integral part in creating this alternative world through their collective imagination, which worked to redraw the partitions of the sensible. Specifically, by imagining a world in which the people of Africa, Asia and Latin America and those in solidarity with them were visible and audible as part of the international community. Indeed, Callahan (2020, chap. 6) argues that viewers are capable of being active spectators as opposed to simply passive voyeurs, creating new affective communities of sense through their spectatorship. It is also the viewer that encounters the sublime. On seeing the African series of OSPAAAL posters, the viewer is confronted by this alternative world. They must then reconcile the gap between what they see and what they know, between the world depicted via the posters and the world of the police. It is here that they encounter the sublime, in the moment when their mind is in disarray as they attempt to register the presence and conflict between multiple 'worlds'. Thus, by demonstrating a new alternative way of imagining the international community and its actors, the African series of OSPAAAL posters prompted sublime experiences that disrupted the sensible of the international politics of the Cold War.

As this alternative world was demonstrated through the visual medium of the African series of OSPAAAL posters, the aesthetics of the posters were also of key importance. As Rancière (2004, p. 226) explains, 'politics is aesthetic in that it makes visible what had been excluded from a perceptual field […]. It inscribes one perceptual world within another'. The identification of a *dēmos*, the subjectivation of the political subject, the visual demonstration of an alternative voice and the imagination of an alternative world were all inextricably bound up in aesthetics. For example, in the use of abstraction to depict the *dēmos'* impossible name

and the use of colour and duotone images to convey a nondescript and non-specific political subject. Indeed, Mor's (2019) notion of 'rendering' political struggle through the OSPAAAL posters highlights the extent to which art shaped political discourses and subjectivities. Thus, the following chapter explores the politics of the posters as aesthetic subjects.

Chapter Seven: The Art of Propaganda

Writing in the 1940s, George Orwell argued that 'the opinion that art should have nothing to do with politics is itself a political attitude' (Orwell, 2009, p. 77). Sentiments such as this have contributed to the popular albeit contested aphorism that 'all art is political', but what of the politics of art? As Segal (2016, p. 11) notes, 'the concept of "art" itself is far from unambiguous and constantly subject to more or less (un)inspiring attempts to define it'. However, for Rancière, art has the potential to transform the world, what is visible and what is possible, by introducing rival configurations of sense that conflict with the existing distribution of the sensible (Tanke, 2011, pp. 76, 103). In essence, as discussed in the theoretical framework, art has the capacity to cause dissensus through the politics of aesthetics.

This chapter considers the politics of the African series of OPSAAAL posters as an aesthetic subject and questions how - and if - it disrupted aesthetic communities of sense. It contends that by not conforming to the norms and expectations of the genre - that is, propaganda - the posters prompted moments of dissensus akin to the sublime. The following discussion addresses the ways in which the African series of OSPAAAL posters, as a collection and as part of the wider collection of OSPAAAL posters, did not conform to the norms and expectations of Cold War propaganda. In précis, these were: rejecting the styles of art associated with capitalism and communism, non-prescriptive designs, the presupposition of equality and the use of abstraction. However, before addressing each of these in turn, the discussion first considers propaganda as a genre during the Cold War.

Cold War Propaganda

As discussed in chapter one, 'propaganda' is a value-laden and consequently problematic term. However, its ubiquity, particularly in political contexts, necessitates that we engage with as opposed to eschew its use. As a genre of art, politics and communication, propaganda in the Cold War differed significantly to earlier decades and conflicts. This was due to the geopolitical and ideological landscape of the Cold War, the presence of nuclear weapons, and advances in media and communication technologies. Following World War II, two ideologically opposed blocs emerged. In 'the West', the United States and Western Europe, and in 'the East', the Soviet Union, Eastern Europe and later China. Each bloc argued that their respective

ideology, capitalism or communism, was the superior form of progress and modernisation and regarded the other as a potentially dangerous threat (Curley, 2018, p. 9; Crowley, 2008, p. 13). In this geopolitical and ideological conflict, propaganda was key. As Moore (2010, p. 162) explains, 'propaganda did not merely support the use of weapons; it was the weapon, in a struggle to draw the peoples of the world into one sphere of influence or the other'. In addition to this ideological dimension of the Cold War, was the presence of nuclear weapons. Never before had humankind possessed such a destructive power. Furthermore, it was the two superpowers that had nuclear capabilities. Owing to the threat of 'mutually assured destruction', neither the United States nor the Soviet Union was willing to risk engaging in direct conflict with the other. Instead, the conflict took the form of proxy wars and propaganda, adding to the importance of the latter. Indeed, Crowley (2008, p. 7) notes that 'rarely contested with 'hot' weapons, it was, in many ways, a propaganda war in which images were used to produce both fear and loyalty'. At the same time, advances in media and communication technologies made propaganda more widespread. The further development of printing presses, for example, made the production of posters and other mass print media faster and more affordable (Sontag, 1999, p. 197). In addition to more traditional propaganda such as radio and newspapers, new media such as television, cinema and photography also encouraged the proliferation of propaganda during the Cold War. Hence, never before had propaganda played such a key role in a global conflict.

Cold War propaganda included not only posters, but also newspapers, magazines, comics, radio and television, and extended into cinema, theatre and fiction. The latter is often described as 'public diplomacy', the use of soft power to persuade through culture (see Barnhisel, 2015; Belmonte, 2013; Hammond, 2017; Nye, 2004; and Taylor, 2003). For example, films such as *Saludos Amigos* (1942) and *The Three Caballeros* (1945) were designed to foster good relations between Latin America and the United States (Goldman, 2013, p. 23); while *Invasion U.S.A.* (1952) and *Invasion of the Body Snatchers* (1956) played on fears of an invasion by the Soviet Union (Crowley, 2008, p. 8; Barnhisel, 2015, p. 47). Of the former, television broadcasting in particular shaped the politics of the Cold War. Taylor (2003, p. 269), for example, details the decisive role of television and journalism during the Vietnam War, stating that 'images of burning monks, napalmed children, executed Vietcong and deadly helicopter gunships appeared nightly in the living rooms of civilian homes far removed from the fighting and made Vietnam the most visible war yet seen in history'. However, more traditional forms

of propaganda still played a key role. Leaflets, for example, were a large part of the United States' political campaign in Vietnam, dropping nearly fifty billon leaflets in North and South Vietnam, Laos and Cambodia in an attempt to divide the people from the Vietcong (Moore, 2010, p. 183).

It is important to understand the scope of Cold War propaganda in order to situate posters as part of this genre. Although relatively 'low-tech' in comparison to other media and communication technologies, posters flourished as a medium of propaganda during the Cold War on two accounts. Firstly, in terms of production they were simple, available and low-cost; and therefore favoured by protest groups and oppositional movements that did not have large financial resources, such as the Young Lords, Chicano Movement and indeed OSPAAAL. Secondly, posters often engaged in intermedial relations with more 'high-tech' forms of media and communications, such as photography and film (Crowley, 2008, pp. 7, 9; Moore, 2010, pp. 186-187). Crowley (2008, p. 9), for example, notes:

> One of the most emotive and striking images in this book is an anti-Vietnam War poster[25] […], which comments on the massacre of Vietnamese citizens in the village of Mai Lai by a troop of US soldiers in 1968. It combines an official image taken by a US army photographer with a distressing admission made by one of the GI participants in a television interview that the troops had shot babies. The poster produced one of the most powerful indictments of American foreign policy.

Overall, there was a huge variety in the styles and designs of propaganda posters produced during the Cold War. However, at the same time, there were also norms and expectations. Although this might sound like a contradiction, the two aspects coexisted. For example, Curley's (2013) work is premised on unpacking the widely held notion that Cold War art was anchored to the dualistic binary of capitalism vs. communism. In particular, he picks out the work of Andy Warhol and Gerhard Richter to show how these purportedly 'West' and 'East' artists subverted the binary through their artwork. Indeed, Curley is right to argue that looking at Cold War art through this binary alone is over-simplistic. It also speaks to the invisibility of Cuba and Africa in this specific distribution of the sensible. However, the binary must have existed in order to subvert it. Although simplistic, it was a lived reality for many people during the Cold War. The notion that political and everyday experiences were mediated via a

[25] See fig. 106.

capitalist vs. communist binary, whether real or imagined, became self-fulfilling and informed the norms and expectations of Cold War art. The same was true of propaganda posters in the sense that despite the overall variety in the styles and designs of posters, they were still expected to conform to certain norms. These norms and expectations were informed by trends in other types of propaganda, art, and of course, the politics of the Cold War. However, it was the logic of capitalism vs. communism and modernism vs. socialist realism that dominated propaganda posters.

Propaganda posters from 'the West' embraced modernism. Apropos art, modernism is described by the TATE (2020b) as:

> A global movement in society and culture that from the early decades of the twentieth century sought a new alignment with the experience and values of modern industrial life. Building on late nineteenth-century precedents, artists around the world used new imagery, materials and techniques to create artworks that they felt better reflected the realities and hopes of modern societies.

Discussions relating to propaganda locate modernism more specifically in the 1940-1960s Western Europe and the United States, but particularly the latter (see Barnhisel, 2015; Belmonte, 2013; and Segal, 2016). At its core were ideas of anti-traditionalism, formal experimentation, innovation, freedom of expression and the sovereignty of the individual. Although derided by its critics as 'art for art's sake', modernism was celebrated as the epitome of Western political and ideological thought and proof that Western culture - and by extension capitalism - was superior to that of the Soviet Union. Modernism therefore came to be presented as 'a pro-Western, pro-"freedom," and pro-bourgeois movement, evidence of the superiority of the Western way of life' (Barnhisel, 2015, p. 2).

Modernism was also associated with consumerism. In addition to art, it was taken up in advertising, packaging, fashion and interior design, which dovetailed with new psychological approaches to propaganda and the United States' approach to 'public diplomacy' (Bernays, 1928; Pells, 2011). Although Western and Eastern Europe and the Soviet Union all engaged in various forms of cultural propaganda, the United States was unusual in relying primarily on the private sector and commercial and 'philanthropic' organisations. This included activities

such as sponsoring international education programmes[26], art exhibitions, orchestras, dance companies and opera productions, and the influence of Hollywood films, Disney[27] and American-branded consumer goods such as Coca-Cola and Ford (Barnhisel, 2015, p. 12; Moore, 2010, p. 165; Segal, 2016, p. 74). These 'public diplomacy' practices operated through a diverse range of official and unofficial cultural channels, but together they linked modernism, consumer capitalism and propaganda, and worked to export the American way of life.

In 'the East' propaganda posters adhered to socialist realism, which was born out of the Russian Revolution in the early twentieth century. As Bonnell (1997, p. 1) explains, on coming to power the Bolsheviks understood that there was uncertainty over the politics of the new state and its relationship to the past, present and future.

> For the Bolsheviks, whose claim to power was based on an ideology that accorded world-historical importance to the proletariat, it was critically important to establish in public discourse the heroic position and collective identity of the working class. […] In the course of 1918, [they] put into motion a propaganda apparatus designed to transmit the party's ideas to the population by means of words (both spoken and written) and images. (Bonnell, 1997, pp. 1,3)

It was Lenin's intention that artists should make art for the working people, in a style accessible to all, that would inspire the realisation of the socialist society and new socialist man (Segal, 2016, pp. 63, 64-65). Thus, socialist realism was inherently linked to the idea that art should reflect and advance the goals of communism and required that 'works had to be intelligible to a popular audience, manifest correct Marxist-Leninist analysis of the historical and social conditions they documented, and inspire audiences to work to advance the struggle to construct a socialist society' (Barnhisel, 2015, p. 48). Accordingly, there was a tendency towards anonymity and collective work, as art - including propaganda art - was conceptualised as created for the 'greater good' as opposed to individual expression. For example, Crowley (2008, p. 57) notes the unsigned collective output of anonymous designers and printers who

[26] For example, the Fullbright Program - the United States' flagship educational and cultural exchange programme since 1946 (Bettie, 2015).

[27] Dorfman and Mattelart (1984), for example, argued that Disney comics in Latin America were propagating imperialist ideologies through cultural propaganda.

produced the *VOTER c'est MOURIR UN PEU* poster, fig. 107, during the May 1968 protests in Paris, France. This poster expresses the disillusionment felt by students of the *Atelier Populaire* towards voting as a means of political and social change. As detailed by the V&A (2022):

> The ballot box is depicted as a coffin. The Lorraine Cross on the coffin lid once represented freedom in France: it was used by General de Gaulle as a symbol of hope during the Resistance movement of World War II. The cross is subverted to represent the failures of De Gaulle's government. The underlying message alleges that the electoral process has failed the French people.

With a few exceptions, OSPAAAL posters were similarly unsigned, as was nearly all Soviet propaganda. In 1932, Stalin had banned independent artist groups so that the only way artists could make a living was to join the Artists' Union of the U.S.S.R., which strongly adhered to the ideological principles of socialist realism (Curley, 2018, p. 36). In addition, socialist propaganda posters were often characterised by iconography such as the hammer and sickle, red stars, the colours red and black, the heroic worker, and a raised fist or salute.

The norms and expectations of capitalist and communist propaganda posters were also reactive, defined in response to their ideological other. As Segal (2016, p. 12) notes:

> Western art critics and art historians played out the free, autonomous, pure, and modern art of Western democracies against the visual propaganda or 'kitsch' produced under state socialism; in the socialist world, on the other hand, future-orientated artistic engagement at home was confronted with formalism and 'bourgeois decadence' in Western capitalist art.

Thus, socialist realism was also defined by what it was not - modernism - and vice versa; each only making sense in relation to the other (Barnhisel, 2015, p. 54). The reality, of course, was far more complex and frequently challenged by individuals and groups such as Andy Warhol and Gerhard Richter (Curley, 2013), Pablo Picasso (Segal, 2016, pp. 66, 68, 76-77), Barnett Newman (Segal, 2016, pp. 7-8), Jackson Pollock (Curley, 2013; 2018; Segal, 2016), oppositional groups in the United States, Europe and the Soviet Union (Crowley, 2008), and anyone attempting to navigate a 'third way' in the Cold War, such as Cuba (Crowley, 2008, p. 50; Sontag, 1999). However, once again, the fact that there was something to challenge meant that certain norms and expectations regarding propaganda existed as part of the sensible of the Cold War.

Art, Capitalism and Communism

The African series of OSPAAAL posters did not conform to the norms and expectations of Cold War propaganda in a number of ways. Firstly, it did not use the styles of art associated with communism and the Soviet Union; and instead, used styles of art more commonly associated with capitalist cultures, the United States and Western Europe. As discussed, the ideological binary of the Cold War permeated art as well as politics. Although the dualism of capitalism and communism failed to capture the complexities of reality, artistic styles were swiftly assigned a part. As Segal (2016, p. 133) explains:

> In artistic terms, the Cold War rivalry between East and West expressed itself in the opposition between autonomous, pure art in the democratic world and the visual kitsch and propaganda of the totalitarian Soviet bloc. Or, from the opposite perspective, between a future orientated artistic engagement in the communist world and the meaningless formalism and bourgeois decadence of capitalism.

This ideological lens transformed complex constellations of global and local events into a series of binary dualisms: capitalism vs. communism, West vs. East, freedom vs. peace, the United States vs. the Soviet Union, American abstraction vs. Soviet figuration and modernism vs. socialist realism. These dualisms were simplistic and superficial but powerful nonetheless. Together they outlined the sensible distribution of art and politics during the Cold War, setting out the norms and expectations of art, politics and propaganda.

Socialist realism was prevalent in the art of the Soviet Union, East Germany, China and other socialist countries during the Cold War (Curley, 2013; Cushing, 2003, p. 14; Heller, 2008). It emerged in the Soviet Union in the 1930s in response to a desire to define the art of the new Marxist-Leninist state (Barnhisel, 2015, p. 48). It was figurative, as opposed to abstract, and characterised by an intention to portray the social and working conditions of the proletariat realistically. However, Segal (2016, p. 64) qualifies that 'socialist art had to be dialectic; it should not depict the world as it is, in all its contingency and imperfection, but as it would reveal itself in all its splendour when the socialist utopia had been realized' (see also Heller, 2008, p. 163; and Curley, 2013, p. 85). Common subjects included industrial and agricultural workers and portraits of prominent figures such as Joseph Stalin and Chairman Mao, reflecting the 'cult of the personality' often linked to socialist regimes (Crowley, 2008, pp. 21, 52-55;

Heller, 2008, pp. 152-160). Although it emerged in the Soviet Union and is strongly associated with Soviet art and propaganda, socialist realism spread throughout the Eastern Bloc and to China during the Cultural Revolution (Moore, 2010; Segal, 2016). It was also present in socialist regimes in Latin America - for example, in Peronist propaganda in Argentina (Schembs, 2013).

However, socialist realism is not present in the African series of OSPAAAL posters. Although there are a handful of portraits that could hint at its influence - figs. 54 and 100, for example, which depict Amílcar Cabral and Patrice Lumumba; unlike the 'cult of the personality' portraits that were common in the Soviet Union and China, the African series of OSPAAAL posters focused almost exclusively on martyrs - the only two exceptions being Samora Machel, fig. 102, and Nelson Mandela, fig. 4. Craven (1992, p. 86) notes that this distinction between depicting living and martyred figures was the difference between fostering a 'cult of the personality' and emphasising a revolutionary legacy beyond the individual. With regard to an OSPAAAL portrait of Che Guevara, fig. 108, he writes:

> While the heroic portraits of Socialist Realism paradoxically celebrated *great individuals* in isolation and *hierarchical power* as 'progressive' - neither of which are legitimate socialist values - the Cuban *Che* poster featured an abstract and flexible portrait of Che to underscore the larger process of history leading beyond him. Indeed, in the poster by Serrano, the image of Che fractures and disperses as the revolutionary process expands. In this way, the Cuban poster was not only far more compelling aesthetically, but also far less guilty ideologically of a fetishizing individualism.

The rejection of socialist realism is especially conspicuous given the location of OSPAAAL's headquarters in Havana and Cuba's ties to the Soviet Union. As noted, Cuba turned towards the Soviet Union for economic and political support in the early 1960s. Over the course of the 1960-1980s, the 'closeness' of this relationship fluctuated. For example, it reached a particularly low point following the Missile Crisis in 1962; whereas the *quinquenio gris*, five grey years, between 1971 and 1976 marked a period of ideological, cultural and economic conformity with the Soviet Union (Blight and Brenner, 2002; Kapcia, 2008). Nevertheless, they remained allies; and the Soviet position on art was clear. As Kunzle (1975, p. 90) observed, 'Krushchev's now famous outbursts against abstract art cannot have failed to penetrate Cuba in some form at the time Cuba was drawing economically closer to the Soviet Union'.

Instead, OSPAAAL posters embraced a wide range of artistic styles broadly attributed to modernism - such as pop art, figs. 51 and 75; op art, figs. 28 and 89; minimalism, figs. 45 and 90; conceptual art, figs. 10 and 34; constructivist montage, figs. 36 and 99; and surrealist disjuncture, figs. 50 and 105 - many of which were strongly associated with the United States and Western Europe (Corrigan, 2014, p. 75; Craven, 1992, p. 80; 2006, pp. 15-16; Miner, 2011, p. 1284). Fig. 97, for example, plays with the use of halftone to convey the disappearance of Mehdi Ben Barka. This effect, which is also present in figs. 18, 30 and 85, was common in pop art. As Barnhisel (2015, p. 30) notes, unlike socialist realism, 'they do not seek to reproduce the world as we are accustomed to seeing it reproduced, but rather they aim to call attention to the ways that we have been habituated to seeing the world and to show us that these ways are simply conventions'. Modernism was regarded as an expression of freedom that foreground the individual and self-determination. Furthermore, as Sontag (1999) discusses, these styles of art evolved alongside the development of capitalism in the twentieth century. Thus, it was not only the United States and Western Europe that they were linked to, but also cultures of commodification, advertising and consumerism. Pop art in particular was synonymous with the explosion of consumer culture in the United States. Take, for example, Andy Warhol's iconic images of Campbell's soup cans and Coca-Cola bottles - figs. 109, 110 and 111, which used well-known American products to question aesthetic and political divisions (Curley, 2013). In light of the ideological binary of the Cold War, Cuba's embrace of socialism and poor relations with the United States, one might have expected these styles of art to represent an enemy culture. Indeed, that was the official position of the Soviet Union, which regarded any move away from socialist realism as subversive behaviour (Curley, 2013; 2018; Segal, 2016, p. 66).

However, in Cuba, the new revolutionary government had taken a different tack to art and culture, which manifested in the African series of OSPAAAL posters. Although there was an initial foray into socialist realism in the early 1960s, it received a less than positive response (Goldman, 1994, p. 144; Kunzle, 1975, pp. 90-91). Kunzle, for example, noted that 'visitors to Cuba in these years remarked distastefully on the "huge portraits of Marx and Castro, along with posters of strong and sober workers with shovels raised"'; while Edmundo Desnoes, a Cuban critic and novelist, 'inveighed against their crude, cheap realism, and the illustrational mediocrity of the typical "forest of arms, nightmare of hammers and wrenches, workers with monstrous body and pin head…"' (Desnoes, 1969 and Thomas, 1971, p. 1347 cited in Kunzle,

1975, p. 90). Che Guevara famously described socialist realist art as 'the corpse of the 19th century bourgeois painting' and Castro actively discouraged any 'cult of the personality' art using his image (Guevara, 1968, p. 548; Kunzle, 1975, p. 90). Despite tensions between orthodox members of the Cuban Communist Party - who advocated for socialist realism - and those who argued that art could not be confined to a particular movement or style if the aim of the Revolution was to raise political awareness and fight for human emancipation, the latter prevailed.

Thus, the Cuban government adopted an approach to art that is regularly summarised through Castro's oft quoted words to artists and intellectuals, 'within the Revolution, everything; against the Revolution, nothing' (Castro, 1961). However, as Kumaraswami (2009, p. 527) remarks:

> The centrality of the *Palabras* as a policy document has been reinforced on countless occasions, both on and off the island, to support a range of positions: either to demonstrate the supposedly authoritarian hold that Castro maintained […] over all aspects of life in Cuba, including freedom of artistic expression; to underline the swift and inevitable alignment after 1959 of the Cuban revolutionary leadership with Stalinist/Zhadanovian cultural doctrine, that is, to demonstrate the 'sovietisation' of Cuban culture after 1959; or, conversely, to celebrate the logic, coherence and continuity of cultural policy over the nearly 50 years of the Revolution.

Instead, Castro's words are better understood in light of the domestic context. Specifically, that they were spoken following an intense period of unrestricted artistic creativity in the first few years of the Cuban Revolution, which was brough to an abrupt end by the *P.M.* affair - the censorship of a film depicting Havana's nightlife and ensuing debate over artistic freedom (Miller, 2008, p. 677). Thus, Kumaraswami (2009, p. 540) asserts:

> Seen in a wider context, then, the speech can be seen to have been advocating an essentially inclusive and affirmative vision: that as long as they did not knowingly work to damage the Revolution or the people, artists and intellectuals were at liberty to find their own ways of contributing to the collective national project.

Broadly speaking, artists were therefore free to experiment with form but not necessarily content; and free to use any style of art, including those associated with the United States, Western Europe and capitalism, as long as it advanced the goals of the Revolution. Many of

the poster artists on the island had also worked in American-owned advertising companies prior to 1959 and as a result were familiar with styles and techniques specific to this work (Eckmann, 2006, pp. 45-47). Although the debate on artistic freedom did not end with the *Palabras*, as Miller (2008, p. 687) states, 'it was not just capitalist alienation against which the Cuban revolutionaries rebelled, but also Soviet-style communist culture'.

This approach rejected the sensible binaries governing art and ideology, which styles of art could be used by whom and for what purpose, as Cuba - a socialist country - disregarded the expectation that it produce socialist realist propaganda art. This disruption of the sensible existed in each sublime moment between artist-poster-viewer, in which established understandings were confronted with a new reality where artistic styles were no longer tethered to ideology. As Gordon (2013, p. 129) notes:

> [Rancière] discusses the transformative potential of artworks to create new modes of perception and to thus enact political change by enabling the viewer to access previously unthinkable possibilities. […] In this way, art's capacity to make political change involves numerous minuscule instances in which a spectator's gaze differs from that which is expected of them. Works of art do their work on the level of this multiplicity of possible outcomes, our capacity to reinterpret and reappropriate objects and images into new perceptual frameworks.

Hence, through the African series of OSPAAAL posters, viewers encountered a new distribution of the sensible that made the previously impossible, possible. Namely, that modernist styles of art could be used to communicate socialist propaganda.

Non-Prescriptive Designs

The second way in which the African series of OSPAAAL posters did not conform to the norms and expectations of the genre was that it was remarkably non-prescriptive. To refer back to Jowett and O'Donnell's (2018, p. 6) definition, *'propaganda is the deliberate, systematic attempt to shape perceptions, manipulate cognitions, and direct behavior to achieve a response that furthers the desired intent of the propagandist'.* Similarly, for Taylor (2003, p. 6) and Dittmer and Bos (2019, p. xviii) propaganda is defined by the deliberate attempt to generate a particular outcome. Taylor (2003, p. 7) even states that:

> What distinguishes propaganda from all other processes of persuasion is the question of *intent*. Propaganda uses communication to convey a message, an idea, or an ideology that is designed primarily to serve the self-interests of the person or people doing the communicating.

In order to do this, propaganda is usually typified by a clear, unambiguous and easily interpreted message. Indeed, writing in 1970, Sontag (1999, p. 205) observed that the job of left-revolutionary posters was usually 'to confirm, reinforce, and further disseminate' political ideology. For example, in Peronist Argentina a visual propaganda campaign was launched that was designed to educate the population and centred around the *dignificación* of the worker. The poster images of workers and factories that formed a key part of the campaign were accompanied by text such as 'worker yesterday oppressed, today dignified' and 'the rights of the worker were proclaimed by General Perón, and today are already included in the National Constitution' (Schembs, 2013, pp. 96-97). These provided clear and direct messages to their audience.

In contrast, the African series of OSPAAAL posters was far from prescriptive and could be surprisingly ambiguous regarding its message and intent. Why this was the case varied from poster to poster. Some, for example, contained very little or no text to direct the viewer - see figs. 46 and 54; while others employed abstraction, encouraging multiple interpretations - see figs. 27, 28 and 83. Many also used iconographic visual shorthand, as discussed in chapter six; which, although akin to a visual language, was not always a straightforward or explicit form of communication. For example, fig. 47 depicts two women who are likely of African descent owing to their clothing and the use of black ink to create their silhouettes. They are both carrying babies but where one woman has an umbrella or parasol across her shoulder the other has a rifle. The OSPAAAL logo is visible in the bottom right-hand corner, but there is no text. To look at the poster alone, it neither contains nor imparts any clear message, instruction or sense of affect. Although text is not necessary to make sense of images or convey meaning or feeling in propaganda, images and text often work together (see Mitchell, 1986; 1994). In this example, however, the lack of text to provide direction is particularly noticeable. As noted in the preceding chapters, the image in fig. 47 is actually adapted from illustrations by Emory Douglas - the Revolutionary Artist and then Minister of Culture for the Black Panther Party (Docs Populi, 2022; Durant, 2013, pp. 19, 101; figs. 112 and 113). However, in Douglas' illustrations the baby in the foreground holds a gun and there is no rifle across the woman's

shoulder. Multiple interpretations of this poster are, of course, possible; and why OSPAAAL artist Lazaro Abreu chose to alter, reverse and combine Douglas' illustrations in this way remains unclear. Nonetheless, two possible interpretations are: 1) a familiarity with the Tricontinental Movement and its aims is assumed and the poster promotes armed revolutionary struggle in Africa, or 2) a familiarity with Douglas' art is assumed and the poster speaks of the solidarity between African Americans and the Tricontinental Movement. Many of the other posters from the African series of OSPAAAL posters use ambiguous images, see figs. 57 and 88, or abstraction, see figs. 27, 28 and 83, which similarly lend themselves to multiple interpretations. For example, it is difficult to judge the facial expression of the figure in fig. 57. Accompanied only by the text 'DAY OF SOLIDARITY WITH SOUTH AFRICA (june 26)' and the OSPAAAL logo, it is unclear if they are shouting or screaming. Or, if they are in pain, distress or angry, or perhaps none of these. As a result, it is difficult to pick out any specific meaning or get a sense of how the viewer is "supposed" to feel on encountering the poster.

Arguably, the non-prescriptive aspect of the African series of OSPAAAL posters might reflect the assumed technological and compositional modalities of the site of audiencing - the context in which artists expected the posters to be viewed. As noted at the outset, OSPAAAL posters were disseminated via the Tricontinental Magazine, which published articles on subjects such as international politics and revolutionary literature and was sent directly to those allied with the movement (Gronbeck-Tedesco, 2015, pp. 211-212; Mor, 2019, p. 50). Mor (2019, p. 58) comments that 'poster art was accompanied by essays written by figures such as Minh and Guevara, interviews with Yasser Arafat, pronouncements by Luis Cabral, and calls for specific acts and days of solidarity with various causes'. Hence, it would have been reasonable to assume that those receiving the posters were familiar with the movement's political discourse and ideology and likely sympathetic to its messages of solidarity. Thus, the posters themselves need not have been prescriptive as the accompanying texts and surrounding context were prescriptive enough to prime viewers. However, this supposition should be tempered against the intended function of a poster - to be displayed out of context, on walls, in public spaces, and viewed by a wider audience less familiar with the Tricontinental Movement.

Writing in 1970, Sontag (1999, p. 205) remarked:

> Unlike most political posters, the Cuban posters sometimes say a great deal. And, sometimes, they say hardly anything at all. Perhaps the most advanced aspect of Cuban

> political posters is their taste for visual and verbal understatement. There seems no demand on the poster artists to be explicitly and continuously didactic.

However, I would argue that the majority of the posters from the African series of OSPAAAL posters *do* clearly raise an issue, topic or sense of affect *but* they are rarely prescriptive beyond this. For example, many of the posters express solidarity towards a specific country accompanied by a date and an image of a fighter or soldier - see, for example, figs. 48, 61 and 63. However, numerous questions beyond the issue raised - solidarity with the specified country - remain; such as, were the posters designed to express support or simply raise awareness? And if so, of what exactly? What was the significance of the accompanying dates and images of fighters? Or were they designed to engender action? And if so, what type of action? Armed warfare, protests or further solidarity? Or were they designed to encourage a sense of community? And if so, between whom? Countries, continents or peoples? Or a combination of some or all of the above? How were the posters designed to make viewers feel? Angry, enthused, obligated to take action? Sontag (1999, p. 203) opined that 'however dissimilar in context and destiny, all political posters share a common purpose; ideological mobilization'; a statement echoed by many others - see, for example, Crowley (2008), Davidson *et al.* (2006), Wells *et al.* (1996) and Young (2016). While I agree that ideological mobilisation was one of OSPAAAL's broad aims, it remains that the African series of OSPAAAL posters was remarkably non-prescriptive relative to Cold War propaganda. Generally speaking, the posters raised an issue but then left its further interpretation open with few clarifying messages or instruction to direct the viewer. This open-ended approach also arises in the subjectivation of the political subject, discussed in the preceding chapter.

Importantly, this non-prescriptive aspect of the African series of OSPAAAL posters was another aesthetic choice on the part of the poster artists. The decision on what to exclude was as significant as the decision on what to include with regard to image composition. As Bleiker (2018, p. 14) explains:

> Images reflect certain aesthetic choices. They represent the world from a particular angle. They inevitably exclude as much as they include. A photograph cannot be neutral because it always is an image chosen and composed by a particular person. It is taken from a particular angle, and then produced and reproduced in a certain manner, thereby excluding a range of alternative ways of capturing the object in question.

In this instance, the non-prescriptive designs of the African series of OSPAAAL posters signal the choice to exclude clear or direct instruction. If this was a conscious or unconscious choice is difficult to know. However, either way, they rejected the norms and expectations of the genre by breaking with the convention that propaganda convey a clear, unambiguous and easily interpreted message. This is indicative of the aesthetic regime, where art is uncoupled from the norms and expectations of genre and released from the assumption that the artist can determine the effect of a work on the viewer. Furthermore, for the viewer it creates a moment of dissensus or the sublime in the subliminal as they attempt to interpret an image that inspires multiple interpretations.

The Presupposition of Equality

The non-prescriptive aspect of these posters brings this discussion to the presupposition of equality. As discussed, the African series of OSPAAAL posters lacked the prescriptive tendencies that were typical of Cold War propaganda. This was symptomatic of the Cuban government's approach to art and education following the Cuban Revolution in 1959. In addition to opting not to define a particular style of revolutionary art, the government decided that the people would be educated to a level at which they could appreciate and interpret art as opposed to simplifying art so that it could be easily understood by everyone (Craven, 2002, pp. 75-116). Improved education was by no means restricted to the arts, but part of a population-wide campaign that famously almost eradicated illiteracy in Cuba (Gott, 2004, pp. 188-189)[28]. This, again, differed significantly to the Soviet Union where socialist realism 'demanded highly legible pictures that could communicate with the often-illiterate proletariat' (Curley, 2013, p. 85). Certainly, an art *by* the people and *for* the people was a common aim of many socialist revolutions. Thus, Cuba's approach to artistic freedom, education, and the revolutionary relationship between art and the people likely fostered the non-prescriptive aspect of the African series of OSPAAAL posters. Indeed, Sontag (1999, p. 204) observed that political posters in Cuba were designed 'to raise and complicate

[28] In 1961, approximately 100,000 volunteers travelled to the countryside to teach the largely illiterate rural population to read and write. This national effort essentially abolished illiteracy in Cuba. Gott (2004, p. 189) notes that 'its success encouraged the government to engage in a continuing campaign to encourage adult education'.

consciousness - the highest aim of the Revolution itself'. Moreover, this approach to art and education has an affinity with Rancière's essay on *The Emancipated Spectator*.

In *The Emancipated Spectator*, Rancière posits that the spectatorship announced by the aesthetic regime presupposes the equal capacity of the spectator with that of the performer. Although the essay centres on theatre, it is applicable more broadly to artists and their audiences (Rancière, 2009b, p. 17). In précis, he explains that in the aesthetic regime the arts are freed from any hierarchies or assumptions surrounding the form and purpose of art. The unequal hierarchy - or inequality - between artist and audience is removed, including that pertaining to the artist as active and the audience as passive.

> What makes it possible to pronounce the spectator seated in her place as inactive, if not the previously posited radical opposition between the active and the passive? Why identify gaze and passivity, unless on the presupposition that to view means to take pleasure in images and appearances while ignoring the truth behind the image and the reality outside the theatre? […] These oppositions - viewing/knowing, appearance/reality, activity/passivity - are quite different from logical oppositions between clearly defined terms. They specifically define a distribution of the sensible, an *a priori* distribution of the positions and capacities and incapacities attached to these positions. They are embodied allegories of inequality. (Rancière, 2009b, p. 12)

In contrast to the ethical and representative regimes, in the aesthetic regime spectatorship is recognised as neither passive nor active. The artist recognises that they cannot determine how the art is interpreted, but rather that the art is what artist and audience have in common - part of a relationship between artist-art-spectator, or artist-poster-viewer as regards this research. Hence, in recognising the equal capacity of artist and audience, there is a presupposition of equality. As Rancière (2009b, p. 13) writes, 'emancipation begins when we challenge the opposition between viewing and acting; when we understand that the self-evident facts that structure the relations between saying, seeing and doing themselves belong to the structure of domination and subjection'.

Certainly, there are similarities between Rancière's application of Joseph Jacotot's principles in both *The Emancipated Spectator* and *The Ignorant Schoolmaster* and the Cuban government's approach to art and revolution. Rancière, akin to Jacotot, argues that the

apparent intellectual gap between master and student is an embodiment of inequality - as opposed to a product of ineptitude. However, by starting from the premise that they possess equal capacities, the student is encouraged to learn by the master as opposed to the master seeking to impart knowledge to the student. In Cuba, it was decided that the population did not need to be instructed on how to interpret art; rather, the public were considered capable of understanding complex ideas in art, such as moral responsibility, and reaching their own judgements. This thinking also influenced the decisions to give artists relatively free reign and not to define a particular style of revolutionary art. Thus, in both instances there is a presupposition of equality between master/artist and student/audience.

This presupposition of equality is present to varying degrees in the African series of OSPAAAL posters. It is most apparent in the least prescriptive designs and seemingly absent in the most prescriptive designs. For example, fig. 46 alludes to the conflict in Guinea-Bissau where the PAIGC was fighting for independence from the Portuguese Empire. Although the poster depicts a man, the outline of French Guinea, a small tribal mask and the West African coastline, there appears to be little or no intention to impart a specific message or engender a particular feeling. In fig. 24, the nondescript silhouette encourages the viewer to 'fill in the blank' regarding the central figure's identity. This affords the viewer space to interpret the image in their own way. Furthermore, it prompts the viewer to engage with the poster. A similar tactic is present in Alfredo Rostgaard's poster celebrating the third anniversary of the Tricontinental Conference - fig. 114. Here, as Garland Mahler (2018, p. 116) notes, 'a guerrilla fighter in multicolor camouflage appears with a blank face that can be filled in by any one of the three faces on the right side of the poster'. In contrast, fig. 96 - discussed earlier in chapter six - firmly directs the viewer towards a critical negative standpoint regarding tourism, inequality and exploitation in Ethiopia. Thus, the posters occupy a spectrum; and, unlike Rancière's work might suggest[29], the presupposition of equality is therefore not either/or but a continuum.

The presupposition of equality marks a departure from the ethical and representative regimes, which see a link between the intention of the artist and the interpretation of the

[29] For Rancière, equality is a presupposition that 'is either asserted at the outset or is irredeemably lost'; it cannot be partially implemented (Tanke, 2011, p. 36).

audience. Indeed, the presupposition of equality present in the African series of OSPAAAL posters is a marked departure from the typical prescriptive tendencies of Cold War propaganda. As Tanke (2011, p. 145) notes, 'such experiences [verifications of equality] allow for the discovery of an equality of capacities at odds with the dominant distribution of the sensible'. Thus, because the presupposition of equality rejects the hierarchies of the sensible with regard to artists and audiences, it is associated with a break in the police order. Or, here, a dissensus of the rules governing art and propaganda during the Cold War. The less prescriptive OSPAAAL posters can therefore be read as embodied allegories of equality.

Abstraction

The last way in which the African series of OSPAAAL posters did not conform to the norms and expectations of its genre was through its use of abstraction. Broadly speaking, 'abstract art is art that does not attempt to represent an accurate depiction of a visual reality but instead use shapes, colours, forms and gestural marks to achieve its effect' (TATE, 2020a). As Genter (2011, p. 32) explains at length:

> Abstract artists […] jettisoned the imperative to represent external reality, an imperative that had once forced them to create "the illusion of a boxlike cavity" on their canvas to maintain the sense of three-dimensional space. But by preserving the "integrity of the picture plan," modern painters gradually sacrificed "verisimilitude" for the relentless experimentation with the effects of paint on the canvas. By abandoning representation and turning to abstraction as a guiding principle, modern artists now treated "every part of the canvas equivalent," creating all-over compositions woven "into a tight mesh whose principle of formal unity is contained and recapitulated in each thread, so that we find the essence of the whole work in every one of its parts." Consequently, the aesthetic effect was "optical rather than pictorial," created through the "relations of color, shape, and line largely divorced from descriptive connotations." Through the flatness and impenetrability of the picture plane, the abstract painting was a solid object, no longer a vehicle for transcendence nor a mirror for the outside world.

Of course, all art addresses the gap between reality and representation. However, nowhere is this more explicit than in abstract art, which reflects an uncoupling of art from the notion of representation (Bleiker, 2018, p. 23). This uncoupling of art from representation, and also the

specific modes of presentation, form and subject matter associated with the representative regime, is why Rancière connects abstract art with dissensus. For Rancière, abstraction is an innovation of the aesthetic regime in that the attempt to link artistic causes and spectatorial effects is disregarded (Tanke, 2011, pp. 81-82, 84-85). Although the gap between reality and representation is omnipresent, we tend to conflate the two as one and the same in our day-to-day experiences. Consequently, when the gap is made explicit, as with art, and especially abstract art, the viewer is confronted by the limits of the sensible. Bleiker (2009, p. 75) echoes this in his discussion of the sublime, noting that 'confrontation with the sublime shatters this misplaced belief in authentic representation […] this is the moment when the normal functioning of the symbolic is ruptured and we can catch a fleeting glimpse of the real'. While abstraction is not present in all of the posters that comprise the African series of OSPAAAL posters, it is notable in the collection as a whole. Mor (2019, p. 58), for example, remarks on the 'abstracted images of struggle' that characterise OSPAAAL poster art. Furthermore, abstraction is linked to all of the previous three points of discussion, the styles of art associated with capitalism and communism, non-prescriptive propaganda and the presupposition of equality.

Firstly, with regard to the binary dualism of capitalism and communism, abstraction was firmly associated with capitalism and 'the West'. As noted earlier, reducing artistic styles to political ideologies was simplistic and superficial but nonetheless common in the early years of the Cold War (Curley, 2018, p. 22). Viewed through this binary ideological lens, abstraction became a symbol of capitalism and American modernism. In the United States and Western Europe, abstract art emerged alongside other modernist traditions such as Dadaism, surrealism, expressionism and cubism (Barnhisel, 2015, p. 10). Galenson (2009, pp. 253, 259) explains that 'abstract painting was first developed in the years immediately before and after the outbreak of World War I'; however, 'it was only after World War II, with the emergence of Abstract Expressionism in New York and Tachisme in Paris, that abstraction became the dominant form of advanced art'. Modernists argued that art should be autonomous from political and social commitments; and so, modernist art came to be seen as 'a celebration of the virtues of freedom and the assertion that the individual is sovereign' (Barnhisel, 2015, p. 3). Ironically, it was abstract art's lack of political and social commitment that led to it becoming a symbol of individual freedom and aligned to capitalism (Segal, 2016, p. 61). As Genter (2011, p. 44) notes, 'along with American symphonies, modern jazz, and Hollywood

films, abstract art was one of many cultural exports federal agencies sent abroad as political propaganda […] outwardly universal while simultaneously very American, abstract expressionism became the perfect symbol of the intellectual, artistic, and personal freedom inherent to Western democracies and was seemingly antithetical to the oppressive cultures of totalitarian regimes'.

For the Soviet Union, abstract art exemplified the ideological shortcomings of capitalism. Its lack of political and social commitment was regarded as a sign of decadent bourgeois indulgence and degeneration, while some argued that the uncoupling of art from the notion of representation left abstract art 'dehumanising'[30] (Segal, 2016, pp. 61, 66; Barnhisel, 2015, p. 51). As Curley (2018, p. 46) explains:

> The logic went as follows: Capitalism alienates individuals, and as this alienation becomes more profound with the expansion of markets, humans increasingly disappear from works of art. Abstract art thus goes beyond the degraded and fragmented bodies of Expressionism and Cubism; individuals vanish altogether. For Soviet commentators, it made sense that Western industrialists bought this kind of art, because to do so was to transform an image of extreme alienation into a decorative sign of wealth.

Hence, viewed through the binary dualism of the Cold War, abstract art polarised opinions according to political ideology. Curley (2013, p. 11) provides an example of this via Jackson Pollock's drip painting *Autumn Rhythm*, fig. 6, painted in 1950.

> The Pollock canvas, according to accounts in the East, was meaningless scribble emblematic of decadent capitalist values; for the West, it represented the inevitable culmination of the avant-garde tradition and formed a humanist bulwark against totalitarian tendencies.

However, true to form, Cuba proved the exception to the rule, subverting the sensible relations between abstraction, capitalism and communism. In Cuba, abstract art had been part of the avant-garde movement that was closely identified with dissident politics and opposition to the Batista regime (Curley, 2018, p. 43; McEwen, 2016, pp. 2-3). Following the

[30] The 'Dehumanization of Art' is an essay written by the Spanish philosopher José Ortega y Gasset in 1925 in response to modernism in art. By 'dehumanization', Ortega referred to the absence of human forms in nonrepresentational artistic practices. (Ortega y Gasset, 2019)

Cuban Revolution in 1959, it became part of the debate on art and culture that oscillated between Soviet conformity and freedom of expression. However, in general, abstract art was tolerated if not embraced (Gordon-Nesbitt, 2015). In 1963, Castro famously stated, 'our enemies are capitalism and imperialism, not abstract painting' (McEwen, 2016, p. 187). Certainly, much of the art produced in Cuba since 1959 has employed abstraction including the African series of OSPAAAL posters - see, for example, figs. 28, 45, 83 and 90. Indeed, visual metonym and synecdoche were often used to convey complex concepts. For example, many of the posters incorporated imagery of things breaking, figs. 18, 28, 31, 76, 77, 83 and 90, suggesting the notion of a break with the past, previous ways of doing things, or in Rancière's language, a break with the previous distribution of the sensible. By rejecting the norms and expectations surrounding abstraction and propaganda, the posters prompted moments of dissensus as viewers attempted to account for the unexpected or incomprehensible - that is, abstract socialist propaganda art.

Secondly, abstraction plays a key part in the non-prescriptive designs of the African series of OSPAAAL posters. The uncoupling of abstract art from the notion of representation naturally invites multiple interpretations. In acknowledging and explicitly working with the gap between reality and representation, abstract artists relinquish any illusion of control over the interpretation of the viewer. Accordingly, abstraction was not commonly used in Cold War propaganda[31], which sought to impart clear, unambiguous and easily interpreted messages. The abstract designs in the African series of OSPAAAL posters contribute to the sense of not immediately being able to identify a singular meaning - see, for example, figs. 27, 28 and 83. This can be understood as a moment of dissensus or the sublime on the part of the viewer, as the mind attempts to make sense of the abstract images.

Thirdly, following on from the non-prescriptive aspect, the use of abstraction in the African series of OSPAAAL posters also plays into the presupposition of equality. As noted, abstract artists do not seek to control the interpretation of the viewer. There is therefore a

[31] With the exception of the United States' use of abstract art as part of cultural propaganda campaigns. For example, in the late 1950s, with support from the United States Information Agency, the Museum of Modern Art in New York put together various travelling exhibitions dedicated to abstract expressionism. (Genter, 2011, p. 45; Segal, 2016, pp. 74-75)

presupposition of the equal capacity of artist and audience, as discussed in the previous section. Indeed, it is for this reason that Rancière (2004, p. 54) connects abstract painting with equality in the aesthetic regime. Thus, acting through the previous three points of discussion - the styles of art associated with capitalism and communism, non-prescriptive propaganda and the presupposition of equality - abstraction in the African series of OSPAAAL posters contributed to the ways in which the posters defied the norms and expectations of their genre.

The Political Capacity of Art

Thus, as discussed, by means of rejecting the styles of art associated with capitalism and communism, non-prescriptive designs, the presupposition of equality and the use of abstraction, the African series of OSPAAAL posters did not conform to the norms and expectations of its genre. During the Cold War, propaganda posters were met with the expectation that they impart clear, unambiguous and easily interpreted messages. Furthermore, communist propaganda typically employed socialist realism, while propaganda produced in capitalist countries adopted modernist traditions. Going against the grain, the African series of OSPAAAL posters used modernist styles of art to create socialist propaganda that was remarkably non-prescriptive and open to interpretation. As noted earlier in the chapter, the norms and expectations regarding propaganda formed part of the sensible of the Cold War. Hence, by not conforming to the norms and expectations of the genre, the African series of OSPAAAL posters disrupted the distribution of the sensible.

In addition to not conforming to the norms and expectations of Cold War propaganda, the African series of OSPAAAL posters simultaneously offered an alternative way of imagining the sensible. Whereas previously, propaganda, art and political ideologies were tethered to dualistic binaries, the posters offered an alternative conceptualisation of the sensible in which propaganda could employ a variety of artistic styles irrespective of political ideology. Similarly, the posters presented the possibility of an alternative non-prescriptive approach to propaganda that was based on the presupposition of equality - as opposed to inequality - between artist and audience. By reimagining the genre of propaganda in the aesthetic and political context of the Cold War, the posters generated dissensus. Indeed, as Tanke (2011, p. 73) notes, the political capacities of art lie in ‘the way art alters the distribution of the sensible through the creation of experiences that are opposed to it’. This gap between the alternative

sensible of the posters and the sensible of the police also speaks of the sublime. As discussed in chapter two, the sublime is characterised by discord, confusion and an initial inability to comprehend the subject. Here, the moment when the viewer struggles to equate what they see with what they expected to see. For example, on seeing pop art or abstraction in socialist propaganda, or the non-prescriptive designs that opted not to convey an easily interpreted message. The sublime prompts the viewer to face the limits of their understanding of the world. This alternative way of imagining propaganda in the context of the Cold War is akin to the alternative way in which the posters imagined the international community and its actors, discussed in chapter six. Similarly, the posters conveyed a new sensible where the impossible was possible; thus, they registered the existence of oppositional experiential and thought worlds. As Bleiker (2018, p. 3) writes, 'a work of art can lead us to see the world in a new light and help us rethink assumptions we have taken for granted'. The African series of OSPAAAL posters therefore disrupted political and aesthetic communities of sense.

Chapter Eight: Conclusion

This research examined a previously neglected collection of political posters that were published by the *Organización de Solidaridad de los Pueblos de Asia, África y América Latina* between 1967 and 1987 in order to address the question, 'what does the African series of OSPAAAL posters convey about the role of Africa in the Tricontinental Movement and the capacity of the posters to disrupt the sensible of the Cold War?' Visually striking, combining bold, bright colours, pop art aesthetics and emotive designs with radical socialist and anti-imperialist solidarity, the posters are an iconic example of propaganda art collected by individuals and institutions around the world. Furthermore, they draw attention to a critical gap in our knowledge of the Cold War. Despite the importance of African liberation struggles, the African diaspora and anti-black racism in the movement's discourse, activities and legacy, the role of Africa in the Tricontinental Movement has not - until now - been the focus of any academic research. Although the OSPAAAL posters offer a valuable insight into the political discourse and ideology of the Tricontinental Movement, they have been overlooked in the study of the international politics of the Cold War. This speaks of the failure of IR to 'see' the posters as a political subject. Thus, this research also sought to explore the politics of the posters that IR otherwise foreclosed; namely, the transnational, artistic and aesthetic relations of solidarity between peoples as part of a global fight against imperialism and the capacity of the posters to disrupt the sensible of the Cold War.

The theoretical framework and methodology explored two sides of the same coin; Callahan's (2020) visibility / visuality dyad, or 'what images mean' and 'what images do'. Akin to Callahan, I conceptualised this dualism as a productive as opposed to problematic tension. The methodology primarily centred on 'what images mean', discussing approaches to the study of images and visual research in the social sciences and also IR more specifically. Using Rose's (2016) 'critical visual methodology', it addressed the four sites of the African series of OSPAAAL posters: the site of production, where the posters were made; the site of the image itself, their visual content; the site of circulation, where they travelled; and the site of audiencing, where the posters encountered their spectators. Adopting a reflexive approach, I recognised that I am in many ways temporally and spatially removed from the original context of the posters. Thus, though semiotics is more commonly cited in political poster research, I opted to use iconography due to its contextual element. Panofsky's (1939) three levels of

analysis provided a framework through which to examine the layers of denotation, connotation and contextual meaning in the African series of OSPAAAL posters, which was combined with archival research and fieldwork in Cuba.

The theoretical framework outlined an aesthetic approach focused on 'what images do'. Along with other visual researchers, I argue that images 'do things' and have the capacity to intervene in the distribution of the sensible. Drawing on the work of Jacques Rancière, chapter two therefore explained how we can conceptualise the Cold War - in particular, with regard to international politics, race and art - and IR as a discipline as distributions of the sensible. It then discussed Rancière's concepts of dissensus, the aesthetics of politics, the politics of aesthetics, and equality to reflect on disruptions to the sensible. Rancière's notion of dissensus shares similarities with Bleiker's (2009) and Shapiro's (2018) notions of the sublime. Indeed, they all describe a disruption to the sensory presentation and perception of the world. However, the sublime offers an alternative way of thinking about dissensus with regard to emotions, politicised art and scale. This research conceptualised dissensus as made up of many subliminal moments between the artist-poster-viewer. Moreover, it conceptualised Garland Mahler's (2018) premise that colour acted as a metonymic political signifier in Tricontinentalist texts as dissensus and an encounter with the sublime. By using colour to denote politics and political ideology as opposed to ethnic or phenotypic groups, the texts disrupted the sensible of the Cold War. Lastly, drawing on the work of Cornelius Castoriadis (1987), Benedict Anderson (2006) and Emma Hutchison (2016), chapter two delineated what I refer to as 'the Tricontinental imaginary' to explain how through these dissensual politics this transnational community gained form and effective power through collective imagination.

Chapter four analysed the African series of OSPAAAL posters apropos Garland Mahler's premise that colour acted as a metonymic political signifier in Tricontinentalist texts. It began by examining how various currents in oppositional political thought came together to form the Tricontinental Movement, encompassing: the Bandung Conference, the Afro-Asian Peoples' Solidarity Organisation, the Non-Aligned Movement, the Third World in the United States and Europe, the anti-imperialism of Latin America, the Cuban Revolution, the polarising capitalist-communist binary of the Cold War and the Tricontinental Conference itself. This worked to explicate the political discourse and ideology of the Tricontinental Movement and Africa's role within it. In précis, Africa, along with Asia and Latin America, was foundational to

OSPAAAL and the Tricontinental Movement. It was also central to the Third World project, which in no small part informed the politics of the movement. More specific to Africa was its experiences of colonialism and postcolonialism and the history and past injustices of the transatlantic slave trade. Thus, shaped by anti-colonial movements and the inequality and oppression faced by black peoples, Africa, the African diaspora and anti-black racism rose to the top of the Tricontinental Movement's agenda. It was also an important active site of resistance in the global fight against imperialism - most notably in apartheid South Africa, Angola and Guinea-Bissau. The analysis then turned to the posters, finding that the African series of OSPAAAL posters did not conform to Garland Mahler's premise. Although there were a handful of designs that could allude to 'the Tricontinental's global and transracial resistant subjectivity', this reading was complicated by the political and racial reality of African liberation struggles during the Cold War. Furthermore, there were also examples of poster artists engaging colour and race in a way that I described as the inverse of Garland Mahler's premise. In these posters, African people and African peoples were portrayed as very specifically African as opposed to black in any phenotypic or political sense. The analysis also highlighted several notable themes and aesthetic devices with regard to colour and the depiction of race; namely, the use of black and white colour, abstraction using bright colours, tribal imagery and the absence of race in poster designs. These suggested that poster artists were aware of and sensitive to racial and colour politics, mirroring silences around race in Cuba's domestic policy. In addition, though the posters did not disrupt the sensible by using colour as a metonymic political signifier, the analysis indicated that they challenged the sensible in other ways - through the depiction of African peoples and by challenging the sensible aesthetics of the Cold War.

Hence, chapter five considered the role of Cuba's post-revolutionary racial politics with regard to the African series of OSPAAAL posters. It began by outlining the history of Cuba's racial politics prior to 1959 and why 'the Cuban Revolution […] inherited a race problem' (Taylor, 1988, p. 19). Although the new revolutionary government took steps to improve the lives of black Cubans, racial inequality and informal discrimination persisted. Furthermore, with the assertion that the Revolution was Marxist-Leninist, the government embraced the rhetoric that socialism had brought an end to racism. This construct of Cuba as a colour-blind race-less society was a powerful tool in domestic and foreign policy. Not only did it serve as a means to embarrass the United States, but it also proved to be a useful means of gaining international

respect and recognition at a time when Cuba was seeking to counter its political and economic isolation. However, at the same time, Castro emphasised Cuba's black population and African heritage to reach out to Africa and African Americans, building on the pan-African movement to draw together the Afro-Asian bloc, Latin America and the Third World Left in the United States. This second construct of Cuba as Afro-Cuban sat uneasily alongside the first. Cubans were simultaneously proud of their part in pan-African struggles and uncomfortable discussing the subject of race. The details of Cuba's relationship with Africa also informed the former's perception of the latter. Thus, a Cuban perspective illuminated certain aspects of the African series of OSPAAAL posters - such as the prevalence of armed revolutionaries and guerrilla soldiers, inconsistencies in the representation of race and by extension the use of colour, the simplistic illustration of African liberation struggles, and the use of tribal imagery. Although OSPAAAL was ostensibly an international and transnational organisation, the posters were also influenced by Cuban politics.

The analysis indicated that Africa was depicted via its people as opposed to the leaders of its governments. However, in the police order, the existing distribution of the sensible of the Cold War based on inequality, Africa was marginalised as an international actor and its people rendered invisible. Thus, by depicting African peoples in the context of international politics, the African series of OSPAAAL posters made them visible, framed them as international actors and thereby challenged the police order. Chapter six explored this process, beginning with the identification of a *dēmos* - the people of Africa, Asia and Latin America. By depicting a part of the community with no part, the posters contested assumptions about who belonged in the international community. The subjectivation of the political subject gave form and substance to the *dēmos*. By depicting the new political subject and its impossible name, the posters served as a manifestation of visibility, adopting new identities and reimagining the sensible. The posters also acted as a visual demonstration of an alternative voice to that of the police; comprised of *what* the posters said, *how* they spoke and the fact that they *did* speak. Thus, the African series of OSPAAAL posters depicted a new sensible where the impossible was possible - one where the people and peoples of Africa existed as part of the Tricontinental community and were able to speak as equals within the wider international community. The conflict between this new sensible and the police order prompted sublime experiences on the part of the viewer that worked to disrupt the sensible politics of the Cold War.

Chapter seven discussed the ways in which the African series of OSPAAAL posters did not conform to the norms and expectations of its genre - that is, propaganda - and thereby disrupted the sensible aesthetics of the Cold War. During the Cold War, posters flourished as a medium of propaganda favoured by protest groups and oppositional movements around the world. While there was a lot of variety in their styles and designs, there were also certain norms and expectations. These were largely tethered to the dualistic binary of capitalism and communism. However, the African series of OSPAAAL posters did not use the styles of art that were associated with communism and the Soviet Union, such as socialist realism; and instead, used modernist styles of art that were more commonly associated with capitalist cultures, the United States and Western Europe, such as pop and op art, minimalism, conceptual art, constructivist montage and surrealist disjuncture. The poster designs were also remarkably non-prescriptive in contrast to the clear, unambiguous and easily interpreted messages that typified propaganda. They generally raised an issue, topic or sense of affect, but then left its further interpretation open to the viewer. This was symptomatic of Cuba's approach to art and education and informed the presupposition of equality between artist and audience, which similarly rejected the norms and expectations of propaganda. Lastly, the use of abstraction contributed to all of the aforementioned politics of aesthetics. Thus, by rejecting the styles of art associated with capitalism and communism, non-prescriptive designs, the presupposition of equality and the use of abstraction, the posters reimagined the genre of propaganda in the aesthetic context of the Cold War thereby disrupting the distribution of the sensible.

Africa and the Tricontinental Imaginary

At the outset, this thesis identified three secondary research questions. The first asked, 'how does the analysis of the African series of OSPAAAL posters elucidate the role of Africa in the Tricontinental imaginary?' As discussed in chapter two, the Tricontinental imaginary offered a way of conceptualising how this transnational community gained form and affective power through collective imagination - a process in which the OSPAAAL posters played a key part. Firstly, Africa was conceptualised as composed of nations but constituted by its people. The posters almost always referenced specific countries by means of international or world days of solidarity, other text, or nationalist iconography, such as flags or national colours. Africa was therefore imagined via nations in line with the police order of the sensible of the Cold

War. However, the posters primarily depicted the people and peoples of Africa as opposed to the leaders of its governments. By depicting them in relation to the international politics of the Cold War, it was thus *the people* of Africa that were reimagined as international actors - disrupting the distribution of the sensible.

Secondly, the posters depicted the people of Africa as guerrilla soldiers, masculine, youthful, armed and actively resisting imperialist oppression. These characteristics were informed by Cuba's own experience of revolution, gendered discourses in international politics and efforts to articulate Che Guevara's 'New Man'. However, they were also imagined as distinctly African. This was realised through the depiction of African struggles and liberation movements, such as apartheid in South Africa, (post)colonialism and the *Partido Africano para a Independência da Guiné e Cabo Verde* in Guinea-Bissau, which were specific to the continent; and African martyrs and intellectual leaders, such as Mehdi Ben Barka and Nelson Mandela, which spotlighted the contribution of African political thought to the political discourse and ideology of the Tricontinental Movement. Similarly, through the use of tribal imagery, which linked to an exoticised and romanticised pre-colonial tribal past, the stereotype of Africa as starving and impoverished, and the emphasis of facial features that were associated with racial stereotypes such as wide lips and/or a broad nose, the people of Africa were rendered as specifically African as opposed to homogenous with the larger Tricontinental community.

Thirdly, although the people of Africa were portrayed as distinctly African, they were imagined as part of the Tricontinental community and the global fight against imperialism. As discussed in chapter six, through the designs of the posters, the accompanying text and the OSPAAAL logo, the people of Africa were depicted as part of the people of Africa, Asia and Latin America, united by the organisation's vision of armed global resistance to imperialism via the three Tricontinental continents - exemplified in fig. 80. Similarly, as noted, the depiction of African intellectual leaders acknowledged the contribution of African political thought to the movement's political discourse and ideology. Furthermore, it was through people-to-people solidarity that Africa was imagined as part of the Tricontinental community as it was through transnational solidarity that the oppressed peoples of the world were imagined as united against imperialism. Thus, the analysis of the African series of OSPAAAL posters indicates that

in the Tricontinental imaginary Africa was conceptualised via its people, as distinctly African, but a key part of the movement.

Political and Aesthetic Dissensus

The second research question asked, 'did the African series of OSPAAAL posters generate political and/or aesthetic dissensus? And if so, how?' In short, the posters did disrupt the sensible; however, not through Garland Mahler's premise as initially put forward. As explained in chapter two, race was a key part of the sensible of the Cold War. Furthermore, the depiction of race followed certain norms and expectations; namely, that skin colour in visual representations adhered to the sensible racial hierarchies. Garland Mahler suggests that Tricontinentalist texts disrupted this aspect of the sensible by using colour to denote politics and political ideology as opposed to ethnic or phenotypic groups. However, the analysis detailed in chapter four found that this was not the case with regard to the African series of OSPAAAL posters.

That said, the African series of OSPAAAL posters did generate dissensus in other ways. Rancière posits that art and politics are both capable of dissensus, albeit through different means; namely, the politics of aesthetics and the aesthetics of politics. Through the latter, he explores the means by which politics can effect a break in the sensible; and through the former, the political capacities of the arts. The African series of OSPAAAL posters generated both political and aesthetic dissensus, discussed in chapters six and seven respectively. However, though distinct, these processes also intersected with one another with regard to the sensible of the Cold War.

The African series of OSPAAAL posters generated political dissensus by making the invisible, visible. In the police order, Africa was marginalised as an international actor and its people rendered invisible. However, through the identification of a *dēmos*, the subjectivation of the political subject and the demonstration of an alternative voice, the posters depicted an alternative way of imagining the international community and its actors. This was akin to the construction of a 'counter-world' - one where the people of Africa existed and were able to speak as equals as part of the international community. Moreover, by making these politics visible, the posters effected a break in the sensible of the Cold War. This political dissensus

was aesthetic as it was demonstrated through the visual medium of the African series of OSPAAAL posters. For example, abstraction was used to depict the *dēmos'* impossible name, and the use of colour and duotone images worked to convey the nondescript and non-specific political subject.

The African series of OSPAAAL posters generated aesthetic dissensus by not conforming to the norms and expectations of its genre - that is, propaganda. As noted, during the Cold War, propaganda posters were met with the expectation that they impart clear, unambiguous and easily interpreted messages. Communist propaganda also typically employed socialist realism, while propaganda produced in capitalist countries adopted modernist traditions. Going against the grain, the African series of OSPAAAL posters used modernist styles of art to create socialist propaganda that was remarkably non-prescriptive and open to interpretation. Through the rejection of the styles of art associated with capitalism and communism, non-prescriptive designs, the presupposition of equality and the use of abstraction, the African series of OSPAAAL posters therefore disrupted the sensible aesthetics of the Cold War. This aesthetic dissensus intersected with the aforementioned political dissensus in that it also registered the existence of oppositional experiential and thought worlds. Whereas previously, propaganda, art and political ideologies were tethered to dualistic binaries, the African series of OSPAAAL posters offered an alternative conceptualisation of the sensible in which propaganda could employ a variety of artistic styles irrespective of political ideology. Similarly, the posters presented the possibility of an alternative non-prescriptive approach to propaganda that was based on the presupposition of equality - as opposed to inequality - between artist and audience. This alternative way of imagining propaganda in the context of the Cold War was akin to the alternative way in which the posters imagined the international community and its actors, depicting a new sensible or 'counter-world' in conflict with that of the police.

The political and aesthetic dissensus of the African series of OSPAAAL posters also intersected with regard to equality. Through the identification of a *dēmos*, the subjectivation of the political subject and the demonstration of an alternative voice, the posters asserted the equal right of the people of Africa to exist and to speak as part of the international community; while the presupposition of equality between artist and audience represented the enactment of

equality - both of which worked to disrupt the police order of the sensible, which was based on inequality.

While the African series of OSPAAAL posters did generate political and aesthetic dissensus, at times it also affirmed the police order of the sensible of the Cold War. Indeed, Bleiker (2018, p. 20) notes that '[images] frame or reframe the political, either by entrenching existing configurations of seeing, sensing and thinking, or by challenging them'. For example, the depiction of African people as starving and impoverished, and the use of tribal imagery reproduced stereotypes of Africa that homogenised the continent as a whole. Similarly, the more prescriptive poster designs confirmed the expectation that propaganda impart clear, unambiguous and easily interpreted messages, and therefore an inequality between artist and audience. Thus, the African series of OSPAAAL posters was not always dissensual. However, this capacity to entrench or disrupt the distribution of the sensible demonstrates that, either way, images are able to 'do things'.

Art, Aesthetics and the Visual in IR

Lastly, the third research question asked, 'what are the (inter)disciplinary implications of this analysis for the study of world politics?' First of all, this analysis demonstrated that art, aesthetics and the visual are important sites of politics. For example, chapter seven explained how styles of art interacted with the geopolitical and ideological dimensions of the Cold War. Throughout this analysis, the emotive nature of the African series of OSPAAAL posters was apparent - showing that aesthetics was an essential part of the posters' oppositional politics. And with regard to the visual, the posters depicted the international politics of the Cold War from the perspective of the Tricontinental Movement. Thus, artistic, aesthetic and visual insights matter in the study of world politics.

However, more importantly, rather than formulating art, aesthetics and the visual as the Other to politics, this analysis demonstrated that they *are* politics. That is, they are not simply subdisciplines that add to existing debates and research within IR. For example, chapter six detailed how the visual depiction of a *dēmos* - the people of Africa, Asia and Latin America, and those in solidarity with them - and its voice challenged how the international community and its actors were imagined. This analysis also showed how the sublime moments occasioned

when viewers of the posters attempted to reconcile what they saw with what they expected to see - an aesthetic experience characterised by discord and confusion - disrupted the sensible of the Cold War. Furthermore, poster artists' creative engagement with the gap between reality and representation worked to question how the sensible was constructed and perceived. As Bleiker (2018, p. 28) observes, 'this is, of course, the very power of art: to make us see the world anew, to make us see a different reality from the one we are used to and the one that is commonly accepted'. Thus, in addition to adding to the body of research identifying new sites of politics, this analysis demonstrated that art, aesthetics and the visual are fundamental to the study of world politics.

Furthermore, this analysis demonstrated that interdisciplinary approaches to research are a promising way of integrating art, aesthetics and the visual in IR. This research drew on visual studies, cultural studies, popular geopolitics, history and art history. By embracing theory, methods and literature from beyond IR, it moved away from fixations on the state system, hard power, anarchy and the national/international binary, making the African series of OSPAAAL posters and its politics of trans-affective solidarity 'sensible'. Thus, by questioning what IR did not 'see' - namely, the OSPAAAL posters and their politics - this research joins others in challenging the sensible of IR and arguing that interdisciplinary approaches enable IR to 'see' other politics and therefore pose new questions.

The African Series of OSPAAAL Posters and Further Research

In conclusion, what does the African series of OSPAAAL posters convey about the role of Africa in the Tricontinental Movement and the capacity of the posters to disrupt the sensible of the Cold War? As discussed, the posters illuminated the role of Africa by depicting how it was conceptualised as part of the Tricontinental imaginary. In sum, Africa was pictured as contributing its history and its people to the movement's global fight against imperialism. The posters also demonstrated the capacity to disrupt and entrench the distribution of the sensible, actively shaping the international politics of the Cold War.

However, it would be undoubtedly valuable to similarly examine the Asian and Latin American series of OSPAAAL posters and explore how these regions were conceptualised as part of the Tricontinental Movement. For example, as noted in chapter four, the war in Vietnam was a

central point of focus at the Tricontinental Conference in 1966. Cushing (2003, p. 15) even comments:

> Editoria Política sent the artist René Mederos to Vietnam, where he spent several months experiencing the American war on the ground. He created two stunning series of paintings, many of which were turned into silk-screen prints and offset posters. The Cuban government also issued seven as postage stamps based on these posters.

Equally, while Africa and Asia contributed a strong anti-colonial sentiment to the movement, Latin America's experiences of imperialism - particularly at the hands of the United States - were distinct. Although it was beyond the scope of this project to analyse the Asian and Latin American series of OSPAAAL posters, they promise to be fertile areas for further research.

In addition, it would be valuable to examine the OSPAAAL posters from a gendered perspective. There were several instances in this analysis that pointed towards gender. For example, as noted in chapter three, despite the Cuban Revolution's efforts to empower women and achieve socialist equality, only eight women designed twenty-two of OSPAAAL's three hundred and twenty-six posters - less than seven percent - raising the subject of female authorship. Chapter four noted that women's liberation movements contributed to the development of the political discourse and ideology of the Tricontinental Movement; Mor (2019, p. 54) similarly comments on 'the centrality of […] women's rights to internationalist revolutionary struggle'. However, at the same time, Tricontinentalism was characterised by fairly misogynistic and disparaging attitudes towards women and male homosexuals, which conflicted with its celebration and positive depiction of women as guerrilla fighters. Lastly, chapter six noted that the posters reflected an attempt to assert a masculine identity in opposition to the feminising discourse of the United States; and that women were depicted as armed revolutionaries and mothers, working to redefine traditional gender roles as part of the subjectivation of the political subject. Hence, further research would benefit from a feminist or gendered approach.

Although the OSPAAAL posters are perhaps the most well-known and certainly the most iconic of OSPAAAL's cultural outputs, they have largely been neglected within academia. This points to a critical gap in the literature on the Cold War. OSPAAAL was the official mouthpiece of the Tricontinental Movement, which played a key role in shaping the international politics of the

Cold War and had a lasting impact on the future trajectories of many Third World countries and present-day social and political movements. Furthermore, despite the import of African liberation struggles, the African diaspora and anti-black racism in the discourse, activities and legacy of the Tricontinental Movement, the role of Africa within the movement had yet to be the subject of any academic research. This research therefore built on the archival work of Lincoln Cushing to call attention to the African series of OSPAAAL posters as a site of politics and address a critical gap in our understanding of the Cold War. By analysing this previously neglected collection of political posters, this research makes a significant original contribution to our knowledge of the political and aesthetic history of the Tricontinental Movement.

References

Acharya, A. (2016) 'Studying the Bandung Conference from a Global IR Perspective', *Australian Journal of International Affairs,* 70(4), pp. 342-357.

Ahmed, S. (2014) *The Cultural Politics of Emotion.* 2nd edn. Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press.

Anderson, B. (2006) *Imagined Communities: Reflections on the Origin and Spread of Nationalism.* 2nd edn. London and New York: Verso.

Appadurai, A. (1990) 'Disjuncture and Difference in the Global Cultural Economy', *Theory, Culture & Society,* 7(2-3), pp. 295-310.

Argyriadis, K., Bonacci, G. and Delmas, A. (2020) 'Reconfiguring the Cuba-Africa Encounter', in Argyriadis, K., Bonacci, G. and Delmas, A. (eds.) *Cuba and Africa, 1959-1994: Writing an Alternative Atlantic History*. Johannesburg: Wits University Press, pp. 1-25.

Arnall, G., Gandolfi, L. and Zaramella, E. (2012) 'Aesthetics and Politics Revisited: An Interview with Jacques Rancière', *Critical Inquiry,* 38(2), pp. 289-297.

Awcock, H. (2021) 'Stickin' it to the man: the geographies of protest stickers', *Area*, 53(3), pp. 522-530.

Bain, M. J. (2007) *Soviet-Cuban Relations 1985 to 1991: Changing Perceptions in Moscow and Havana.* Lanham: Lexington Books.

Banks, M. (2007) *Using Visual Data in Qualitative Research.* London: SAGE.

Bann, S. (2009) 'Meaning/Interpretation', in Preziosi, D. (ed.) *The Art of Art History: A Critical Anthology*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, pp. 256-268.

Barcia, M. (2009) ''Locking Horns with the Northern Empire': Anti-American Imperialism at the Tricontinental Conference of 1966 in Havana', *Journal of Transatlantic Studies,* 7(3), pp. 208-217.

Bargetz, B. (2015) 'The Distribution of Emotions: Affective Politics of Emancipation', *Hypatia,* 30(3), pp. 580-596.

Barnhisel, G. (2015) *Cold War Modernists: Art, Literature, and American Cultural Diplomacy.* New York: Columbia University Press.

Belmonte, L. A. (2013) *Selling the American Way: U.S. Propaganda and the Cold War.* Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press.

Benjamin, W. (2008) *The Work of Art in the Age of Mechanical Reproduction.* London: Penguin Books.

Benwell, M. C., Núñez, A. and Amigo, C. (2021) 'Stitching together the nation's fabric during the Chile uprisings: towards an alter-geopolitics of flags and everyday nationalism', *Geoforum,* 122, pp. 22-31.

Berger, J. (1972) *Ways of Seeing.* London: Penguin Books.

Berk, K. (2015) 'On Political Dissent in Design: Two Guerrilla Poster Actions of Slovene Design Group Novi Kolektivizem', *The Design Journal,* 18(4), pp. 489-511.

Bermúdez, J. (2010) 'Texto de la presentación gráfica de Jorge Bermúdez', in Villaverde, H. (ed.) *Testimonios del Diseño Gráfico Cubano, 1959-1974.* La Habana: Centro Cultural Pablo de la Corriente Brau, pp. 223-232.

Bernays, E. (1928) *Propaganda.* New York: IG Publishing.

Bettie, M. (2015) 'Ambassadors Unaware: the Fullbright Program and American Public Diplomacy', *Journal of Transatlantic Studies,* 13(4), pp. 358-372.

Bénaud, C. L. (2002) 'Latin American and Iberian Posters', *Collection Management,* 27(2), pp. 87-95.

Bleiker, R. (2001) 'The Aesthetic Turn in International Political Theory', *Millennium: Journal of International Studies,* 30(3), pp. 509-533.

Bleiker, R. (2009) *Aesthetics and World Politics.* Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan.

Bleiker, R. (2018) 'Mapping Visual Global Politics', in Bleiker, R. (ed.) *Visual Global Politics*. London: Routledge, pp. 1-29.

Blight, J. G. and Brenner, P. (2002) *Sad and Luminous Days: Cuba's Struggle with the Superpowers after the Missile Crisis.* Oxford: Rowman & Littlefield.

Bloom, J. and Martin, W. E. (2016) *Black Against Empire: The History and Politics of the Black Panther Party.* 2nd edn. Berkeley: University of California Press.

Bock, A., Isermann, H. and Knieper, T. (2012) 'Quantitative Content Analysis of the Visual', in Hughes, J. (ed.) *SAGE Visual Methods*. London: SAGE, pp. 313-333.

Bondeson, J. (2014) *Blood on the Snow: The Killing of Olof Palme.* New York: Cornell University Press.

Bonnell, V. E. (1997) *Iconography of Power: Soviet Political Posters under Lenin and Stalin.* Berkeley: University of California Press.

Borstelmann, T. (2001) *The Cold War and the Color Line: American Race Relations in the Global Arena.* Massachusetts: Harvard University Press.

Bottici, C. (2011) 'From imagination to the imaginary and beyond: towards a theory of imaginal politics', in Bottici, C. and Challand, B. (eds.) *The Politics of Imagination*. Oxon: Birbeck Law Press, pp. 16-37.

Bottici, C. and Challand, B. (2011) 'Introduction', in Bottici, C. and Challand, B. (eds.) *The Politics of Imagination*. Oxon: Birbeck Law Press, pp. 1-15.

Brown, D. H. (2003) *Santería Enthroned: Art, Ritual, and Innovation in an Afro-Cuban Religion.* Chicago: University of Chicago Press.

Brown, J. (2016) *The Road to Soweto: Resistance and the Uprising of 16 June 1976.* Suffolk: Boydell and Brewer.

Brown, J. C. (2017) *Cuba's Revolutionary World*. Massachusetts: Harvard University Press.

Brown, W. K. (2013) 'Imaginary as Social Space: On Appadurai's Disjuncture and Difference', in Elkins, J., McGuire, K., Burns, M., Chester, A. and Kuennen, J. (eds.) *Theorizing Visual Studies: Writing Through the Discipline*. London: Routledge, pp. 134-137.

Burke, J. (2018) 'Melania Trump criticised for wearing colonial-style hat during Kenyan safari', *The Guardian,* available at https://tinyurl.com/yc444sxu [accessed 27.4.22].

Burke, P. (2001) *Eyewitnessing: The Uses of Images as Historical Evidence.* London: Reaktion Books.

Burns, M. (2013) 'Invisibility', in Elkins, J., McGuire, K., Burns, M., Chester, A. and Kuennen, J. (eds.) *Theorizing Visual Studies: Writing Through the Discipline*. London: Routledge, pp. 146-149.

Butler, J. (1988) 'Performative Acts and Gender Constitution: An Essay in Phenomenology and Feminist Theory', *Theatre Journal,* 40(4), pp. 519-531.

Callahan, W. A. (2015) 'The Visual Turn in IR: Documentary Filmmaking as a Critical Method', *Millennium: Journal of International Studies,* 43(3), pp. 891–910.

Callahan, W. A. (2020) *Sensible Politics: Visualizing International Relations.* Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Campbell, D. (2007) 'Geopolitics and Visuality: Sighting the Darfur conflict', *Political Geography,* 26(4), pp. 357-382.

Cant, A. (2012) ''Land for Those Who Work It': A Visual Analysis of Agrarian Reform Posters in Velasco's Peru', *Journal of Latin American Studies,* 44(1), pp. 1-37.

Castoriadis, C. (1987) *The Imaginary Institution of Society.* Cambridge: Polity Press.

Castro, F. (1961) 'Palabras a los Intelectuales', *Castro Speech Database*, Latin American Network Information Center.

Castro, F. (1977) 'Interview to French Weekly Afrique-Asie', *Castro Speech Database*, Latin American Network Information Center.

Castro, F. (2008a) 'May Day: Havana, May 1, 1961', in Deutschmann, D. and Shnookal, D. (eds.) *Fidel Castro Reader*. Melbourne: Ocean Press, pp. 194-211.

Castro, F. (2008b) 'Manifesto for the Liberation of the Americas: "The Second Declaration of Havana"', in Deutschmann, D. and Shnookal, D. (eds.) *Fidel Castro Reader*. Melbourne: Ocean Press, pp. 241-267.

Charlesworth, J. H. (2010) *The Good and Evil Serpent: How a Universal Symbol Became Christianized.* New Haven: Yale University Press.

Chomsky, A., Carr, B. and Smorkaloff, P. M. (2003) (eds.) *The Cuba Reader: History, Culture, Politics*. Durham and London: Duke University Press.

Christiansen, S. and Scarlett, Z. A. (2013a) 'Introduction', in Christiansen, S. and Scarlett, Z. A. (eds.) *The Third World in the Global 1960s*. New York: Berghahn Books, pp. 1-20.

Christiansen, S. and Scarlett, Z. A. (2013b) (eds.) *The Third World in the Global 1960s*. New York: Berghahn Books.

Collier, M. (2001) 'Approaches to Analysis in Visual Anthropology', in Van Leeuwen, T. and Jewitt, C. (eds.) *Handbook of Visual Analysis*. London: SAGE, pp. 35-60.

Connell, R. W. (1998) 'Masculinities and Globalization', *Men and Masculinities,* 1(1), pp. 3-23.

Connell, R. W. (2014) 'Margin becoming centre: for a world-centred rethinking of masculinities', *NORMA,* 9(4), pp. 217-231.

Corcoran, S. (2010) 'Editor's Introduction', in Rancière, J. and Corcoran, S. (eds.) *Dissensus: On Politics and Aesthetics*. London and New York: Bloomsbury, pp. 1-31.

Corrigan, L. M. (2014) 'Visual Rhetoric and Oppositional Consciousness: Poster Art in Cuba and the United States', *Intertexts,* 18(1), pp. 71-91.

Craven, D. (1992) 'The Visual Arts since the Cuban Revolution', *Third Text,* 6(20), pp. 77-102.

Craven, D. (2002) *Art and Revolution in Latin America, 1910-1990.* New Haven: Yale University Press.

Craven, D. (2006) 'Latin American Posters: Public Aesthetics and Mass Politics', in Davidson, R. (ed.) *Latin American Posters*. Santa Fe: Museum of New Mexico Press, pp. 15-18.

Crispin Miller, M. (2005) 'Introduction', in Bernays, E. (ed.) *Propaganda*. New York: IG Publishing, pp. 9-33.

Crowley, D. (2008) *Posters of the Cold War.* London: V&A Publishing.

Curley, J. J. (2013) *A Conspiracy of Images: Andy Warhol, Gerhard Richter, and the Art of the Cold War.* New Haven: Yale University Press.

Curley, J. J. (2018) *Global Art and the Cold War.* London: Laurence King Publishing.

Cushing, L. (2003) *¡Revolución! Cuban Poster Art.* San Francisco: Chronicle Books.

D'Alleva, A. (2012) *Methods & Theories of Art History.* 2nd edn. London: Laurence King Publishing.

Dabbous, Y., Nasser, K. and Dabbous, F. (2010) 'Across the Bridge of Death: The Culture of Martyrdom in Lebanon 1960s–1980s', *International Journal of Cultural Studies,* 13(6), pp. 593–615.

Davidson, B. (2007) 'Introduction to the First Edition', in Vambe, M. T. and Zegeye, A. (eds.) *Unity and Struggle: Selected Speeches and Writings.* 2nd edn. Pretoria: Unisa Press, pp. 13-21.

Davidson, R. (2006) ‘Images of Protest in Latin America: The Sam L. Slick Collection’, in Davidson, R. (ed.) *Latin American Posters*. Santa Fe: Museum of New Mexico Press, pp. 11-14.

Davidson, R., Craven, D., Eckmann, T., Romo, T. and Stavans, I. (2006) *Latin American Posters: Public Aesthetics and Mass Politics.* Santa Fe: Museum of New Mexico Press.

Davis, O. (2010) *Jacques Rancière.* Cambridge: Polity Press.

De la Fuente, A. (1998) ‘Race, National Discourse, and Politics in Cuba: An Overview’, *Latin American Perspectives,* 25(3), pp. 43-69.

De la Fuente, A. (2001) *A Nation for All: Race, Inequality, and Politics in Twentieth-Century Cuba.* Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press.

Deranty, J. P. (2010a) ‘Introduction: a journey in equality’, in Deranty, J. P. (ed.) *Jacques Rancière: Key Concepts*. Durham: Acumen, pp. 1-14.

Deranty, J. P. (2010b) ‘Regimes of the arts’, in Deranty, J. P. (ed.) *Jacques Rancière: Key Concepts*. Durham: Acumen, pp. 116-130.

Dikeç, M. (2015) *Space, Politics and Aesthetics.* Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press.

Dinkel, J. (2019) *The Non-Aligned Movement: Genesis, Organization and Politics (1927-1992).* Boston: Brill.

DiPiero, D. (2020) *Rancière and Affect*. Available at https://tinyurl.com/24t9pc86 [accessed 4.5.21].

Dirlik, A. (2013) ‘The Third World in 1968’, in Christiansen, S. and Scarlett, Z. A. (eds.) *The Third World in the Global 1960s*. New York: Berghahn Books, pp. vii - ix.

Dittmer, J. and Bos, D. (2019) *Popular Culture, Geopolitics, and Identity.* 2nd edn. Oxford: Rowman & Littlefield.

Docs Populi (2022) *OSPAAAL Poster Archive*. Available at https://www.docspopuli.org/CubaWebCat/gallery-01.html.

Domínguez, J. I. (1989) *To Make a World Safe for Revolution: Cuba’s Foreign Policy.* Massachusetts: Harvard University Press.

Dorfman, A. and Mattelart, A. (1984) *How to Read Donald Duck: Imperialist Ideology in the Disney Comic.* 2nd edn. New York: IG Publishing.

Durant, S. (2013) *Black Panther: The Revolutionary Art of Emory Douglas.* New York: Rizzoli.

Dymarczyk, W. (2014) 'The War on the Wall: Polish and Soviet War Posters Analysis', *Qualitative Sociology Review,* 10(4), pp. 6-31.

Eckmann, T. (2006) 'The Latin American Poster: Image, Message, and Means', in Davidson, R. (ed.) *Latin American Posters*. Santa Fe: Museum of New Mexico Press, pp. 35-49.

Elbaum, M. (2018) *Revolution in the Air: Sixties Radicals Turn to Lenin, Mao and Che.* London and New York: Verso.

Elden, S. (2003) 'Another Sense of *Demos*: Kleisthenes and the Greek Division of the *Polis*', *Democratization,* 10(1), pp. 135-156.

Elliott, A. (2012) 'New Individualist Configurations and the Social Imaginary: Castoriadis and Kristeva', *European Journal of Social Theory,* 15(3), pp. 349-365.

Erisman, H. M. (2008) 'Cuba's Counter-Hegemonic Strategy', in Brenner, P., Jiménez, M. R., Kirk, J. M. and LeoGrande, W. M. (eds.) *A Contemporary Cuba Reader*. Oxford: Rowman & Littlefield, pp. 212-216.

Eslava, L., Fakhri, M. and Nesiah, V. (2017) (eds.) *Bandung, Global History, and International Law: Critical Pasts and Pending Futures*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Evans, J. (1999) 'Cultures of the Visual: Introduction', in Evans, J. and Hall, S. (eds.) *Visual Culture: The Reader*. London: SAGE, pp. 9-20.

Ferrer, A. (1999) *Insurgent Cuba: Race, Nation, and Revolution, 1868-1898.* Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press.

Ferrer, A. (2014) *Freedom's Mirror: Cuba and Haiti in the Age of Revolution.* Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Field, T. C. J., Krepp, S. and Pettinà, V. (2020) 'Between Nationalism and Internationalism: Latin America and the Third World', in Field, T. C. J., Krepp, S. and Pettinà, V. (eds.) *Latin America and the Global Cold War*. Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, pp. 1-14.

Fink, C., Gassert, P. and Junker, D. (1998) (eds.) *1968: The World Transformed*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Galenson, D. W. (2009) *Conceptual Revolutions in Twentieth-Century Art.* Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Garland Mahler, A. (2018) *From the Tricontinental to the Global South: Race, Radicalism, and Transnational Solidarity.* Durham and London: Duke University Press.

Gaule, S. (2017) 'Ernest Cole: the perspective of time', *Safundi: The Journal of South African and American Studies,* 18(4), pp. 380-399.

Genter, R. (2011) *Late Modernism: Art, Culture, and Politics in Cold War America.* Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press.

George, E. (2005) *The Cuban Intervention in Angola, 1965-1991: From Che Guevara to Cuito Cuanavale.* London and New York: Frank Cass.

Gerard, E. and Kuklick, B. (2015) *Death in the Congo: Murdering Patrice Lumumba.* Massachusetts: Harvard University Press.

Getchell, M. (2020) 'Cuba, the USSR, and the Non-Aligned Movement: Negotiating Non-Alignment', in Field, T. C. J., Krepp, S. and Pettinà, V. (eds.) *Latin America and the Global Cold War*. Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, pp. 148-173.

Gettig, E. (2020) 'Cuba, the United States, and the Uses of the Third World Project, 1959-1967', in Field, T. C. J., Krepp, S. and Pettinà, V. (eds.) *Latin America and the Global Cold War*. Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, pp. 241-273.

Gleijeses, P. (2002) *Conflicting Missions: Havana, Washington, and Africa, 1959-1976.* Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press.

Gleijeses, P. (2006) 'Moscow's Proxy? Cuba and Africa 1975–1988', *Journal of Cold War Studies,* 8(2), pp. 3-51.

Gleijeses, P. (2013) *Visions of Freedom: Havana, Washington, Pretoria, and the Struggle for Southern Africa, 1976-1991.* Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press.

Glick, E. B. (1964) 'Cuba and the Fifteenth UN General Assembly: A Case Study in Regional Disassociation', *Journal of Inter-American Studies,* 6(2), pp. 235-248.

Goff, S. (2016) 'Art, image, and ideology: the history of Soviet relations with Africa told in pictures', *The Calvert Journal,* available at https://tinyurl.com/3hawa3mr [accessed 1.9.22].

Goldman, K. S. (2013) 'Saludos Amigos and The Three Caballeros: The Representation of Latin America in Disney's "Good Neighbour" Films', in Cheu, J. (ed.) *Diversity in Disney Films: Critical Essays on Race, Ethnicity, Gender, Sexuality and Disability*. Jefferson: McFarland & Company, pp. 23-37.

Goldman, S. M. (1994) *Dimensions of the Americas: Art and Social Change in Latin America and the United States.* Chicago: University of Chicago Press.

Gordon-Nesbitt, R. (2015) *To Defend the Revolution Is to Defend Culture: The Cultural Policy of the Cuban Revolution.* Oakland: PM Press.

Gott, R. (2004) *Cuba: A New History.* New Haven: Yale University Press.

Grayson, K. and Mawdsley, J. (2019) 'Scopic regimes and the visual turn in International Relations: Seeing world politics through the drone', *European Journal of International Relations,* 25(2), pp. 431-457.

Grittmann, E. (2014) 'Between Risk, Beauty and the Sublime: The Visualization of Climate Change in Media Coverage during COP 15 in Copenhagen 2009', in Schneider, B. and Nocke, T. (eds.) *Image Politics of Climate Change: Visualizations, Imaginations, Documentations*. Bielefeld: Transcript Verlag, pp. 127-152.

Gronbeck-Tedesco, J. A. (2008) 'The Left in Transition: The Cuban Revolution in US Third World Politics', *Journal of Latin American Studies,* 40(4), pp. 651-673.

Gronbeck-Tedesco, J. A. (2015) *Cuba, the United States, and the Cultures of the Transnational Left, 1933-1970.* Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Guevara, E. (2003a) 'Man and Socialism', in Chomsky, A., Carr, B. and Smorkaloff, P. M. (eds.) *The Cuba Reader: History, Culture, Politics*. Durham and London: Duke University Press, pp. 370-374.

Guevara, E. (1967) *Message to the Tricontinental*. Havana: Executive Secretariat of OSPAAAL. Available at https://tinyurl.com/4nhsfax6 [accessed 1.9.22].

Guevara, E. (1968) *Venceremos! The speeches and writings of Ernesto Che Guevara.* London: Panther Books.

Guevara, E. (2003b) 'Socialism and man in Cuba', in Deutschmann, D. (ed) *Che Guevara Reader.* 2nd edn. Melbourne: Ocean Press, pp. 212-228.

Hales, P. B. (1991) 'The Atomic Sublime', *American Studies,* 32(1), pp. 5-31.

Hall, S. (1997) *Representation: Cultural Representations and Signifying Practices.* London: SAGE.

Halliday, F. (1999) *Revolution and World Politics: The Rise and Fall of the Sixth Great Power.* Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan.

Hammond, A. (2017) *Cold War Stories.* Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan.

Hanna, L. (2020) 'Tricontinental's International Solidarity: Emotion in OSPAAAL as Tactic to Catalyze Support of Revolution', *Radical History Review,* 136, pp. 169-184.

Hansen, L. (2011) 'Theorizing the Image for Security Studies: Visual Securitization and the Muhammad Cartoon Crisis', *European Journal of International Relations,* 17(1), pp. 51-74.

Hansen, L. (2015) 'How Images Make World Politics: International Icons and the Case of Abu Ghraib', *Review of international studies,* 41(2), pp. 263-288.

Harman, S. (2019) *Seeing Politics: Film, Visual Method, and International Relations.* Montreal: McGill-Queen's University Press.

Hatzky, C. (2012) *Cubans in Angola: South-South Cooperation and Transfer of Knowledge, 1976–1991.* Wisconsin: University of Wisconsin Press.

Heffernan, A. and Nieftagodien, N. (2016) *Students Must Rise: Youth Struggle in South Africa Before and Beyond Soweto '76.* Johannesburg: Wits University Press.

Heller, S. (2008) *Iron Fists: Branding the 20th-Century Totalitarian State.* London and New York: Phaidon Press.

Hinderliter, B., Kaizen, W., Maimon, V., Mansoor, J. and McCormick, S. (2009) *Communities of Sense: Rethinking Aesthetics and Politics.* Durham and London: Duke University Press.

Horkheimer, M. (1982) *Critical Theory: Selected Essays.* New York: Continuum.

Howells, R. and Negreiros, J. (2019) *Visual Culture.* 3rd edn. Cambridge: Polity Press.

Huish, R. and Kirk, J. M. (2007) 'Cuban Medical Internationalism and the Development of the Latin American School of Medicine', *Latin American Perspectives*, 34(6), pp. 77-92.

Hutchison, E. (2016) *Affective Communities in World Politics: Collective Emotions after Trauma.* Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Hutchison, E. (2018) 'Affective Communities and World Politics', *E-International Relations*, available at https://tinyurl.com/d8fzbc29 [accessed 26.1.21].

Hutchison, E. and Bleiker, R. (2014) 'Theorizing Emotions in World Politics', *International Theory,* 6(3), pp. 491-514.

Ingram, A. (2016) 'Rethinking Art and Geopolitics through Aesthetics: Artist Responses to the Iraq War', *Transactions of the Institute of British Geographers,* 41(1), pp. 1-13.

Ingram, A. (2019) *Geopolitics and the Event: Rethinking Britain's Iraq War Through Art.* Newark: John Wiley & Sons.

James, P. (2009) *Picture This: World War I Posters and Visual Culture.* Lincoln and London: University of Nebraska Press.

Jay, M. (2002) 'That Visual Turn', *Journal of Visual Culture,* 1(1), pp. 87-92.

Jones, W. J. (2014) 'Political Semiotics of National Campaign Posters and Pictorial Representation: Thailand's 2011 General Elections', *Semiotica,* (199), pp. 269-296.

Jowett, G. S. and O'Donnell, V. (2018) *Propaganda & Persuasion.* 7th edn. London: SAGE.

Kant, I. (2007) *Critique of Judgement.* Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Kapcia, A. (2000) *Cuba: Island of Dreams.* Oxford: Berg Publishers.

Kapcia, A. (2008) *Cuba in Revolution: A History since the Fifties.* London: Reaktion Books.

Kennedy, J. F. (1962) 'Address during the Cuban Missile Crisis', *JFK Library*, available at https://tinyurl.com/ye248hz9 [accessed 1.9.22].

Kinder, J. M. (2009) 'Iconography of Injury: Encountering the Wounded Soldier's Body in American Poster Art and Photography of World War I', in James, P. (ed.) *Picture This: World War I Posters and Visual Culture*. Lincoln and London: University of Nebraska Press, pp. 340-368.

Kirk, J. M. (1983) *José Martí: Mentor of the Cuban Nation.* Gainesville: University Press of Florida.

Kirk, J. M. (2006) 'Defying the Odds: Five Conclusions about Cuban Foreign Policy', in Erisman, H. M. and Kirk, J. M. (eds.) *Redefining Cuban Foreign Policy: The Impact of the "Special Period"*. Gainesville: University Press of Florida, pp. 333-344.

Knight, F. W. (1970) *Slave Society in Cuba During the Nineteenth Century.* Madison: University of Wisconsin Press.

Krull, C. (2014) 'Introduction: Cuba in a Global Context', in Krull, C. (ed.) *Cuba in a Global Context: International Relations, Internationalism, and Transnationalism*. Gainesville: University Press of Florida, pp. 1-24.

Kuhn, K. J. (2013) 'Liberation Struggle and Humanitarian Aid', in Christiansen, S. and Scarlett, Z. A. (eds.) *The Third Word in the Global 1960s*. New York: Berghahn Books, pp. 69-85.

Kumaraswami, P. (2009) 'Cultural Policy and Cultural Politics in Revolutionary Cuba: Re-reading the Palabras a los Intelectuales (Words to the Intellectuals)', *Bulletin of Latin American Research,* 28(4), pp. 527-541.

Kunzle, D. (1975) 'Public Graphics in Cuba: A Very Cuban Form of Internationalist Art', *Latin American Perspectives,* 2(7), pp. 89-110.

Lambe, A. M. (2019) *No Barrier Can Contain It: Cuban Antifascism and the Spanish Civil War.* Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press.

Laurie, C. D. (1996) *The Propaganda Warriors: America's Crusade Against Nazi Germany.* Kansas: University Press of Kansas.

Le Billon, P. (2001) 'Angola's Political Economy of War: The Role of Oil and Diamonds, 1975–2000', *African Affairs,* 100(398), pp. 55-80.

Lee, B. and Campbell, V. (2016) 'Looking Out or Turning in? Organizational Ramifications of Online Political Posters on Facebook', *The International Journal of Press/Politics,* 21(3), pp. 313-337.

Lee, C. J. (2019) *Making a World After Empire: The Bandung Moment and its Political Afterlives.* 2nd edn. Ohio: Ohio University Press.

Lockwood, L. (1970) *Conversations with Eldridge Cleaver.* London: Jonathan Cape.

Lopes, C. (2007) 'Foreword', in Vambe, M. T. and Zegeye, A. (eds.) *Unity and Struggle: Selected Speeches and Writings.* 2nd ed. Pretoria: Unisa Press, pp. ix-x.

Loughridge, R. (1945) 'Jose Marti's "My Race": A Translation', *Phylon,* 6(2), pp. 126-128.

Luis, W. (2001) *Culture and Customs of Cuba.* Westport: Greenwood Press.

Luke, A. (2018) *Youth and the Cuban Revolution.* Lanham: Lexington Books.

Lusane, C. (1999) 'From Black Cuban to Afro-Cuban: Researching Race in Cuba', *Souls,* 1(2), pp. 73-79.

Maasri, Z. (2009) *Off the Wall: Political Posters of the Lebanese Civil War.* London and New York: I.B. Tauris.

Maasri, Z. (2012) 'The Aesthetics of Belonging: Transformations in Hizbullah's Political Posters (1985-2006)', *Middle East Journal of Culture and Communication,* 5(2), pp. 149-189.

Mahmod, J. (2016) *Kurdish Diaspora Online: From Imagined Community to Managing Communities.* Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan.

Malloy, S. L. (2017) *Out of Oakland: Black Panther Party Internationalism during the Cold War.* New York: Cornell University Press.

Mandaville, P. G. (2001) *Transnational Muslim Politics: Reimagining the Umma.* London: Routledge.

Mannay, D. (2016) *Visual, Narrative and Creative Research Methods: Application, reflection and ethics.* London: Routledge.

Manzo, K. (2010) 'Imaging Vulnerability: The Iconography of Climate Change', *Area,* 42(1), pp. 96-107.

Marchesi, A. (2017) *Latin America's Radical Left: Rebellion and Cold War in the Global 1960s.* Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Marquart, F., Matthes, J. and Rapp, E. (2016) 'Selective Exposure in the Context of Political Advertising: A Behavioral Approach Using Eye-Tracking Methodology', *International Journal of Communication,* 10, pp. 2576-2595.

Martí, J. (1999) *José Martí Reader: Writings on the Americas.* Melbourne: Ocean Press.

Matthes, J., Marquart, F., Arendt, F. and Wonneberger, A. (2016) 'The Selective Avoidance of Threat Appeals in Right-Wing Populist Political Ads: An Implicit Cognition Approach Using Eye-Tracking Methodology', in Verlegh, P., Voorveld, H. and Eisend, M. (eds.) *Advances in Advertising Research (Vol. VI): The Digital, the Classic, the Subtle, and the Alternative*. Wiesbaden: Springer Gabler, pp. 135-145.

McEwen, A. (2016) *Revolutionary Horizons: Art and Polemics in 1950s Cuba.* New Haven: Yale University Press.

McSherry, J. P. (2005) *Predatory States: Operation Condor and Covert War in Latin America.* Oxford: Rowman & Littlefield.

Meyer, L. (1992) *Black Africa: Masks, Sculpture, Jewelry.* Paris: Terrail.

Miller, N. (2008) 'A Revolutionary Modernity: The Cultural Policy of the Cuban Revolution', *Journal of Latin American Studies,* 40(4), pp. 675-696.

Miner, D. A. T. (2011) 'Hasta la Victoria (Deportista) Siempre: Revolution, Art, and the Representation of Sport in Cuban Visual Culture', *International Journal of the History of Sport,* 28(8-9), pp. 1283-1300.

Mitchell, W. J. T. (1986) *Iconology: Image, Text, Ideology.* Chicago: University of Chicago Press.

Mitchell, W. J. T. (1994) *Picture Theory: Essays on Verbal and Visual Representation.* Chicago: University of Chicago Press.

Mitchell, W. J. T. (2006) *What Do Pictures Want?: The Lives and Loves of Images.* Chicago: University of Chicago Press.

Mizsei-Ward, R. (2012) 'Politics, Race, and Political Fly-Billing: Barack Obama as 'The Joker'', *Comparative American Studies,* 10(2-3), pp. 177-187.

Mišković, N. (2014) 'Introduction', in Mišković, N., Fischer-Tiné, H. and Boškovska, N. (eds.) *The Non-Aligned Movement and the Cold War: Delhi - Bandung - Belgrade*. London: Routledge, pp. 1-18.

Mlambo, A. S. (2014) *A History of Zimbabwe.* Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Moore, C. (1988) *Castro, the Blacks, and Africa. Afro-American Culture and Society,* Los Angeles: Center for Afro-American Studies, University of California.

Moore, C. (2010) *Propaganda Prints: A History of Art in the Service of Social and Political Change.* London: A&C Black.

Mor, J. S. (2019) 'Rendering Armed Struggle: OSPAAAL, Cuban Poster Art, and South-South Solidarity at the United Nations', *Jahrbuch für Geschichte Lateinamerikas,* 56, pp. 42-65.

Morrison, K. Y. (2015) *Cuba's Racial Crucible: The Sexual Economy of Social Identities, 1750-2000.* Indiana: Indiana University Press.

Muhammad-Bande, T. (2019) 'Statement by H.E. Tijjani Muhammad Bande, President of the 74th Session of the United Nations General Assembly', *Non-Aligned Movement Summit*,

Azerbaijan: General Assembly of the United Nations, available at https://tinyurl.com/vb6vxacn [accessed 1.5.2019].

Müller, M. G. and Özcan, E. (2007) 'The Political Iconography of Muhammad Cartoons: Understanding Cultural Conflict and Political Action', *Political Science & Politics,* 40(2), pp. 287-291.

Mälksoo, M. (2022) 'The Postcolonial Moment in Russia's War Against Ukraine', *Journal of Genocide Research*, pp. 1-11.

Müller, M. G. (2011) 'Iconography and Iconology as a Visual Method and Approach', in Margolis, E. and Pauwels, L. (eds.) *The SAGE Handbook of Visual Research Methods*. London: SAGE, pp. 283-297.

Müller, M. G. and Özcan, E. (2007) 'The Political Iconography of Muhammad Cartoons: Understanding Cultural Conflict and Political Action', *PS: Political Science & Politics,* 40(2), pp. 287-291.

Nerlich, B. and Morris, C. (2015) 'Imagining Imaginaries', *Making Science Public*, available at https://tinyurl.com/mwf4rdjn [accessed 25.1.21].

Nye, J. S. (2004) *Soft Power: The Means to Success in World Politics.* New York: PublicAffairs.

Nöth, W. (2011) 'Visual Semiotics: Key Features and an Application to Picture Ads', in Margolis, E. and Pauwels, L. (eds.) *The SAGE Handbook of Visual Research Methods*. London: SAGE, pp. 298-316.

Olin, M. (2003) 'Gaze', in Nelson, R. S. and Shiff, R. (eds.) *Critical Terms for Art History.* 2nd ed. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, pp. 318-329.

OED Online (2021) 'politics, n.', *Oxford English Dictionary*, available at https://www.oed.com [accessed 28.2.21].

Opondo, S. O. and Shapiro, M. J. (2012) *The New Violent Cartography: Geo-analysis after the Aesthetic Turn.* London: Routledge.

Ortega y Gasset, J. (2019) *The Dehumanization of Art and Other Essays on Art, Culture, and Literature.* Princeton: Princeton University Press.

Orwell, G. (2009) *Politics and the English Language, and Other Essays.* Oxford: Oxford City Press.

Ott, E. (2017) 'Sweat with Ernest Cole', *Pixelle.co*, available at https://www.pixelle.co/ernest-cole/ [accessed 6.8.21].

Panofsky, E. (1939) *Studies in Iconology: Humanistic Themes in the Art of the Renaissance.* Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Panofsky, E. (2009) 'Iconography and Iconology: An Introduction to the Study of Renaissance Art', in Preziosi, D. (ed.) *The Art of Art History: A Critical Anthology.* 2nd ed. Oxford: Oxford University Press, pp. 220-235.

Pells, R. (2011) *Modernist America: Art, Music, Movies, and the Globalization of American Culture.* New Haven: Yale University Press.

Pereira, C. and Tsikata, D. (2021) 'Contextualising Extractivism in Africa', *Feminist Africa,* 2(1), pp. 14-48.

Peters, C. (2012) *Cuban Identity and the Angolan Experience.* Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan.

Pérez, L. A. (2003) *Cuba and the United States: Ties of Singular Intimacy.* 3rd edn. Athens: University of Georgia Press.

Philipps, A. (2015) 'Defacing Election Posters: A Form of Political Culture Jamming?', *Popular Communication,* 13(3), pp. 183-201.

Pink, S. (2001) *Doing Visual Ethnography: Images, Media and Representation in Research.* London: SAGE.

Plummer, B. G. (2013) 'Race and the Cold War', in Immerman, R. H. and Goedde, P. (eds.) *The Oxford Handbook of the Cold War*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, pp. 503-522.

Polack, P. (2013) *The Last Hot Battle of the Cold War: South Africa vs Cuba in the Angolan Civil War.* Philadelphia: Casemate Publishers.

Power, M. (2001) 'Patrimonialism and Petro-Diamond Capitalism: Peace, Geopolitics and the Economics of War in Angola', *Review of African Political Economy,* 28(90), pp. 489-502.

Prashad, V. (2008) *The Darker Nations: A People's History of the Third World.* New York: New Press.

Preziosi, D. (2009) 'Mechanisms of Meaning', in Preziosi, D. (ed.) *The Art of Art History: A Critical Anthology.* 2nd ed. Oxford: Oxford University Press, pp. 215-219.

Pérez, L. A. (2006) *Cuba: Between Reform and Revolution.* 3rd edn. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Pérez Sarduy, P. and Stubbs, J. (2000) *Afro-Cuban Voices: On Race and Identity in Contemporary Cuba.* Gainesville: University Press of Florida.

Ramos, M. (2013) 'Rancière's Politics of the Image', in Elkins, J., McGuire, K., Burns, M., Chester, A. and Kuennen, J. (eds.) *Theorizing Visual Studies: Writing Through the Discipline*. London: Routledge, pp. 218-220.

Rancière, J. (1991) *The Ignorant Schoolmaster: Five Lessons in Intellectual Emancipation.* Stanford: Stanford University Press.

Rancière, J. (1992) 'Politics, Identification, and Subjectivization', *October,* 61, pp. 58-64.

Rancière, J. (1999) *Disagreement: Politics and Philosophy.* Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press.

Rancière, J. (2004) *The Politics of Aesthetics: The Distribution of the Sensible.* London: Bloomsbury.

Rancière, J. (2009a) 'Contemporary Art and the Politics of Aesthetics', in Hinderliter, B., Kaizen, W., Maimon, V., Mansoor, J. and McCormick, S. (eds.) *Communities of Sense: Rethinking Aesthetics and Politics*. Durham and London: Duke University Press, pp. 31-50.

Rancière, J. (2009b) *The Emancipated Spectator.* London and New York: Verso.

Rancière, J. (2010) *Dissensus: On Politics and Aesthetics.* London: Bloomsbury.

Rancière, J. (2011) *Althusser's Lesson.* New York: Continuum.

Randall, M. (2017) *Exporting Revolution: Cuba's Global Solidarity.* Durham and London: Duke University Press.

Ranta, M. (2017) 'Master Narratives and the Pictorial Construction of Otherness: Anti-Semitic Images in the Third Reich and Beyond', *Contemporary Aesthetics,* 15.

Ray, C. (2020) 'Everything Has a History: The Pith Helmet', *Perspectives on History*, available at https://tinyurl.com/4ek2h68y [accessed 27.4.22].

Rockhill, G. (2004a) 'Appendix i', in Rancière, J. and Rockhill, G. (eds.) *The Politics of Aesthetics: The Distribution of the Sensible*. New York: Continuum, pp. 80-93.

Rockhill, G. (2004b) 'Translator's Introduction: Jacques Rancière's Politics of Perception', in Rancière, J. and Rockhill, G. (eds.) *The Politics of Aesthetics: The Distribution of the Sensible*. New York: Continuum, pp. 1-6.

Rodriguez, B. (2005) '"De la Esclavitud Yanqui a la Libertad Cubana": U.S. Black Radicals, the Cuban Revolution, and the Formation of a Tricontinental Ideology', *Radical History Review,* (92), pp. 62-87.

Rodriguez, B. (2006) '"Long Live Third World Unity! Long Live Internationalism": Huey P. Newton's Revolutionary Intercommunalism', *Souls,* 8(3), pp. 119-141.

Romo, T. (2006) '*¡Presente!* Chicano Posters and Latin American Politics', in Davidson, R. (ed.) *Latin American Posters: Public Aesthetics and Mass Politics*. Santa Fe: Museum of New Mexico Press, pp. 51-63.

Rorabaugh, W. J. (2015) *American Hippies*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Rose, G. (2016) *Visual Methodologies: An Introduction to Researching with Visual Materials.* 4th edn. London: SAGE.

Ross, K. (1991) 'Translator's Introduction', in Rancière, J. and Ross, K. (eds.) *The Ignorant Schoolmaster: Five Lessons in Intellectual Emancipation.* Stanford: Stanford University Press, pp. vii-xxiii.

Rovine, V. L. (2019) 'African Visual Cultures and Colonial Histories: An Expanding Field', *African Arts,* 52(4), pp. 12-17.

Sajed, A. (2020) 'From the Third World to the Global South', *E-International Relations*, available at https://tinyurl.com/8dv9uhk5 [accessed 5.8.20].

Saney, I. (2006) 'African Stalingrad: The Cuban Revolution, Internationalism, and the End of Apartheid', *Latin American Perspectives,* 33(5), pp. 81-117.

Sartwell, C. (2010) *Political Aesthetics.* New York: Cornell University Press.

Sawyer, M. Q. (2006) *Racial Politics in Post-Revolutionary Cuba.* Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Schembs, K. (2013) 'Education through Images: Peronist Visual Propaganda between Innovation and Tradition (Argentina 1946-1955)', *Paedagogica Historica,* 49(1), pp. 90-110.

Schlesinger, A. M. (1965) *A Thousand Days: John F. Kennedy in the White House.* New York: Houghton Mifflin Company.

Scholz, S. J. (2021) *Political Solidarity.* Pennsylvania: Pennsylvania State University Press.

Segal, J. (2016) *Art and Politics: Between Purity and Propaganda.* Amsterdam: Amsterdam University Press.

Seidman, S. (2012) 'Tricontinental Routes of Solidarity: Stokely Carmichael in Cuba', *Journal of Transnational American Studies,* 4(2), pp. 1-25.

Shapiro, M. J. (2018) *The Political Sublime.* Durham and London: Duke University Press.

Shinkle, E. (2012) 'Videogames and the Digital Sublime', in Karatzogianni, A. and Kuntsman, A. (eds.) *Digital Cultures and the Politics of Emotion: Feelings, Affect and Technological Change*. Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan, pp. 94-108.

Sontag, S. (1999) 'Posters: Advertisement, Art, Political Artifact, Commodity', in Bierut, M., Helfand, J., Heller, S. and Poynor, R. (eds.) *Looking Closer 3: Classic Writings on Graphic Design*. New York: Allworth Press, pp. 196-218.

Spencer, S. (2011) *Visual Research Methods in the Social Sciences: Awakening visions*. London: Routledge.

Stanczak, G. C. (2007) *Visual Research Methods: Image, Society, and Representation.* London: SAGE.

Stanley, J. (2015) *How Propaganda Works.* Princeton: Princeton University Press.

Sturken, M. and Cartwright, L. (2001) *Practices of Looking: An Introduction to Visual Culture.* Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Taffet, J. F. (2007) *Foreign Aid as Foreign Policy: The Alliance for Progress in Latin America.* London: Routledge.

Tanke, J. (2011) *Jacques Rancière: An Introduction. Philosophy, Politics, Aesthetics.* New York: Continuum.

TATE (2020a) 'Abstract Art', *TATE*, available at https://www.tate.org.uk/art/art-terms/abstract-art [accessed 29.1.20].

TATE (2020b) 'Modernism', *TATE*, available at https://www.tate.org.uk/art/art-terms/m/modernism [accessed 23.3.20].

TATE (2021). ‘Ernest Cole: Artist and Society’, *TATE*, available at https://www.tate.org.uk/vWoSt/tate-modern/display/artist-and-society/ernest-cole [accessed 6.8.21].

Taylor, F. F. (1988) 'Revolution, Race, and Some Aspects of Foreign Relations in Cuba Since 1959', in Mesa-Lago, C. (ed.) *Cuban Studies 18: Vol. 18 Cuban Studies*. Pittsburgh: University of Pittsburgh Press, pp. 19-41.

Taylor, P. M. (1997) *Global Communications, International Affairs and the Media since 1945.* London: Routledge.

Taylor, P. M. (2003) *Munitions of the Mind: A History of Propaganda from the Ancient World to the Present Day.* 3rd edn. Manchester: Manchester University Press.

Thomas, H. (1971) *Cuba; or, Pursuit of Freedom.* London: Eyre & Spottiswoode.

Tickner, J. A. (1992) *Gender in International Relations: Feminist Perspectives on Achieving Global Security.* New York: Columbia University Press.

Tschabrun, S. (2003) 'Off the Wall and into a Drawer: Managing a Research Collection of Political Posters', *The American Archivist,* 66, pp. 303–324.

Tyler, M. (2017) ‘A Collector's Eye: OSPAAAL posters’, *National Museums Liverpool*, available at https://tinyurl.com/4tv9a8nz [accessed 5.4.22].

V&A (2022) ‘VOTER c'est mourir un peu’, *V&A*, available at https://tinyurl.com/2p8ae2f7 [accessed 14.6.22].

Van Leeuwen, T. (2001) 'Semiotics and Iconography', in Van Leeuwen, T. and Jewitt, C. (eds.) *The Handbook of Visual Analysis*. London: SAGE, pp. 92-118.

Van Munster, R. (2009) 'Jacques Rancière', in Edkins, J. and Vaughan-Williams, N. (eds.) *Critical Theorists and International Relations*. London: Routledge, pp. 266-277.

Van Veeren, E. (2018) 'Invisibility', in Bleiker, R. (ed.) *Visual Global Politics*. London: Routledge, pp. 196-200.

Vliegenthart, R. (2012) 'The Professionalization of Political Communication? A Longitudinal Analysis of Dutch Election Campaign Posters', *American Behavioral Scientist,* 56(2), pp. 135-150.

Vogt, J. (1975) 'Old Images in Soviet Anti-Zionist Cartoons', *Soviet Jewish Affairs,* 5(1), pp. 20-38.

Wa Ngugi, M. (2012) 'Rethinking the Global South', *The Journal of Contemporary Thought*, (Summer), reprinted in globalsouthproject.cornell.edu.

Wade, P. (2010) *Race and Ethnicity in Latin* America. 2nd edn. London and New York: Pluto Press.

Walker, R. B. J. (1993) *Inside/Outside: International Relations as Political Theory.* Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Weber, C. (1999) *Faking It: U.S. Hegemony in a "Post-Phallic" Era.* Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press.

Wells, C., Kunzle, D. and Dung, N. N. (1996) *Decade of Protest: Political Posters from the United States, Vietnam, and Cuba, 1965-1975.* New York: Smart Art Press.

Whalen, K. (2013) 'Defacing Kabul: An Iconography of Political Campaign Posters', *Cultural Geographies,* 20(4), pp. 541-549.

White, P. (2012) *Churchill's Cold War: The Iron Curtain Speech that Shaped the Postwar World.* London: Duckworth Overlook.

Yanker, G. (1970) 'The Political Poster: A Worldwide Phenomenon', *World Affairs,* 133(3), pp. 215-233.

Young, C. A. (2006) *Soul Power: Culture, Radicalism, and the Making of a U.S. Third World Left.* Durham and London: Duke University Press.

Young, R. (2016) *Make Art Not War: Political Protest Posters from the Twentieth Century.* New York: New York University Press.

Young, R. J. C. (2005) 'Postcolonialism: From Bandung to the Tricontinental', *Historein,* 5, pp. 11-21.

Young, R. J. C. (2018) 'Diseminating the Tricontinental', in Jian, C., Klimke, M., Kirasirova, M., Nolan, M., Young, M. and Waley-Cohen, J. (eds.) *The Routledge Handbook of the Global Sixties: Between Protest and Nation-Building*. London: Routledge, pp. 517-547.

Zeilig, L. (2015) *Lumumba: Africa's Lost Leader.* London: Haus Publishing.